TOWARDS AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF SPIES AND INTELLIGENCE AGENCIES

FELIX PADEL1

The place of spies in the structure of power

In many ways, intelligence agencies are at the apex of the modern power structure of every nation state, and how they work has major impacts on many aspects of modern life. The history and methods of intelligence agencies (IAs) therefore call out for proper anthropological or sociological analysis.

There is a vast library on the secret services of the USA and Russia, UK, Israel, and other countries, but little of this has been informed by the critical lens of anthropology. In this article, I shall start by surveying the field, asking how to bring it into view in a manner that is as 'objective' as possible, while at the same time giving a holistic overview of a complex, fascinating and very significant subject. Throughout, I shall focus particularly on Britain or 'our side'. I find the place of intelligence agencies in Britain to be the hardest to unravel, not so much because understanding one's own culture is often the hardest, but also because secrecy seems to have a special place in British culture, especially in respect of how power is exercised. Anthony Sampson's 'Anatomy of Britain' is helpful for understanding the UK power structure.²

After this introductory section, this article will highlight some key episodes in the Second World War before proceeding to the Cold War and the 'War on Terror', with a particular focus on the role of intelligence agencies in relation to Middle Eastern, especially Kurdish issues.

There is an obvious tension in intelligence agencies between the claim to be producing intel that is objective and politically neutral, and a strong hidden national (and sometimes political) bias. At times this is obvious, as in the infamously false intel concerning 'weapons of mass destruction' that facilitated Tony Blair's decision for war on Iraq and (less known but well documented) the involvement of supposedly 'apolitical' secret services in campaigns to discredit 'left-leaning' Labour leaders.

¹ Research Associate, Centre for World Environmental History, University of Sussex.

² Sampson 1993, 2004. *The Anatomy of Britain*, first published in 1962, is available online at https://archive.org/details/anatomyofbritain00samp

For these and related reasons, it is hard to be neutral about the role of intelligence agencies. On the one hand, their purpose is to carry out a vital function for the nation states they serve; on the other hand, whistle-blowers and investigative journalists have exposed a long list of cases of violence and disinformation. This article will highlight the voices of whistle-blowers and dissidents at critical points, giving a sense of how much in public affairs is kept secret or distorted. In this sense, this article is an anthropological critique of IAs, asking fundamental questions about their place in society, and how we use key concepts such as 'intelligence', 'disinformation' and 'conspiracy'.

The role of the anthropologist has some affinity with the role of the spy, in terms of 'eliciting information from natives'. The often close connection between the roles of spy and anthropologist has been explored for colonial India by Bayly (1996). Colonial-era anthropologists abetted 'structural violence' through the 'scientific' but stereotyped analysis and categorization of tribal peoples, most notoriously in the concept of 'Criminal Tribes' (Manjana et al. 2022). Since the Second World War, many anthropologists have been employed as spies (Price 2016).

Spying was recognized as crucial in ancient times. In the Old Testament, Moses sends spies to spy out the land of Canaan before his people move into it. Julius Caesar's *Gallic Wars* is understood as showing an anthropological interest in 'the enemy' that was crucial to Caesar's rapid conquest of what is now France. The 'knowledge' Caesar published about the Gauls and other peoples he conquered, like 19th-20th century colonial ethnography, is top-down and stereotyped 'conquerors' knowledge', of huge yet constantly questionable value to those of us wishing to understand the Gauls or Celts. Among ancient texts, the *Arthashastra* shows an Indian emphasis on spies; and advocacy of spy networks in Sun Tzu's *Art of War*, written in China about 2500 years ago, had a huge influence on Mao Tse-tung and the CIA (Andrew 2018: 2-3).

In Britain in the Tudor period the new dynasty used spies and intelligence-gathering in a more organized way than ever before to clamp down on dissent. Shakespeare's *Hamlet* can be read as a play about the new 'surveillance state', with honey traps and assassination, as well as rival 'intelligencers'. This aspect is beautifully brought out in Tom Stoppard's 1966 play *Rosencrantz and Guildenstern are dead*. During the reign of Elizabeth I, spies were employed to counteract Catholic plots hatched by the Spanish crown and the pope involving Mary Queen of Scots (Alford 2013). Robert Cecil, 1st Earl of Salisbury, took over as

³ An excellent film version of Stoppard's play can be found at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3YHHHEg3ioc

spymaster to the crown from his own father and Sir Francis Walsingham, becoming Secretary of State, ensuring the accession of Mary's son James VI of Scotland as James I and discovering Guy Fawkes' Gunpowder Plot in 1605. How much he acted as an 'agent provocateur' towards these conspirators has been much debated, prefiguring modern debates about conspiracies and false-flag attacks.

As we shall see, IAs played a crucial role in the Allied victory in the Second World War. Since then, their scale and influence has increased vastly, not just in their conventional role of spying or gathering 'intel', but also in influencing events and steering the media narrative, employing the black arts of psy-ops and propaganda (Todd et al. 2009). Their extensive media control today evolved in relation to the CIA project of 'mind control', which many have understood in terms of extending Nazi medical experiments (Marks 1979/1991, Kinzer 2019, Gross 2019) and propaganda – 'Operation Mockingbird'. The UK secret services' 'Integrity Initiative' is a recent manifestation of this (Elmaazi and Blumenthal 2018).

During the post 9/11 era of the 'war on terror', controlling the narrative starts with who we call terrorists. The UK Terrorism Act of 2000 (CAMPACC 2021), like anti-terrorist legislation in many countries, follows an intelligence agency definition of terror tactics that excludes government use of terror, even though much of what this discourse calls 'terrorism' can be understood as a reaction to state terror. This is the argument in Herman's book *The Real Terror Network* (1982) and in *Manufacturing Consent* (Herman and Chomsky 1998/2002). In Afghanistan, Iraq, Libya, Syria, Yemen, Somalia, Pakistan and other countries, it seems painfully apparent that US-led attacks on 'terrorists' have increased conflicts and 'terrorist attacks' exponentially. As we shall see, the 'Jewish terrorism' leading up to the formation of the state of Israel is largely forgotten (Eveland 1980/2018, Giladi 1992/2003), and whether the Kurdish-led PKK⁵ should be counted a terrorist organization is much debated.

The aircraft attacks in the USA on 11th September 2001 were widely seen as a huge failure of the US intelligence agencies (Kamarck 2021). As the War on Terror was conceived and acted out through US-led attacks on Afghanistan and Iraq, this justified the IAs playing a rapidly expanding role in surveillance, as well as orchestrating operations and influencing media narratives. Expansion in the surveillance of citizens is what led Edward Snowden to become a whistle-blower (Snowden 2019).

⁴ A conventional summary is available on Wikipedia (on which more later) and at Spartacus Educational (n.d.), while Bernstein 1977 and Wilford 2008 are in-depth studies of media control.

⁵ Partiya Karkerên Kurdistanê or Kurdistan Workers Party.

If we fail to analyse the role of intelligence agencies, we therefore remain trapped in the narratives they construct, in which disinformation is entangled with truth. As we shall see, the experience of most Kurdish people in particular, among countless other communities, seems to be systematically marginalized out of the mainstream media.

In terms of understanding the place of spies in a social structure, this is often marginal in the sense that all spies become experts in secrecy and the tensions their work demands. Some key spies have combined this with living very flamboyant lives indeed (e.g. Richard Sorge and Donald Maclean; see respectively Matthews 2019, Philipps 2018). Spying is structured through complex diagrams of agents and assets. Many spies lead largely conventional lives, but always coloured by stringent secrecy restrictions. Motivation varies notoriously between patriotism or ideology, money, and sex or love (Smith 2010).

In terms of the power these agencies wield, analysing them is an apex example of 'studying up' (Nader 1969). So, if we combine this with 'reverse anthropology' by putting the critical focus on how power is exercised in our own society, this will help the collective effort to decolonize anthropology (Tuhiwai Smith 1999/2012). How can we reach objective understanding about other cultures without analysing the power structures that define our own lives?

The essence of modern power structures emerges particularly clearly in what is imposed on indigenous peoples (IPs). Among those IPs whom intelligence agencies have used and then 'betrayed', a particularly poignant case is that of the Hmong in Laos, recruited in large numbers by the CIA and US military during the Vietnam war, with a few thousand airlifted to the USA afterwards, but most abandoned to severe reprisals by a communist government who saw them as traitors (Hamilton-Merritt 1993/1998).

Every generation of anthropologists has attempted further levels of decolonizing our own roles. As we turn to analysing the role of intelligence agencies in the overall power structures imposed upon us, we shouldn't be afraid to analyse upwards. Perhaps we even have a duty to encourage similar self-awareness about their role among intelligence agents.

Formal and non-formal structures

Every country's IAs seem to go through deep divisions at times, which reflect personal, political, institutional, ideological or policy rivalries. Distinguishing formal or overt from non-formal structures is therefore a starting point for analysing IAs' social structures. My first book was an exercise in reverse anthropology, studying the power structure imposed on a

tribal people in India by analysing the roles of administrators, missionaries and anthropologists during and after colonial rule. Distinguishing the administrators' formal from their non-formal structure was a starting point. Coming to IAs, their power is covert by definition, so their most violent actions, such as assassinations and political interference abroad, rarely form part of their official narrative. For example, if the CIA has sometimes collaborated with the mafia, this will hardly form part of its overt or formal structure, even though CIA practice has often involved 'wet assignments' (as assassinations are termed) much more than MI6, whose methods appear more indirect (Jacobsen 2019). Either way, covert structures are an essential aspect of how IAs work.

One aspect of the non-formal structure is the pattern of 'revolving doors'. It is interesting how many senior intelligence officials have become heads of state, from Bush senior, head of the CIA 1976-7, and Putin in the KGB/FSB 1975-1991, to several key Israeli heads of state (see below), and many examples in Britain, where No.10's close relationship with the secret services has been extensively documented (Aldrich and Cormac 2016).

The three best known British IAs are MI5 (Military Intelligence, Service 5), MI6 (the Secret Intelligence Service or SIS, focused on foreign affairs) and GCHQ (Govt Communications HQ), which grew out of the codebreaking outfit at Bletchley Park during the Second World War. MI5 and MI6 are well known through many histories, as well as spy novels and films. John Le Carré's novels and James Bond films give conventionalized images of MI6 that are both cynical and glamorous, emphasizing the danger and violence. MI6 essentially started in 1909, its designation as SIS being articulated in 1920, but its existence was not officially admitted until 1994 (Jones 2014), while the super-secret designation of SIGINT (Signals Intelligence) at GCHQ has been surrounded by far greater secrecy still (Aldrich 2010, MacAskill et al. 2013).

During the Second World War, the Special Operations Executive (SOE) was formed (1940) to carry out 'covert action' and 'set Europe ablaze'. It employed about 13,000 men and women, and merged with SIS at the end of the war. The SAS (Special Air Service) and SBS (Special Boat Service) were also formed for 'special ops' during the war and disbanded thereafter, though the SAS was revived in 1947. SOE, SAS and SBS were subject to military command rather than being placed under the Foreign Office (Cormac 2018: 1-13). 'Spy' is a vague word, and often refers to special agents devoted to sabotage and insurrection, such as British agents in France in WWII, and 'special forces' since.

⁶ Padel 1995/2010, based on my Oxford D.Phil in social anthropology, and co-supervised from the Delhi School of Economics sociology department by J.P.S. Uberoi.

Obviously, MI6 and GCHQ are instruments of the British government's foreign policy. Mark Curtis's books are excellent for understanding the highly manipulative covert roles they have played in Iran, Malaysia, Aden/Yemen, Egypt, Indonesia (Bevins 2020) and the Vietnam war (Curtis 2003, 2004, 2010) – 'the secret pursuit of Britain's foreign policy' (Cormac 2018). Official histories give important detail, but omit or distort much, as in the official history of MI6 (Jeffery 2010), which conveniently stops before the agency's controversial role in ousting Iran's democratically elected Prime Minister Mosaddeq in 1952-4 by supporting Muslim extremists to bring in the Shah dynasty (Kinzer 2006, 2008; Cobain 2020).

Other British intelligence units have been equally secretive, such as the 'spy cops' (Woodman 2018; Evans and Lewis 2013) who infiltrated environmental and anti-war movements by forming sexual relationships and steering movements as agents provocateurs towards extreme actions to discredit them; and the Information Research Department (IRD), a Foreign Office propaganda unit (1948-1977). Eric Blair (George Orwell) drew up a list of 'crypto-communists' for the IRD just after its formation (Open Culture 2015) – no small matter when one understands the momentous, hidden role this organization played in ousting Mossadeq in Iran and Sukarno in Indonesia (Lashmar and Oliver 1998, Bevins 2020). In the latter, the IRD's black propaganda and lists of communists supplied to Suharto's forces led to the slaughter of tens of thousands of Indonesians (Lashmer, Gilby and Oliver 2021). In Northern Ireland, the IRD's dangerous psy-ops role (1975-7) was exposed by one of its key agents, Colin Wallace, 'the man who knew too much'. Each of these operations, among many more in other countries, witnessed a wide range of extreme activities, including the violent use of agents provocateurs to stimulate unrest. Recent British government initiatives aimed at 'countering fake news' seem to replicate these campaigns, amplifying them through surveillance technology (Conversation 2018).

The FBI and CIA are better known than the British secret services for the role they have played in internal and external US affairs. The CIA, formed in 1947 to replace the Office of Strategic Services (OSS, which was formed and played a key role in the Second World War) is known to have aided and abetted at least seventy regime changes in different countries since the Second World War (O'Rourke 2018). The FBI and CIA figure prominently in histories of the assassinations of John and Robert Kennedy, Martin Luther King, Malcolm X,

1

7

⁷ A 2020 documentary about Colin Wallace under this title, written and directed by Michael Oswald, has been reviewed by Nasser (2021) and is available to watch at https://www.filmsforaction.org/watch/the-man-who-knew-too-much/

journalist Dorothy Kilgallen and others associated with the Kennedy murders.⁸ Among other US spy agencies, DARPA (the Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency), formed under Eisenhower in 1958 for military intelligence, is particularly influential and secretive (Jacobsen 2015).

The separation between MI5-MI6 and GCHQ is mirrored in the USA in the separation between internal-external affairs and sigint, also that between the FBI-CIA and the NSA (National Security Agency, Bamford 2008). Like GCHQ, the NSA retained its secrecy until recently, and only became widely known to the public through a leak at the end of 2005 about its surveillance program (CNN 2005). Vastly expanded after 9/11, public knowledge was much amplified by Snowden's escape to Russia in 2013, after revealing the extent of electronic surveillance on Americans and foreigners alike, including by parallel agencies in the UK, Canada, Australia and New Zealand – 'the Five Eyes'.

The NSA was founded under US President Truman and remained extremely secretive, though even larger than the CIA. As Aldrich's book on GCHQ emphasizes, Bletchley Park's decoding of the enigma code was glamorized after the war, but its transformation from 'Govt Code & Cypher School' to GCHQ at a base in Cheltenham in 1946 was long kept shrouded in secrecy, as were the decipherment techniques which gave Churchill his 'ultra-secret (i.e. above top-secret) intel reports, until the importance of Cyprus as a sigint base was exposed through the 'ABC trial' of two journalists and a corporal in sigint, who outed GCHQ surveillance in the 1970s. Prior to this, GCHQ had allowed the NSA/CIA to use its 'listening bases', from Cyprus to Diego Garcia.

The relationship between the US and UK intel agencies is interesting. The CIA is hardly shy about letting the world know its role in effecting regime change etc., in comparison with a far more secretive British role. On whistle-blowers, the first chapter in Greenberg (2012) compares Dan Ellsberg bringing out the Pentagon Papers in 1969 with Bradley (Chelsea) Manning exposing the torture and assassination of innocent civilians in Iraq and Afghanistan from 2006.

Philip Agee was a key early CIA whistle-blower (1975, 1978, 1987). Kiriakou (2009/2012), Lindauer (2010) and Gary Webb (Devereux 2014) followed this tradition in revealing some less savoury CIA exploits. FBI whistle-blowers on events surrounding 9/11

⁸ Smith 2013, Summers 1980/2013, Pease 2018, Shaw 2020.

⁹ Crispin Aubrey, John Berry and Duncan Campbell ('ABC') were tried in November-December in the UK's Central Criminal Court under the Official Secrets Act 1911 over their article 'The Wiretappers', published in *Time Out* in 1976. The trial was counterproductive in the sense that it drew attention to the UK's use of bases in Cyprus for sigint spying just after the Watergate scandal in the USA. Key witness 'Colonel B' was ridiculed in the press, and the defendants were convicted without much penalty.

include Coleen Rowley and Sibel Edmonds (2012). Both agencies have at times worked closely with the mafia and other gangsters, for example, in attempts to assassinate Fidel Castro in Cuba, and FBI agents have colluded closely with gang leaders (Lehr and O'Neill 2012).

The CIA's close links with US arms companies emerges clearly in the history of 'Operation Cyclone', in which the CIA funded Pakistan's ISI (Inter-Services Intelligence) to support Osama Bin Laden, among others with a view to bringing down the USSR through a proxy war in Afghanistan, even though research by certain CIA analysts showed that half the funds were going to develop Pakistan's nuclear weapons program, even adapting planes being bought from the US to carry nuclear missiles. Far from heeding this research, these CIA analysts' concerns and careers were blocked to facilitate this arms sale (Levy and Clark 2007). In the interests of UK's arms sales, Tony Blair infamously curtailed a Serious Fraud Office investigation into corruption at the heart of the UK's economy, and intel agencies' infiltrated the Campaign Against the Arms Trade (Thomas 2007).

CIA infiltration of left movements, student unions and academia has come under the spotlight recently (Paget 2015). Cambridge Analytica is relevant in understanding recent trends in IAs operating in a way that bridges government and private enterprise, orchestrating elections of polarising leaders in many countries.

Disinformation that won the Second World War

Britons grow up on heroic tales of brave and brilliant British spies and spy agencies fighting the Nazis, from SIS decoding Ultra/Enigma to SAS liaison with the French Resistance, and master deceptions such as 'the man who never was'. Ben Macintyre outlines this history in his books on Operations Zigzag, Mincemeat and Double Cross (2007, 2010, 2012).

Operation Mincemeat involved dropping the corpse of a Welsh 'tramp' dressed as a special forces messenger into the sea just off the coast of Spain with vital letters for British commanders in Gibraltar and North Africa outlining fabricated plans for invading Sardinia and southern France, with Sicily to be attacked only as a decoy, when the real plan actually was to invade Sicily. This succeeded well: Hitler believed the deception and moved key forces out of Sicily.

¹⁰ The 1958 film so titled was the first public statement about Operation Mincemeat, recorded in much greater detail by MacIntyre much later (2010). A trailer for the 1950s film version can be found at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CXyFkINMcI8

Meanwhile, all Nazi spies in Britain had been either killed or turned into double agents, their identities maintained for running hundreds of non-existent assets, from Welsh miners to workers in munitions factories, whose reports were dutifully sent to German spymasters, producing a mountain of false intel. Some members of the Abwehr¹¹ were courageously anti-Hitler and were executed horribly after the assassination attempt on Hitler in July 1944, so may have been willingly deceived.

During the Second World War, the effectiveness of British intelligence agencies was extraordinary, both in deciphering enemy codes and in disseminating elaborate disinformation. The contrast between British and German spying operations was dramatic. The British, with crucial Polish help (War history online 2016), had deciphered the 'Enigma' code and read most German coded messages on a daily basis throughout the war. They maintained an extensive network of spies in continental Europe, while no Germany's spies in Britain remained at large (MacIntyre 2012). Messages from dozens of non-existent UK-based spies radioed to German intelligence were all fictitious constructs, carefully maintained through Bletchley Park's mass employment of several thousand workers deciphering foreign codes and constructing disinformation. All these workers had signed the Official Secrets Act. Demobbed at the end of the war, they were threatened that 'careless talk costs lives', and were forbidden to tell even their families about their secret wartime work. Britain had won the war in large part thanks to the brilliance of its intelligence network; but the extent of this expertise in decipherment and disinformation was not to be known too widely. It is only since the 1970s that researchers examining declassified archives have been able to piece together a broader history of British espionage.

Sicily was overwhelmed fairly fast in July 1943, thanks to Operation Mincemeat. As the Allies fought northwards, they captured Italy and then Germany, area by area. What remains little known is that they did this partly by secretly enlisting the help of key mafiosi, fascists and Nazis (Talbot 2015). As one strand in this secret network, Lucky Luciano, 'father' of the mafia in New York, was freed from jail (where he had been since 1932) through Operation Underworld (Dezenhall 2013), giving OSS an introduction to Don Calo – Calogero Vizzini, *Capo di tutti capi* of the Sicilian mafia (Tagliabue 1994, Williams 2018). Don Calo appears to have given indispensable help to the allied invasion after US tanks made straight for his home through German defences. He was made an honorary colonel in the US army and Mayor of Villalba. Many mafiosi jailed under Mussolini were released to help occupy Sicily, and this

¹¹ German military intelligence, 1920-1944.

collaboration with the Allies seems to have re-established mafia power as never before. Evidently they were considered a necessary tool by Americans and Britons determined to prevent the communists coming to power, and many left-wingers were assassinated under Don Calo's regime in Sicily.

Transition into Cold War

In this way, the Cold War pattern emerged before the Second World War had ended, the infamous spy intrigues flourished in occupied Berlin, and the Berlin Wall went up. Fascinating spy thrillers focusing on the early years of the Cold War extended Britain's celebration of its wartime spies. Ex-spies and authors David Cornwell (John Le Carré) and Ian Fleming in *The spy who came in from the Cold* and the *James Bond* series respectively are among the most celebrated. One vital aspect they failed to highlight, for obvious reasons, was Operation Gladio, the 'stay-behind armies'.

Operation Gladio was a secret, virulently anti-communist organization, named after an ancient Roman sword. In Operation Sunrise (Halbrook 2006), Allen Dulles, Director of OSS in Switzerland (Talbot 2015), and James Angleton, in charge of OSS in Italy, made clandestine deals with key fascist and Nazi commanders, including Prince Junio Valerio Borghese, a top fascist naval commander, Karl Wolff, an SS General who had been posted to collaborate with Mussolini after months in charge of concentration camp transports, and Reinhard Gehlen, Lt-General in charge of intelligence on Germany's Eastern front. Each of these was helped by OSS agents to avoid prosecution for war crimes and was enlisted in the fight against communism.

Gehlen, working closely with the CIA, brought about 350 spies who had worked in Nazi intelligence into a spy network overseen by the OSS/CIA named the Gehlen organization, and oversaw its transformation into the Bundesnachrichtendienst (BND, West German foreign intel service) in 1956 (Gehlen 1972). Similarly, it wasn't until after his death in 1973 that Paul Dickopf, who headed Germany's Federal Police for six years before heading Interpol (1968-71), was found to have been a senior Nazi in the SS who switched to working for OSS before the end of the war. This link between the CIA and ex-Nazis involved employing war criminals by hiding their past identities (Timeline 2021), orchestrating anti-communist operations of extreme violence for decades to come, including Operation Condor in Latin America (Dinges 2004), and terrorist attacks attributed to the Red Brigades in Italy such as the kidnapping and murder of Prime Minister Aldo Moro in 1978 (Forte 2019).

Gladio was first uncovered by Italian magistrate Felice Casson in 1972 while investigating the Peleano bombing, which was initially blamed on leftists. Italian Prime Minister Giulio Andreotti admitted Gladio's existence in Parliament in October 1990; and Judge Guido Salvini, heading an inquiry, found evidence of CIA and NATO involvement, including training by the British SAS, to foment a 'strategy of tension'. P26, a similar organization in Switzerland, was also revealed in 1990, with similar evidence from other countries, including Turkey, as we shall see.¹²

The close relationship between the CIA and the mafia has persisted. Paying for Gladio involved raising money for black ops through the drugs trade, transporting heroin to New York with mafia help (Williams 2018), in a pattern replicated in Southeast Asia during the Vietnam War (McCoy 1972/2003, Chouvy 2011) in the notorious Phoenix Program of assassinations that was funded through the CIA effectively taking over the drugs trade (Clair and Cockburn 2017). Under cover of Reagan's 'War on Drugs', the CIA similarly funded the Contra guerrillas in Nicaragua by taking control of the drugs trade they were supposedly suppressing (Ruppert 2004, Devereux 2014).

The US military also took an estimated 1,600 Nazi arms scientists to the USA, employing them with minimal questions about their past, to start the arms race against the USSR (which also took some). This was Operation Paperclip.¹³

While Britain's brilliant spy networks had fooled the Nazis and won the war, they were brilliantly penetrated by spies working for Stalin's USSR during and after the war, especially the 'Cambridge Five'. The first two to be discovered managed to defect and escape to Moscow – Donald Maclean (Philipps 2018) and Guy Burgess. The 'third man', Kim Philby (1968), managed to hang on and defected much later. Maclean, like Philby, was a top member of MI6 and had long stayed 'above suspicion', bringing out vital information for Stalin. The other two weren't discovered till later, and after debriefing were allowed to remain free, to save MI6 and the ruling elite they were part of from crippling embarrassment. John Cairncross's confession in the USA in 1964 led to the uncovering of Sir Anthony Blunt. Cairncross was allowed to live in Britain unmolested until his death in 1995 aged 82. Blunt had been Surveyor of the Queen's pictures and was also allowed to remain free, though Mrs Thatcher outed him and got him stripped of his 'Sir'.

¹² BBC 1992, Ganser 2004, Edmonds 2013, Cottrell 2015, Kollerstrom 2018.

¹³ A basic outline is available in Charles River Editors 2016. A much fuller study is by Jacobsen (2014), who has an excellent talk available with powerpoint on youtube at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wDZc-fO8pHc

George Blake joined this list of embarrassing double agents, reporting crucial intel to the KGB during 1956-1961. From a more working-class background than the Cambridge Five, he was sentenced to 42 years in prison in Wormwood Scrubs as an example – which failed spectacularly when he escaped and got to the USSR in 1966. He had headed SIS/MI6 in the British embassy in Seoul. Captured during the Korean War, he defected to the Soviet side out of horror at the indiscriminate allied bombing of Korea (Kuper 2021).

After the 1950s, the British turned the tables on the Soviets, and there was constant secret spy warfare involving hundreds of individuals – some stories and deaths known, others not. For example, Oleg Gordievsky was 'turned' by Danish intelligence in partnership with MI6 in 1974 and worked as a double agent when promoted as Resident in the Soviet embassy in London (1982-5), where he supervised all Soviet spies in the UK. Recalled to Moscow and in danger, as Stalin's spy agencies in the USSR tortured and executed such people, he was exfiltrated by the British, and survived to write books on the KGB (Gordievsky 2015). The Cold War history of double/triple agents is fascinating though brutal, and well worth anthropological analysis.

Vignettes of the complex Cold War history of spy defections and double agents emerge in books about the directors of US Central Intelligence (1973-6) William Colby (Woods 2013) and of MI6 (1973-8) Maurice Oldfield (by his nephew Martin Pearce, 2016). Colby's CIA service spanned OSS in Italy to Operation Phoenix in Vietnam. Aldrich and Cormac (2016) give a detailed account of UK's intel agencies' relations with every British PM, from Herbert Asquith to David Cameron (1908-2016).

Of course John Le Carré's novels, while revealing the heartless cynicism of MI6, show the Soviets in a much worse light. He and Fleming (like Graham Greene, Somerset Maughan and others) were spies, so their works reflect real power relations in the agencies but also contain distortions in order to avoid giving anything vital away that could endanger 'national security'. This reveals an interesting connection between novel/thriller-writing and spies, and the two main spy-creators of 'the man who never was' also wrote spy thrillers (MacIntyre 2010).

Cold war 'smoke and mirrors' – 'cloak and dagger stuff' – reached a climax with the publication of *Spycatcher* by Peter Wright (1987), which the UK government tried to ban, but which was published in the USA and Australia. Although its main thesis was discredited (that Roger Hollis, head of MI5, was a Soviet mole), it reveals much about how MI5 worked, while again carefully avoiding giving too much away.

From 1948, Sidney Gottlieb, working with Allen Dulles at the CIA, started projects Bluebird and Artichoke, which became MKUltra in 1953. This was a vast programme of psychological experiments on human guinea pigs, with 149 sub-projects (Melton and Wallace 2010: 13), which continued until the Church Committee judged it illegal in 1975 and it was officially closed down. Gottlieb drew on sadistic Nazi and Japanese research on prisoners, and MKUltra had far-reaching effects on thousands of individuals, as well as future patterns of mind control and propaganda. Media penetration was considered the CIA's 'crown jewels', being deliberately underplayed in the Church Committee Report. Bernstein (1977) estimated that the CIA counted at least 400 journalists as 'assets' and worked closely with at least 25 key news outlets. Frank Wisner, as CIA Deputy Director in charge of 'black ops', spoke of media influence as his 'mighty Wurlitzer'. Since then, media control by IAs has become ever more extensive and normalized (Wilford 2008).

The CIA has been relatively open about its role in assisting often extremely violent removals of elected left-wing governments in at least seventy countries since WWII. The best known CIA regime changes, some involving or instigated by MI6, include:

- Malaysia 1948-54, by Britain, delaying independence in a way that prevented a takeover by the communists.
- Iran 1952-4, masterminded by MI6 in the interests of the Anglo-British oil company (precursor of BP), which brought in vital revenue (Kinzer 2008). The CIA were brought in under British pressure and played a crucial role in effecting the coup.
- Guatemala (1954) is vital for showing the key use made of Edward Bernays, 'Father of PR', Freud's nephew, who popularized his uncle's work, but was arguably a lot more influential, using Freudian psychology in public relations, not just for advertising, but in politics, and inaugurating psychological techniques by intel agencies from this time. This US-led regime change ousted the socialist elected leader Arbenz Guzman with extreme violence, falsely depicting him as a hardcore communist, in the interests of US United Fruit Company, which Bernays worked for. Bernays and the CIA portrayed the installed leader Carlos Castillo Armas as 'good' even as he institutionalized systematic oppression that would persist for decades (Schlesinger and Kinzer 2005). 15

-

¹⁴ McCoy 2006, Todd et al 2009, Melton and Wallace 2010 [Mulholland 1950s], Talbot 2015, Kinzer 2019. The Wikipedia article on MKUltra gives a basic outline.

¹⁵ This episode is well brought out in the documentary made by Adam Curtis (brother of Mark), *Century of the Self* (Part 1), available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DnPmg0R1M04. Bernays' books include *Propaganda* (1928) and *The Engineering of Consent* (1955).

- MI6 attempted to assassinate Nasser in Egypt in the 1950s, as the CIA tried to assassinate Castro in the 1960s regime changes that failed.
- Guyana, Jamaica, Kenya, Tanzania, Ghana and other former British colonies had their independence delayed through often very violent campaigns full of IA tricks, including destabilization over bauxite politics and violent suppression of the Mau Mau movement. The indigenous population of Diegio Garcia was removed in 1968, their existence denied. ¹⁶
- In Congo, Britain colluded in the killing of Patrice Lumumba (1960-61), inaugurating Mobutu's reign of terror a pattern of extreme violence in African countries (also especially Ghana) exposed in Susan Williams' *White Malice* (2021).
- In 1967, Britain supported the newly independent Nigerian government in its violent Biafran war.
- Indonesia 1965 (Bevins 2020), Chile 1973, Argentina 1976... This list represents the briefest selection of the conspiracies hatched by US and UK intelligence agencies that have toppled governments considered uncongenial to 'our interests' (Curtis 2003, 2004, 2010; Kinzer 2006). It is fascinating how techniques of mass deception and propaganda, used so effectively during the Second World War, were steered post-war towards undermining socialism in Europe and worldwide during the Cold War.

Funding Bin Laden and other jihadists in Afghanistan played a key role in undermining the USSR and the transition into the 'War on Terror'. There is much evidence that essentially the same tactics are still being used, with far more elaborate propaganda campaigns. As we shall see, this is especially evident in Turkey and Syria.

If the CIA is relatively open about its role in effecting regime change, Israel has been even more open about its numerous targeted assassinations abroad, seen as necessary to protect the country's security. Israeli intelligence agents or 'operators' are widely regarded as national heroes. The Israeli case is significant for its influence over the US, UK's and other countries' foreign policy, not least through arms sales and counterinsurgency training for many national security forces. These make Mossad and the other Israeli 'special op' agencies a pervasive model (Bar-Zohar and Mishal 2016, Bergman 2008 and 2018).

It is interesting how many Israeli Prime Ministers were previously senior intelligence or special force commanders:

- Ben Gurion (1st PM 1948-54 and 1955-63, Israel's 'founding father') led Israel during the 1948 Arab–Israeli War, uniting the secret Jewish militias into the Israel Defense

¹⁶ Curtis 2003, Kinzer 2006, Williams 2021, Padel and Das 2010: 229-236, 452-3, Das and Padel 2020: 285-292, 522.

Forces (IDF), and presiding over the formation of Mossad and Shin Bet ('Unseen Shield' – equivalents of MI6 and MI5 respectively).¹⁷

- Yitzhak Rabin (PM 1974-77 and 1992-5) served in the Palmach (elite fighting force of the Haganah) before 1948 and the IDF in 1948-67, and was the general credited with winning the Six Day War.
- Menachem Begin (6th PM 1977-83) headed Irgun, which broke with Haganah and led the terrorist revolt against the British from 1944 (Weir 2014). He formed the Likud Party, but became deeply depressed after the Israeli invasion and occupation of Lebanon, when he was misled by Ariel Sharon (his defence minister) that Israeli forces would enter 'only 40km into Lebanon'.
- Yitzhak Shamir (PM 1983-4 and 1986-92) was a key member of Lehi, 'the Stern gang', which broke with Irgun to continue anti-British terrorist activities during the war, and then of Mossad (1955-65).
- Shimon Peres (PM 1984-6, 1995-6, 2007-14) held several diplomatic and military positions during and directly after the 1948 Arab–Israeli War. His first high-level government position was as Deputy Director-General of Defense in 1952, which he attained at the age of 28, and Director-General 1953-59.
- Benjamin Natanyahu (PM 1996-99, 2009-2022) became a team leader in the elite Sayeret Matkal special forces unit and took part in many missions, including Operations Inferno and Gift (1968), and was wounded in Operation Isotope (1972). His elder brother Yoni (Yonaton) commanded Sayeret Matkal during Operation Entebbe, rescuing 102 out of 106 hostages held at Entebbe Airport in Uganda in 1976, at the cost of his own life.
- Ehud Barak (10th PM 1999-2001) was a Rav Aluf (Lieutenant general) in the Israel Defense Forces (IDF), one of the most highly decorated soldiers in Israel's history, joining in 1959 and serving 35 years, including as a commando in Sayeret Matkal, leading several highly acclaimed operations, including Sabena Flight 571 at Lod Airport in 1972; the covert 1973 Israeli raid on Lebanon in Beirut, in which he disguised himself as a woman to kill members of the Palestine Liberation Organization; and a key architect of Operation Entebbe and Operation Bayonet, which led to the dismantling of the Palestinian terrorist cell Black September. Barak also masterminded the Tunis Raid on 16 April 1988, in which PLO leader Abu Jihad was killed.

¹⁷ 'The Gatekeepers (2012) is an award-winning documentary directed by Dror Moreh that tells the story of Shin Bet ('Shabak' in Hebrew) through interviews with six of its former heads. A trailer can be found at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HdMjr8cuEy8

- Ariel Sharon (11th PM 2001-6) was a key military leader from 1948. He founded and commanded Unit 101 as a special ops unit within the IDF under Ben Gurion in 1953. As Minister of Defense, he directed the 1982 Lebanon War. An official enquiry found that he bore 'personal responsibility' for the Sabra and Shatila massacres as 'the butcher of Beirut'.

A key moment was when three whistle-blowers within Shin Bet spoke out and insisted on justice after Avraham Shalom had lied to conceal the extrajudicial killing of two Palestinians who had hijacked a bus. As a Shin Bet member said during the Inquiry Commission: 'The supreme rule after a failed op is the removal of the fingerprints of the State of Israel. Not telling the truth is an integral part of removing the problem.' Sharon was understood to have lied to conceal the systematic torture and extrajudicial killings of eighty Palestinian suspects, using a list of victims to blackmail ex-Prime Ministers (Bergman 2018: 287).

The emphasis on deception and disinformation by the Israeli secret services is also brought out in Palestinian histories (Kimmerling and Migdal 1994/2003, Pappé 2006, Khalidi 2010) and an intrinsic part of the proliferation of such patterns worldwide. Many aspects of Israel's history remain hidden or little known, including Mossad terror campaigns targeting Jews in Iraq and Egypt during 1950-54, aimed at accelerating Jewish emigration to Israel, and propaganda that concealed the violence of the 1948 Arab-Israeli War and *Nakba* (Eveland 1980/2018, Giladi 1992/2003).

Narrative control in the War on Terror

Control of the media narrative by the FBI and CIA was already evident under J. Edgar Hoover, first Director of the FBI (1935-1972). When J.F. Kennedy was assassinated, and the Warren Commission advocated the 'lone gunman' theory, those around Hoover and President Johnson put great energy into dismissing 'conspiracy theories' that – far more than the idea the Warren Commission promoted of a Soviet or Cuban conspiracy – have consistently focused on a conspiracy between FBI and/or CIA officials working with mafiosi (Summers 1980/2013, Smith 2013, Shaw 2020).

Collating all the evidence, conspiracy actually seems the essence of how intelligence agencies have operated at crucial points, especially obvious in regime changes. 'Conspiracy theories', as a term used to undermine criticism, was first propagated through these agencies' influence over hundreds of prominent journalists and media consortia, essentially to discredit those alleging FBI/CIA involvement in the conspiracies that gave rise to these killings. Details are disputed (e.g. in Wikipedia), but what is not in question is that the 1967 CIA cable

that first used the term recommends counteracting conspiracy theories through 'propaganda assets' in the media. 18

The start of black ops on a massive scale in the Vietnam war is covered (from very different perspectives!) in books on Colby (Woods 2013) and the drugs trade (McCoy 1972/2003, Chouvy 2011) and in how consent was 'manufactured' through media manipulation (Herman and Chomsky 1998/2002). The extension of black ops or covert operations in Afghanistan, Iraq and other countries, including how these were concealed from Congress through funding by drugs, is analysed in books by journalists documenting the war on terror under the Bush administrations (Risen 2006, Scahill 2007, Hastings 2008, Mazetti 2013), continuing under Obama. On Guantanamo, Hickman's *Murder at Camp Delta* (2015) documents systematic torture at a 'black site' in a secluded area in Guantanamo and the deaths of three prisoners there.

All these books reveal patterns far beyond what is usually understood as 'spying', including the use of torture (McCoy 2006), covert operations, disinformation and media control. Like the expertise in code-breaking and sowing disinformation, British and American expertise in covert operations 'behind enemy lines' during the Second World War, through the SAS, SIS, OSS and other services, has multiplied in the decades since. John Kiriakou's book *The reluctant spy: my secret life in the CIA's War on Terror* (2009/2012) is the work of a CIA whistle-blower who masterminded the abduction in Pakistan of Osama bin Laden's ally Abu Zubaydah in 2002. Kiriakou was led to believe Zubaydah had been waterboarded only once after his capture. After discovering this had happened over eighty times, he came out and testified that this amounted to torture in 2007, and pleaded guilty to passing classified information to a journalist about the case, serving thirty months in jail during 2013-15.

Craig Murray was Britain's ambassador to Uzbekistan at the time of Blair's declaration of war on Iraq in 2003. He was outspoken about appalling human rights abuses in Uzbekistan, including false-flag attacks, and outraged at US and UK silence about this systematic abuse – obviously because Uzbekistan was a key US/UK ally in the Afghan war – and about complicity in secret renditions. His book about this (Murray 2007) also describes the violent disinformation the Foreign Office spread to try and discredit him (2001-6).

¹⁸ Summary of arguments by Rev. Douglas at http://projectunspeakable.com/conspiracy-theory-invention-of-cia/ and 'CIA and critics of the Warren Report' at http://22november1963.org.uk/cia-warren-report-critics

¹⁹ Woodward 2010, Scahill 2013 and 2016, Hastings 2012, Blumenthal 2019, Jacobsen 2020. On the suspicions surrounding Michael Hastings' death, see https://whowhatwhy.org/2013/08/07/connections-between-michael-hastings-edward-snowden-and-barrett-brown-the-war-with-the-security-state/

The Guardian newspaper in Britain was considered relatively independent, which is why it was selected by Assange and Snowden as an outlet for their Wikileaks material. The Guardian reportedly ignored 'DA notices' sent by the Defence & Security Media Advisory (DSMA) Committee.²⁰ These are supposedly 'voluntary' directives sent to media outlets 'to prevent inadvertent public disclosure of information that would compromise UK military & defence operations'. PM David Cameron said he didn't want to issue more DA notices, but on 20 July 2013, GCHQ sent a team to force the Guardian to destroy hard drives containing the Wikileaks material. Alan Rushbridger, the Guardian's editor-in-chief (1995-2015), called this destruction a 'symbolic act', and brought out several more articles following a supposedly independent line. But after Catherine Viner succeeded him in 2015, the Guardian was given the first ever interviews by acting heads first of MI5 (Andrew Parker, November 2016) and then of MI6 (Alex Younger, March 2017). The latter came out just as the High Court was reviewing its earlier decision not to prosecute MI6's 2004 acting head, Sir Mark Allen, regarding-his organization's alleged complicity in the rendition of Abdel Hakim Belhaj, an opponent of Gaddafi, to Libya in 2004, where he was tortured. Keir Starmer was the Director of Public Prosecutions when this decision not to prosecute MI6 officials over secret renditions was taken (Kennard and Curtis 2019).

What motivated Snowden (2019) was the realization that the NSA was engaging in mass surveillance in the USA, and that Britain's spy agencies were doing the same. By 2018 it was apparent that the British courts could fine them for this, but not stop them doing it (Corfield 2018).

Evidence collected *Propaganda blitz: how the corporate media distort reality* (Edwards and Cromwell 2018) shows a pattern of systematic disinformation, with reference to the BBC and *Guardian* in particular (since these are often perceived as 'impartial' and 'left-wing' respectively), following the lines dictated by the IAs through DA notices and unstated consensus on key subjects, systematically distorting them. Topics covered in this book include Syria, Libya, Yemen, Israel and Palestine, Assange, Scottish Independence, and Jeremy Corbyn.

Media manipulation is nowhere more apparent than in Kurdish regions. The CIA and MI6 have a long history in Turkey, Iran, Iraq and Syria (the four main countries comprising 'Kurdistan'), since these countries were created by dividing the Ottoman Empire after the First World War. Involvement in these countries intensified after the Second World War. The

²⁰ These official requests were termed D-Notices until 1993, then DA (Defence Advisory) Notices, and presently are DSMA Notices.

role of the CIA has been very complex in relation to the Kurds, including supporting north Iraq's breakaway from the Iraqi government in 2002-3 in advance of destroying Saddam Hussein's Iraq (Andrew et al. 2021) and supporting the Rojava fighters intermittently, through the Syrian Democratic Forces (Goldman and Schmidt 2017). It seems highly significant that Wikipedia carries an informative article about a 'Timber Sycamore' CIA program to arm the Syrian rebels via Jordan, while keeping to the line on White Helmets that all criticism is 'conspiracy theory'. Serious researchers are well aware of extreme and systematic misinformation in Wikipedia articles on sensitive topics, implying narrative control by the CIA and other intelligence agencies.²¹

Turkey, Syria, Kurdistan

The term 'Kurdistan' was used freely, including by Ataturk, until he banned it during the extensive Kurdish rebellion of 1925. ²² This was partly instigated by the dividing up of Kurdistan between Turkey and Iran-Iraq-Syria by the Treaties of Sèvres and Lausanne. Part of the world's 'forgotten history' is how Sheikh Mahmud Barzanji set up the Kingdom of Kurdistan (1921-25) in Sulaymaniyah (north Iraq), after being appointed Governor of the Protectorate of South Kurdistan under the British Mandate of Mesopotamia; and how Barzanji's rebellion was brought to an end partly through bombing by the RAF.

In Turkey, a network of clandestine organizations was set up soon after the end of the Second World War through close collaboration with the CIA and NATO, which seem to have kept in close contact with Turkish security, paramilitary and intelligence forces ever since. The original purpose of this collaboration was to prevent communists coming to power in Turkey, and the CIA and NATO played crucial, covert roles in the 1971 and 1980 coups in the country (Kinzer 2002).

In Iran, Britain's MI6 is understood to have been the main instigator of the subversion leading to the overthrow of Mossadeq's socialist government in Iran in 1952-4, largely through agent provocateurs and aid to hard-line Islamic opponents of Mossadeq (Kinzer 2008). Similar aid to the Muslim Brotherhood in Egypt during this period was aimed at removing Nasser from power.²³ The Shah dynasty, reinstated in Iran in 1953, lasted until the

²¹ See 'Wikipedia exposed as corrupt tool of the establishment', 21st Century Wire, 26 October 2018, at https://21stcenturywire.com/2018/10/26/wikipedia-exposed-as-corrupt-tool-of-the-establishment/

²² Olson 1989, Chaliand 1993, Öcalan 2007, Padel 2012, Padel, Sadik & Gupta 2018.

²³ 'Suez crisis 1956: Britain's three way plots with France and Israel. Anthony Eden wanted President Nasser murdered as MI6 plotted regime changes in Egypt, Syria and Saudi Arabia', https://www.nlpwessex.org/docs/BBCSuez.htm

Islamic revolution of 1979, and here too, despite appearances, MI6 played a hidden role in aiding Khomeini's passage to power, passing on the names of Tudeh party members (communists) to the new Iranian authorities, who killed over a thousand of them (Klarenburg 2019).

A much-contested aspect of Turkey's covert paramilitary organizations goes back to Gladio (Edmonds 2013), whose existence in Turkey was admitted by Prime Minister Bülent Ecevit in 1973 (the same time as in Italy) in the form of 'Counter-Guerrilla',²⁴ after people who had been tortured in Ziverbey villa (where left-wingers were interrogated after the 1971 coup) revealed that their interrogators had said they were members of this organization. Ecevit alleged Counter-Guerrilla involvement in the Taksim square massacre of 1977; and covert state-orchestrated violence is evident in countless bombings and atrocities in the country since then, especially after the war with the PKK started in 1984, and often involving false-flag attacks by the Grey Wolves terrorist outfit – and not just in Turkey.

As Sibel Edmonds points out (2013), the terrorist career of Abdullah Çatlı (1956-1996) raises many questions. A leader of the Grey Wolves in the 1970s and a contract killer for MIT²⁵ (especially of leftists and Kurds associated with the PKK), he was also reportedly linked with the attempted assassination of Pope John-Paul II in 1981; yet was granted UK citizenship (for no easily intelligible reason) and a US green card, making Chicago his base, despite being on Interpol's top 10 most wanted list. Arrested in France in 1984 and jailed in Switzerland for heroin dealing, he escaped from the Swiss jail in a helicopter apparently supplied by NATO and co-ordinated by the Grey Wolves in 1990. He was then involved in the failed (possibly on purpose) assassination attempt of Azerbaijan President Heydar Aliyev in 1995, an incident which caused Azerbaijan to switch from the Russian to the US/NATO sphere of influence. He died in a car crash in November 1996 in Susurluk, northwest Turkey.

This Susurluk road accident caused an uproar in Turkey and beyond, as the other people in the car included Turkey's chief of police, a leader of the Kurdish village guards (an anti-PKK state organisation), a famous beauty queen and MP Sedat Bucak (the only occupant to survive). Çatlı murdered countless people, and the Susurluk scandal proved state collaboration with terrorism, murder and drug-dealing. Çatlı's having been given the green light for worldwide travel was clear from the diplomatic-style passports from several countries he had with him in several names, indicating a NATO connection with Gladio, and corroborating extensive evidence that many Grey Wolves received training from NATO forces in Belgium,

²⁴ 'Counter-Guerilla' wikipedia article, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Counter-Guerrilla

²⁵ Millî İstihbarat Teşkilatı, National Intelligence Organization. Wikipedia article on Abdullah Çatlı.

the UK and other countries. The repercussions of Susurluk affected the US ambassador to Turkey Marc Grossman, who left this posting soon afterwards, and Major Douglas Dickerson, military attaché to the embassy. These two (along with Dickerson's wife Melek Can Dickerson, Edmonds' colleague at the FBI) are understood to have been orchestrating Gladio operations in Turkey and far beyond.²⁶

By contrast, Abdullah Öcalan, a key founder of the PKK, was captured early in 1999 through the cooperation of many countries' intelligence agencies. In 1998, from his base in north Syria, he was forced to leave by the Syrian government, which was under pressure from Turkey, which had threatened to stop the flow of water in the Tigris river after building the Ataturk dam. He travelled to Russia, Italy and Greece, none of whose governments allowed him to stay. Offered asylum in South Africa by Nelson Mandela, he was flown instead from Greece to Kenya, and was arrested from the Greek embassy in Nairobi through the combined forces of the CIA and MIT, and flown to Turkey with Israeli help, where he was condemned to death. This sentence was soon commuted to life imprisonment on İmralı island in the Sea of Marmora. Peace in Kurdistan and the Free Öcalan campaign have sent peace delegations to Turkey over several years. ²⁷ Öcalan's books, written in jail and translated into Spanish, English and other languages, have had a major impact in terms of rethinking democracy to place the central focus on women's rights, as well as questioning capitalism and the nation state through 'democratic confederalism'. ²⁸

Collaboration between Turkey's MIT and ISIS has been well-documented, along with NATO allies' toleration of this.²⁹ The MIT has played a many-sided role in anti-Kurdish operations, from assassinating three Kurdish women activists in Paris in January 2013 to presenting plans for more incursions into Rojava.³⁰ The listing of the PKK as a 'terrorist' organization by most but not all governments acts as a major obstacle to peace,³¹ and masks

²⁶ 'An inconvenient Patriot', Wikispooks at

https://wikispooks.com/wiki/Document:An_Inconvenient_Patriot; Edmonds 2012.

²⁷ I was on the İmralı delegation that visited Turkey in February 2020. The Report on this visit, detailing numerous human rights abuses etc., can be found at

http://www.freeocalan.org/articles/english/2020-international-peace-delegation-to-imrali-report. I have written several reviews of Öcalan's books (Padel 2012, Padel et al. 2018).

²⁸ Öcalan 2007, 2020, Padel 2012, Padel et al. 2018, Miley et al. 2018.

²⁹ Ahmed 2019, Broomfield 2022. ISIS, 'Islamic State of Iraq and Syria', or ISIL, 'Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant', has officially been just 'Islamic State' since 2014.

³⁰ Stockholm Center for Peace 2018, Turkish Minute 2021, Coskun 2021. Turkish invasions and occupation of northern Syria started with Afrin in 2018, and northern Iraq more systematically in 2109. Rojava's official name is presently the Autonomous Administration of North and East Syria.

³¹ Diaz 2021. The first trials of PKK members in any European country took place in Germany, lasting from 1989 to 1995 in Düsseldorf. Many saw these as a 'show trial', and they promoted the view of the PKK as a terrorist organization. In the analysis of Duran Kalkan, a senior PKK official who was

continuous state terror by the Turkish security forces in Syria/Rojava and Iraq, as well as in Turkey, where many journalists, academics and others have been jailed on fabricated charges.32

As examples of Turkey's notorious false-flag attacks, Selahattin Demirtas, ³³ like many others in Turkey, blamed the MIT for the series of bombings during mid-2015 in Divarbakır (5 June) and Suruç (20 July), where over thirty young volunteers were killed who were about to cross the border into Rojava bringing aid to Kobane, then under attack by ISIS, as well as in Ankara (10 October), where over 120 peace demonstrators were killed (Hurriyet 2015, Hafiza Merkezi 2015).

Among the world's worst unresolved military conflicts, we witness almost unbearable warfare over large areas of Kurdistan. In Turkey, a situation of huge repression (UK Home Office Report of Fact-Finding Mission 2019), with hundreds of HDP (People's Democratic Party) members in jail, despite electoral gains; somewhat similar repression in Iran, with frequent jailings and armed conflict (Glynn 2020); and in Kurdish areas in northern Syria and Iraq, huge violence from Turkish invasion and occupation.³⁴ 'Ethnic cleansing' here has involved settling jihadist fighters affiliated with ISIS and similar extremist organizations in areas where Kurdish communities have been violently displaced. How have Turkish forces been allowed to get away with this? Why has there been so little protest by foreign governments? Why so little media coverage, considering the gravity of attack on civilians and civil society (Sweeney 2021)? And what has been the role of intelligence agencies (Andrew et al. 2021), both in specific operations and in this marginalization from world coverage?

Disinformation by IAs seems nowhere clearer than on the vexed issue of the Syrian White Helmets, which takes us to the heart of the propaganda war on Syria. In December 2017 the *Guardian* published a defence against many critics of the organization (Solon 2017). This was immediately attacked for numerous factual errors by Eva Bartlett, Tim Hayward and several others, but the Guardian did not print these replies to Solon's article.³⁵ The White Helmets' funders include the British, US and other governments, and the pattern of entities involved in funding makes clear its links with vested interests that are trying to bring down

imprisoned during these years, Germany has remained an intrinsic part of Turkey's war on the Kurds, with the Gladio network and numerous arms sales to Turkey obvious links (KCK 2018).

³² Rojava Information Center 2021, *Kurdistan 24* 2021, Kurdish Washington Institute 2021.

³³ Selahattin Demirtas was co-leader of the HDP 2014-18, when the HDP came 4th in Turkey's 2015 election with 13.1% of the vote. He has been in jail (like hundreds of other HDP members, including elected mayors and MPs) since 2016, but was the HDP's candidate in the 2018 presidential election. ³⁴ Defence Spot 2021, Glynn 2021.

³⁵ Bartlett 2018, Hayward 2018, Off-Guardian 2018.

the Syrian government (Politically Incorrect News 2019). The foreign-funded Free Syrian Army quickly dissolved into the various jihadist groups (Hersch 2014) fighting not only the Syrian government but also the Rojava Kurdish-led administration. By 2025 many reports were showing that Turkish intelligence (primarily MIT) was funding Islamic State and other jihadist groups, just as it is blamed for many 'false-flag attacks' within Turkey itself (Reuters 2013, Başaran 2017).

Tim Anderson (2016) makes a convincing case that from 2011 the 'Arab Spring' rebellion in Syria was orchestrated by foreign agents provocateurs, involving the CIA and other countries' intelligence agencies. In particular, all the intelligence that Assad's government has used chemical weapons appears to have been concocted through the White Helmets and associated outlets (Connelly 2018). In other words, the Syrian war is exceptionally dirty in its far-reaching use of propaganda by intelligence agencies, in collusion with the White Helmets (Norton 2020),³⁶ while well-documented use of chemical weapons by the Turkish military against Kurds in northern Iraq have been ignored by mainstream media (Sweeney 2021). Despite repeated calls to investigate this systematic use of chemical weapons by Turkish forces (Roustopoulos 2021), there is no mainstream media coverage, in extraordinary contrast to the alleged chemical weapons attacks by Syrian forces.

Many news reports have outlined the role of MI5 and MI6 in allowing jihadists to go and fight in Libya and Syria, including the father of the Manchester bomber, while getting Britons who fought with Kurds against jihadists jailed.³⁷ Other investigations claim that the BBC has invested heavily in promoting the White Helmets, in collusion with the British secret services, in line with the pattern of propaganda apparent in the Integrity Initiative (Klarenburg 2021, Elmaazi and Blumenthal 2018). A key role by Israeli intelligence is implied in news reports that wounded Al Nusrah or ISIS fighters have been treated in Israel, which has supplied arms to the jihadists to undermine the Syrian government.³⁸

The PKK, though still counted as 'terrorists', were credited with saving the Yazidis in the Sinjar mountains when ISIS attacked them so brutally in 2014 and the Iraqi Peshmarga failed to protect them. Turkey's attack on thousands of Kurdish civilians and the PKK in the Qandil and Zagros mountains of north Iraq, which started in 2007 and escalated hugely from 2019,

³⁶ Mazzetti et al. 2017, Beeley 2018, John Pilger's Foreword to Edwards and Cromwell 2018.

³⁷ Dearden 2015 and 2019, *Middle-East Eye* 2018.

³⁸ Foreign Policy 2014, Sengupta 2017, Haaretz 2019.

has met with near silence in mainstream media, in contrast with periods of constant, one-sided reports on Syrian government forces attacking civilians in East Ghouta and Idlib.³⁹

Over 40,000 ISIS fighters with their wives and children remain stranded in prison camps in Rojava, which foreign governments refuse to take responsibility for (Human Rights Watch 2021). At least 200,000 Kurds displaced by the Turkish invasion of Afrin remain in refugee camps in other parts of Rojava, though Rojava's political structure encourages inter-ethnic solidarity with Arabs, Christians, Turkomans and other communities. ⁴⁰ From these perspectives, it seems that the intelligence agencies of the UK and US, among other countries, bear considerable responsibility for the horrors of the Syrian war and refugee crisis.

Unravelling conspiracies

When Turkish forces have supported jihadists so openly, with so little criticism from their NATO allies, it is hard not to see a conspiracy of intelligence agencies in allowing this rise of ISIS, following the history of black operations back to Gladio and the overthrow of Mossadeq (Edmonds 2013).

Colin Wallace left the Information Research Department when he was ordered to become involved in MI5's secret campaign to smear Harold Wilson as a KGB agent while he was Labour Prime Minister. The role of intelligence agencies in discrediting Jeremy Corbyn, making him 'unelectable' as a perceived 'national security liability', seems equally apparent. ⁴¹ Corbyn made frequent astute and sensitive statements about the invasion of Kurdish areas when other world leaders and media were silent (Sykes 2019), just as he highlighted the Palestinian situation.

The age of surveillance capitalism (Zuboff 2019) illustrates the way intelligence agency thinking has permeated many aspects of daily life. The ruthless manufacture of disinformation by US corporations is laid bare in John Perkins' Confessions of an economic hit man, promoting false economic forecasts that tempted 'developing countries' into committing themselves to destructive projects through unrepayable debt (Perkins 2004/2018). Similarly, we have seen how closely the CIA collaborated to serve the interests of US arms companies, and Chris Hedges asks how far arms companies have driven the expansion of NATO and fuel

³⁹ Washington Post 2014, McKernan 2021.

⁴⁰ Medya TV daily broadcast 14 March 2022.

⁽https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#inbox/FMfcgzGmvTrlTzGmgSgqfsWdJlJHvnWQ?projector=1); interview with Elif Ronahi, female member of the KCK (Tukish Communities Union) General Presidential Council, about the Turkish state`s Policy of Genocide, KCK-info, 15 March 2022, at https://kck-info.com/interviews-mar22-elifronahi-video/

⁴¹ Edwards and Cromwell 2018, Elmaazi and Blumenthal 2018, Curtis 2020.

the war in Ukraine (Hedges 2022). Certainly, the CIA has made devious use of Ukrainian war criminals, protecting them from prosecution and giving them false identities to promote anti-Russian militias from the 1940s to 2022.⁴²

Whistle-blowers started to be targeted more assiduously under Obama and since. Soon after his appointment as CIA Director (2017-18), Mike Pompeo made a tirade against 'the Philip Agees of this world' and targeted Julian Assange. CIA operations against Assange have included plans to assassinate him (Blumenthal 2020, McEvoy 2021). This leads to vital questions: should journalists toe the lines dictated by intelligence agencies? Was Assange a traitor, as Pompeo and many think in the USA? Or was Wikileaks performing a vital service in bringing out the truth in an age of increasing disinformation?

Conclusion

In conclusion, an anthropology of intelligence agencies needs to elucidate many recurring patterns, starting perhaps with the consistent move from collecting 'intel' to giving out disinformation – clear since Bernays' involvement in the 1954 Guatemala regime change, and his aim of 'engineering consent' or propaganda.

Another pattern is the use of indigenous peoples in proxy wars, from the Hmong in the Vietnam war to 'off-on' CIA support for Kurds in Iraq, Syria and Iran. From the perspective of indigenous peoples, despite token acknowledgement that they are generally among those who live most sustainably, it is clear that there has been no concerted effort to end countless conflicts over the extraction of resources on indigenous lands. Nor has there been any attempt to confront the fuelling of armed conflicts by the arms trade, nor the systematic corruption in this trade (Feinstein 2011). The arms and mining industries are among the world's most polluting, yet neither received proper coverage in COP26, presided over by the UK government in Glasgow in November 2021 (Lakhani 2021).

A fundamental question involves the term 'intelligence'. 'Intel' as facts or 'data' is often biased, 'dumbed-down' and geared towards control. If one role of IAs is to 'gather intel', another involves putting out certain interpretations or narratives through the media. This puts a spotlight on the word 'intelligence': how intelligent are the policies promoted by these agencies? Is their main role collecting intel, or is it often to promote dubious, violent policies, especially in terms of foreign policy, that may be in their own country's interests (or the

⁴² Much of this hidden history is revealed in Oliver Stone's 2016 documentary *Ukraine on Fire*, at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LHH10jIRJmQ. Recent events are outlined in Zuesse 2014, 2018, 2022, Hahn 2018, Dinucci 2022, Rubinstein & Blumenthal 2022, Webb 2022.

interests of a national elite), but are often harmful for most people in the countries being interfered with, in terms of promoting polarization and conflict? In this sense, could it be that intelligence agencies disseminate ways of thinking that are – at least in the long-term planning for our collective future – basically profoundly unintelligent?

References (all weblinks checked March 2022)

- Agee, Philip 1975. *Inside the Company: CIA diary*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

 _____ 1978. *Dirty work: the CIA in western Europe*. New York: Barnes and Noble and Dorset Press.

 _____ 1987. *On the run*. London: Bloomsbury.
- Ahmed, Nafeez 2019. 'Erdogan worked "hand in glove" with ISIS in Syria...', *INSURGE intelligence*, 2 April, at https://medium.com/insurge-intelligence/erdogan-worked-hand-in-glove-with-isis-in-syria-claims-former-emir-e83c0e6b9c3d
- Aldrich, Richard 2010. *GCHQ*: The uncensored story of Britain's most secretive intelligence agency. London: HarperCollins.
- _____ and Rory Cormac 2016. 10: The Black Door: spies, secret intelligence and British prime ministers. London: William/HarperCollins.
- Alford, Stephen 2013. *The Watchers: a secret history of the reign of Elizabeth I.* Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Anderson, Tim 2016. *The Dirty War on Syria: Washington, regime change and resistance.*Montréal: Global Research Publishers.
- Andrew, Christopher 2018. *The secret world: a history of intelligence*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Andrew, L., Mick Mulroy and Kenneth Tovo 2021. *Irregular warfare: a case study in CIA and US Special Army operations in Northern Iraq, 2002-03*, Middle East Institute (Washington DC) 12 August, at https://www.mei.edu/publications/irregular-warfare-case-study-cia-and-us-army-special-forces-operations-northern-iraq
- Bamford, James 2008. The Shadow Factory: the ultra-secret NSA from 9/11 to the eavesdropping on America. New York and London: Doubleday.
- Bartlett, Eva 2018. 'How the mainstream media whitewashed Al-Qaeda and the White Helmets in Syria', *Global Research*, 6 January at

- https://ingaza.wordpress.com/2018/01/06/how-the-mainstream-media-whitewashed-al-qaeda-and-the-white-helmets-in-syria/
- Bar-Zohar, Michael, and Nissim Mishal 2016. *Mossad: the greatest missions of the Israeli Secret Service*. London/Mumbai: Biteback/Jaico.
- Başaran, Ezgi 2017. Frontline Turkey: the conflict at the heart of the Middle East. London: I.B. Tauris.
- Bayly, Chris 1996. *Empire & information: intelligence gathering and social communication,* 1780-1870. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- BBC 1992. *Operation Gladio: state-sponsored terror*. London: BBC Timewatch [3-part documentary], at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AUvrPvV-KQo
- Beeley, Vanessa 2018. 'Pierre le Corf speaks on war propaganda and white helmets from Aleppo', 18 Feb, at https://thewallwillfall.org/2018/02/13/pierre-le-corf-speaks-on-war-propaganda-and-white-helmets-from-aleppo/
- Bergman, Ronen 2008. The secret war with Iran: the 30-year covert struggle for control of a 'rogue' state, translated by Ronnie Hope. New York and London: Simon & Schuster, Oneworld.
- _____ 2018. Rise and kill first: the secret history of Israel's targeted assassinations. London: John Murray.
- Bernays, Edward 1928. Propaganda. Port Washington NY: Kenniket Press.
- _____ 1955. The engineering of consent. Norman OK: University of Oklahama Press.
- Bernstein, Carl 1977. 'The CIA and the media: how America's most powerful news media worked hand in glove with the Central Intelligence Agency and why the Church Committee covered it up', *Rolling Stone*, 20 October, at https://www.carlbernstein.com/the-cia-and-the-media-rolling-stone-10-20-1977
- Bevins, Vincent 2020. The Jakarta Method: Washington's anticommunist crusade and the mass murder program that shaped our world. New York: Hachette.
- Blumenthal, Max 2019. The management of savagery: how America's national security state fuelled the rise of Al Qaeda, ISIS and Donald Trump. London: Verso.
- 2020. "The American friends": New court files expose Sheldon Adelson's security team in US spy operation against Julian Assange', *The Grayzone*, 14 May, at https://thegrayzone.com/2020/05/14/american-sheldon-adelsons-us-spy-julian-assange/
- Broomfield, Matt 2022. 'UK rearms Turkey as Ankara backs war crimes in occupied Syria', *Declassified UK*, 2 February, at https://declassifieduk.org/uk-rearms-turkey-as-ankara-backs-war-crimes-in-occupied-syria/

- CAMPACC (Campaign Against Criminalising Communities) 2021. 20 years of terrorism acts

 20 years of injustice, London, September, at https://www.peaceinkurdistancampaign.com/campacc-report-20-years-of-terrorism-acts-20-years-of-injustice/
- Chaliand, Gerard ed. 1993. A people without a country: the Kurds and Kurdistan. London: Zed Books.
- Charles River Editors 2016. Operation Paperclip: the history of the secret program to bring Nazi scientists to America during and after World War II. UK: Amazon.
- Chouvy, Pierre-Arnaud 2011. *Opium: uncovering the politics of the poppy*. London: I.B. Tauris.
- Clair, Jeffrey St., and Alexander Cockburn 2017. 'Armies, addicts and spooks: the CIA in Vietnam and Laos', *Counterpunch*, 29 September, at https://www.counterpunch.org/2017/09/29/armies-addicts-and-spooks-the-cia-in-vietnam-and-laos/
- CNN 2005. 'Inquiry into leak of NSA spying program launched', 31 December, http://edition.cnn.com/2005/POLITICS/12/30/nsa.leak/index.html
- Cobain, Ian 2020. "Religious operations": How British propagandists used Islam to wage cultural Cold War', *Middle East Eye*, 28 February, at https://www.middleeasteye.net/big-story/religious-operations-how-british-propagandists-used-islam-wage-cultural-cold-war
- Connelly, Claire 2018. 'Did Assad gas his own people?' *Renegade*, 22 April, https://renegadeinc.com/assad-gas-people/
- Conversation, The 2018. 'British government's new "anti-fake-news" unit has been tried before and it got out of hand', The Conversation, 25 January, at https://theconversation.com/british-governments-new-anti-fake-news-unit-has-been-tried-before-and-it-got-out-of-hand-90650
- Corfield, Gareth 2018. "UK spies broke law for 15 years but what can you do?" shrugs judge', *The Register*, 23 July, at https://www.theregister.com/2018/07/23/investigatory_powers_tribunal_gchq_15_years_illegal_surveillance_no_penalty/
- Cormac, Rory 2018. Disrupt & deny: spies, special forces & the secret pursuit of British foreign policy. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Coskun, Orhan 2021. 'Turkey plans military action against Kurdish YPG if diplomacy fails', *Reuters*, 15 October, at https://www.reuters.com/world/middle-east/turkey-plans-military-action-against-syrian-kurdish-ypg-if-diplomacy-fails-2021-10-15/Cottrell,

Richard 2015. Gladio, NATO's dagger at the heart of Europe: the Pentagon-Nazi-Mafia axis. No place: Progressive Press. Curtis, Mark 2003. Web of deceit: Britain's real role in the world. London: Random House. 2004. *Unpeople: Britain's secret human rights abuses*. London: Vintage Publishing. 2010. Secret affairs: Britain's collusion with radical Islam. London: Serpent's Tail. 2020. 'How the UK press supports the UK military and intelligence establishment', Daily Maverick, 11 March, at https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2020-03-11-howthe-uk-press-supports-the-british-military-and-intelligence-establishment/ Das, Samarendra, and Felix Padel 2020. Out of this earth: east Indian Adivasis and the aluminium cartel. Delhi: Orient Blackswan. [new edition of Padel and Das 2010]. Dearden, Lizzie 2015. 'Jihadi John: MI5 accused of letting jihadists "slip through the net" under relaxed anti-terror laws', *The Independent*, 1st March. 2019. 'Aidan James: British fighter who battled Isis in Syria jailed for 4 years', The Independent, 7 November 2019. Defense Spot, The 2021. 'Afrin's Syrian Kurds continue to pay price of Turkey's occupation', The Defense 15 September Spot 2021, https://www.thedefensepost.com/2021/09/15/syrian-kurds-afrin/ Devereux, Ryan 2014. 'How the CIA watched over the destruction of Gary Webb', The Intercept, 25 September 2014, https://theintercept.com/2014/09/25/managing-nightmarecia-media-destruction-gary-webb/ Dezenhall, Eric 2013. 'The Devil Himself explores Mob's fight against Nazis during WWII', The Daily Beast, 13 July, at https://www.thedailybeast.com/the-devil-himself-exploresmobs-fight-against-nazis-during-wwii/ Diaz, Gorca Aligabarita 2021. 'Keeping PKK on terrorist list is an obstacle to peace', Hawar News, 13 November, athttps://www.hawarnews.com/en/haber/gorca-aligabarita-diazkeeping-pkk-on-terrorist-list-is-an-obstacle-to-peace-h27612.html Condor', Dinges, John 2004. 'Operation Latin American Studies, at https://www.latinamericanstudies.org/chile/operation-condor.htm

9780615602226.

Dinucci, Manlio 2022. 'Ukraine: it was all written in the Rand Corp Plan', Global Research. 8

Edmonds, Sibel 2012. Classified woman: the Sibel Edmonds story. ISBN-13:

March, at https://www.globalresearch.ca/ukraine-was-all-written-rand-corp-plan/5773288

- _____ 2013. *Gladio B*, on the James Corbett show, 30 January, Parts 1 and 2 at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uEu1crIqvsU and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Pi13h7fey68
- Edwards, David, and David Cromwell 2018. *Propaganda blitz: how the corporate media distort reality*. London: Pluto/Media Lens.
- Elmaazi, Mohamed, and Max Blumenthal 2018. 'Inside the temple of covert propaganda: the Integrity Initiative and the UK's scandalous propaganda war', *The Grayzone*, 17 December, at https://thegrayzone.com/2018/12/17/inside-the-temple-of-covert-propaganda-the-integrity-initiative-and-the-uks-scandalous-information-war/
- Evans, Rob, and Paul Lewis 2013. *Undercover: the true story of Britain's secret police*. London: Guardian Faber.
- Eveland, Wilbur Crane 1980 [2018]. Ropes of sand: America's failure in the Middle East. London: W.W.Norton.
- Feinstein, Andrew 2011. *The shadow world: inside the global arms trade*. London: Hamish Hamilton.
- Foreign Policy 2014. 'Exclusive: Israel is tending to wounded Syrian rebels', 11 June, at https://foreignpolicy.com/2014/06/11/exclusive-israel-is-tending-to-wounded-syrian-rebels/
- Forte, Maximillian C. 2019. 'On duty for the CIA: German Nazis and Italian Fascists', *Zero Anthropology*, https://zeroanthropology.net/2019/03/29/on-duty-for-the-cia-german-nazis-and-italian-fascists/
- Ganser, Daniele 2004. NATO's secret armies: Operation GLADIO and terrorism in Western Europe. Routledge.
- Gehlen, Reinhard 1972. *The Service: the memoirs of Reinhard Gehlen*. New York: Popular Library.
- Giladi, Naeim. 2003 [1992]. Ben Gurion's scandals: how the Haganah and the Mossad eliminated Jews. Arizona: Dandelion Books.
- Glynn, Sarah 2020. 'Denied freedom of thought and action, but Kurds are fighting back in Iran', *The National* (Scotland), 6 September, at https://www.thenational.scot/news/18700522.denied-freedom-thought-action-kurds-fighting-back-iran/
- ______ 2021 'Turkey's invasion of northern Iraq could lead to Kurdish civil war', *Open Democracy* 2 July, at https://www.opendemocracy.net/en/north-africa-west-asia/turkeys-invasion-of-northern-iraq-could-lead-to-kurdish-civil-war/

- Gordievsky, Oleg 2015. Next stop execution. London: Lume Books.
- Greenberg, Andy 2012. This machine kills secrets: how Wikileaks, Hacktivists & Cypherpunks aim to free the world's information. UK: Virgin.
- Gross, Harry 2019. 'The CIA's secret quest for mind control: torture, LSD, and a "poisoner in chief", *npr*, 9 September, at https://www.npr.org/2019/09/09/758989641/the-cias-secret-quest-for-mind-control-torture-lsd-and-a-poisoner-in-chief
- *Haaretz* 2019. 'Israel just admitted arming the anti-Assad Syrian rebels', *Haaretz*, 3 February, at https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/.premium-israel-just-admitted-arming-anti-assad-syrian-rebels-big-mistake-1.6894850
- Hafiza Merkezi 2015. 'Statements on Ankara massacre from HDP, Amnesty International and Human Rights Watch', 15 October, at https://hakikatadalethafiza.org/en/statements-from-hdp-amnesty-intl-and-human-rights-watch/
- Hahn, Gordan M. 2018. *Ukraine over the edge: Russia, the West, and the 'New Cold War'*. Jefferson NC: McFarland.
- Halbrook, Stephen 2006. 'Operation Sunrise: America's OSS, Swiss Intelligence, and the German surrender 1945', in *Operation Sunrise: Atti del convegno internazionale* (Locarno, 2005), eds. Marino Viganò and Dominic M. Pedrazzini, Lugano, pp.103-30. Available

 at https://www.stephenhalbrook.com/law_review_articles/operation_sunrise.pdf
- Hamilton-Merritt, Jane 1993/1998. *Tragic mountains: the Hmong, the Americans, and the secret wars for Laos, 1942-1992.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Hastings, Michael 2008. I lost my love in Baghdad. New York: Scribner.
- _____ 2012. The Operators: the wild & terrifying inside story of America's war in Afghanistan. London: Plume/Penguin.
- Hayward, Tim 2018. 'The *Guardian*, White Helmets, and silenced comment', *Renegade*, 18 January, at https://renegadeinc.com/the-guardian-white-helmets-and-silenced-comment/
- Hedges, Chris 2022. 'Chronicle of a war foretold', *Scheerpost*, 24 Febryary, at https://scheerpost.com/2022/02/24/hedges-the-chronicle-of-a-war-foretold/
- Herman, Edward S. 1982. *The real terror network: terrorism in fact and propaganda*. Cambridge MA: South End Press.
- _____ and Noam Chomsky 1988/2002. *Manufacturing consent: the political economy of the mass media*. New York: Pantheon.

- Hersch, Seymour 2014. 'The Red Line & the Rat Line: Obama, Erdogan & the Syrian rebels', *London Review of Books*, April, available at https://mai68.org/spip/spip.php?article7072
 [March 2022]
- Hickman, Joseph 2015. Murder at Camp Delta: a staff sergeant's pursuit of the truth about Guantanamo Bay. London/New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Human Rights Watch 2021. 'Thousands of foreigners unlawfully held in NE Syria: countries should bring citizens home; ensure due process for ISIS suspects', 23 March, at https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/03/23/thousands-foreigners-unlawfully-held-ne-syria
- Hurriyet Daily News 2015. 'HDP co-leader slams Erdoğan, gov't for attack that claimed 95 lives', 10 October, at https://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/hdp-co-leader-slams-erdogan-govt-for-attack-that-claimed-95-lives-89681
- Jacobsen, Annie 2014. Operation Paperclip: the secret intelligence program that brought Nazi scientists to the United States. New York: Little, Brown.
- _____ 2015. An uncensored history of DARPA, America's top-secret military research agency. New York: Little, Brown.
- _____ 2019. Surprise, kill, vanish: the secret history of CIA assassins, armies and operators.

 London and New York: John Murray and Little, Brown.
- Jeffery, Keith 2010. MI6: the history of the Secret Intelligence Service 1909-1949. London: Bloomsbury.
- Jones, Luke 2014. 'The time when spy agencies didn't officially exist', *BBC News Magazine*, 14 November, at https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/magazine-29938135
- Kamarck, Elaine 2021. '9/11 and the reinvention of the US intelligence community', *Brookings*. 27 August, at https://www.brookings.edu/blog/fixgov/2021/08/27/9-11-and-the-reinvention-of-the-u-s-intelligence-community/
- KCK [Kurdistan Communities Union] 2018. Interview with Duran Kalkan, at https://www.peaceinkurdistancampaign.com/germany-was-and-still-is-part-of-the-war-against-the-kurds-text-of-kck-brochure/
- Kennard, Matt, and Mark Curtis 2019. 'How the UK security services neutralised the country's leading liberal newspaper', *Daily Maverick*, 11 September, at https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2019-09-11-how-the-uk-security-services-neutralised-the-countrys-leading-liberal-newspaper/
- Khalidi, Rashid 2010. *The iron cage: the story of the Palestinian struggle for statehood.*Boston and Oxford: Beacon Press and Oneworld Publications.

- Kimmerling, Baruch, and Joel S. Migdal. 2003 [1994]. *Palestinian people: a history*. London: Harvard University Press.
- Kinzer, Stephen 2002. Crescent and star: Turkey between two worlds. New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux.
- _____ 2006. Overthrow: America's century of regime change from Hawaii to Iraq. New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux.
- _____ 2008. All the Shah's men: an American coup and the roots of Middle East terror. New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux.
- _____ 2019. Poisoner in chief: Sidney Gottlieb and the CIA search for mind control. New York: Henry Holt/Macmillan.
- Kiriakou, John 2009/2012. The reluctant spy: my secret life in the CIA War on Terror. New York: Skyhorse.
- Klarenburg, Kit 2019. 'Iranian revolution at 40: Britain's secret support for Khomeini revealed', *Sputnik News*, at http://axisoflogic.com/artman/publish/printer_83188.shtml
- _____ 2021, 'Inside the temple of covert propaganda: the Integrity Initiative and the UK's scandalous information war', *Grayzone*, 7 April, at https://thegrayzone.com/2018/12/17/inside-the-temple-of-covert-propaganda-the-integrity-initiative-and-the-uks-scandalous-information-war/
- Kollerstrom, Nick 2018. False flags over Europe: a modern history of state-fabricated terror. London, Astro.
- Kuper, Simon 2021. *The happy traitor. Spies, lies and exile in Russia: the extraordinary story of George Blake.* London: Profile Books.
- Kurdish Washington Institute 2021. 'Turkey has the largest presence in Iraq and is occupying more lands', 11 May, at https://dckurd.org/2021/05/11/turkey-presence-in-iraq/
- Kurdistan 24 2021. 'Turkey urged to release Kurdish journalist', Joint Statement by 54 organizations, Kurdistan 24, 3 November, at https://www.kurdistan24.net/en/story/26120-Turkey-urged-to-release-Kurdish-journalist
- Lakhani, Nina 2021. 'Continuation of colonialism: indigenous activists say their voices are missing at COP26', *The Guardian*, 3 November.
- Lashmar, Paul, and James Oliver 1998. 'How we destroyed Sukarno', *The Independent*, 1st December.
- Lashmar, Paul, Nicholas Gilby and James Oliver 2021. 'Slaughter in Indonesia: Britain's secret propaganda war', *The Guardian*, 17 October 2021.

- Lehr, Dick, and Gerard O'Neill 2000/2012. *Black Mass: Whitey Bulger, the FBI & the Devil's deal*. Edinburgh: Canongate.
- Levy, Adrian, and Cathy Scott Clark 2007. *Deception: Pakistan, the United States and the global nuclear weapons conspiracy*. London: Bloomsbury.
- Lindauer, Susan 2010. Extreme prejudice: the terrifying story of the Patriot Act, and the cover ups of 9/11 and Iraq: the ultimate conspiracy to silence truth. ISBN 1453642757.
- MacAskill, Ewen, Julian Borger, Nick Hopkins, Nick Davis and Jasmes Ball 2013. 'GCHQ taps fibre-optic cables for secret access to world's communications', *The Guardian*, 21 June.
- McCoy, Alfred W. 1972/2003. *The politics of heroin: CIA complicity in the global drug trade* (1st & 3rd editions). New York: Harper & Row.
- _____ 2006. A question of torture: CIA interrogation from the Cold War to the War on Terror. New York: Metropolitan Books.
- McEvoy, John 2021. 'Deathly silence: journalists who mocked Assange have nothing to say about CIA plans to kill him', *FAIR*, 8 October, at https://fair.org/home/deathly-silence-journalists-who-mocked-assange-have-nothing-to-say-about-cia-plans-to-kill-him/
- MacIntyre, Ben 2007. Agent Zigzag. London and New York: Bloomsbury.
- _____ 2010. Operation Mincemeat: how a dead man and a bizarre plan fooled the Nazis and assured an Allied victory. London and New York: Bloomsbury.
- 2012. Double Cross: the true story of the D-Day spies. London and New York: Bloomsbury.
- McKernan, Bethan 2021. 'Kurds in "mountain prison" cower as Turkey fights PKK with drones in north Iraq', *The Guardian*, 4 April.
- Manjana, Kareena, Aanam, Jyoteshwari, and Saanish, Pardhi Youth Collective, Majal, Bhopal 2022. 'We will not sit quietly: Pardhi women demand justice', *Seminar*, issue 751 edited by Malvika Gupta and Felix Padel, pp. 75-79, Delhi.
- Marks, John 1979/1991. The search for the 'Manchurian Candidate': the CIA and mind control: the secret history of the behavioural sciences. New York/London: W.W. Norton.
- Matthews, Owen 2019. *An impeccable spy: Richard Sorge, Stalin's master agent.* London: Bloomsbury.
- Mazzetti, Mark 2013. The Way of the Knife: the untold story of USA's secret war. London: Penguin.
- ______, Adam Goldman and Michael S. Schmidt. 2017. 'Behind the sudden death of a secret \$1 billion CIA war in Syria', *New York Times*, 2nd August, at

- https://www.nytimes.com/2017/08/02/world/middleeast/cia-syria-rebel-arm-train-trump.html
- Middle East Eye 2018. "Sorted" by MI5: How UK government sent British-Libyans to fight Gadaffi', 7 November, at https://www.middleeasteye.net/news/sorted-mi5-how-uk-government-sent-british-libyans-fight-gaddafi
- Melton, H. Keith, and Robert Wallace 2010. *The original CIA Manual of Trickery and Deception* [classified original by John Mulholland for MKUltra at the CIA, 1950s]. New York: HarperCollins.
- Miley, Thomas Jeffrey, and Federico Venturini eds. 2018. *Your freedom and mine: Abdullah Öcalan and the Kurdish question in Erdoğan's Turkey*. Montreal and London: Black Rose Books.
- Murray, Craig 2007. Murder in Samarkand: a British ambassador's controversial defiance of tyranny in the War on Terror. Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing Company.
- Nader, Laura 1969. 'Up the anthropologist: perspectives gained from "studying up", in D. Hyms (ed.) *Reinventing anthropology*, pp. 284–311. New York: Random House. Available at https://activistresearchmethods.wordpress.com/2016/03/28/up-the-anthropologist-perspectives-gained-from-studying-up/
- Nasser, Umar 2021. Film review: 'The man who knew too much', *UK Declassified* 4 October, at https://declassifieduk.org/the-man-who-knew-too-much/
- New York Times 1977. 'Cable sought to discredit critics of Warren Report', 26 December, at https://www.nytimes.com/1977/12/26/archives/cable-sought-to-discredit-critics-of-warren-report.html
- Norton, Ben 2020. 'Leaked docs expose massive Syria propaganda operation waged by Western govt contractors and media', *The Grayzone*, 23 September, at https://thegrayzone.com/2020/09/23/syria-leaks-uk-contractors-opposition-media/
- Öcalan 2007. *Prison writings, volumes: the roots of civilisation*, translated by Klaus Happel. London: Pluto.
- 2020. The sociology of freedom: manifesto of the democratic civilization, Vol. III. Oakland CA: Kairos, PM Press.
- Off-Guardian 2018. 'How anyone who questions the White Helmets narrative becomes the victim of the *Guardian* propaganda machine', 13 January, at https://off-guardian.org/2018/01/13/journalists-academics-attacked-in-solon-hit-piece-denied-a-platform-to-reply/

- Olson, Robert W. 1989. *The emergence of Kurdish nationalism and the Sheikh Said Rebellion, 1880-1925*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Open Culture 2015. 'George Orwell creates a list of "crypto" communists for British Intelligence Forces (1949)', *Open Culture*, 26 February, at https://www.openculture.com/2015/02/george-orwell-communist-list.html
- O'Rourke, Lindsay 2018. Covert regime change: America's secret Cold War. Ithaca NY: Cornell University Press.
- Padel, Felix 1995/2010. The sacrifice of human being: British rule and the Konds of Orissa. Delhi: Oxford University Press (new edition as Sacrificing people: invasions of a tribal landscape, Delhi: Orient BlackSwan, 2010).
- 2012. 'Kurdish quest,' Review of Abdullah Öcalan's *Prison writings: the roots of civilization, Economic and Political Weekly*, vol. 47 issue 41, 13 October. Available as 'The Kurdish quest of countering capitalism to build a democratic civilisation', at http://peaceinkurdistancampaign.com/resources/abdullah-ocalan/road-map/the-kurdish-quest-of-countering-capitalism-to-build-a-democratic-civilisation/
- _____ and Samarendra Das 2010. Out of this earth: East India Adivasis and the aluminium cartel. Delhi: Orient BlackSwan.
- Padel, Felix, Omar Sadik and Malvika Gupta 2018. Review article: 'The Kurdish quest for a democratic civilization and a sociology of freedom', *JASOonline*, Vol. X, no. 2, pp. 204-212.
- Paget, Karen 2015. Patriotic betrayal: inside story of CIA's secret campaign to enrol American students against communism. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Pappé, Ilan 2006. The ethnic cleansing of Palestine. Oxford: Oneworld Publications.
- Pearce, Martin 2016. Spymaster: the life of Britain's most decorated Cold War spy and head of MI6, Sir Maurice Oldfield. London: Penguin/Corgi.
- Pease, Linda 2018. A lie too big to fail: the real history of the assassination of Robert F. Kennedy. Port Townsend WA: Feral House.
- Perkins, John 2018 [2004]. The new confessions of an economic hit man: how America really took over the world. London: Ebury/Penguin.
- Philby, Kim 1968. *My silent war: the autobiography of a spy.* London: Penguin/Arrow. Foreword by Graham Greene.
- Philipps, Ronald 2019. A spy named Orphan: the enigma of Donald Maclean. London: Penguin/Vintage.

- *Politically Incorrect News* 2019. 'Who's funding the White Helmets?' 23 September 2019, at https://politicallyincorrect.news/2019/09/23/whos-funding-the-white-helmets/
- Price, David H. 2016. *Cold War anthropology: the CIA, the Pentagon, and the growth of dual-use anthropology*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.
- Reuters 2013. 'Millions in CIA "ghost money" paid to Afghan president's office: New York Times', 28 April.
- 2015. 'Turkish intelligence helped ship arms to Syrian Islamist rebel fighters', 21 May 2015.
- Risen, James 2006. State of war: the secret history of the CIA & the Bush administration. London: Simon & Schuster.
- Rojava Information Center 2021. 'State of the occupation: rights violations continued during the spring in Turkish-Occupied North East Syria', 31 October, at https://rojavainformationcenter.com/2021/10/state-of-the-occupation-rights-violations-continued-during-the-spring-in-turkish-occupied-nes/
- Roussopoulos, Dimitrios I. 2021. 'We must have a "very high-level" delegation of experts to examine Turkey's alleged chemical weapons use in Iraq', *Peace in Kurdistan*, 12 November, at https://www.peaceinkurdistancampaign.com/we-must-have-a-very-high-level-delegation-of-experts-to-examine-turkeys-alleged-chemical-weapons-use-in-iraq-says-political-activist-dimitrios-i-roussopoulos/
- Rubinstein, Alex, and Max Blumenthal 1922. 'How Zelensky made peace with Neo-Nazis', *The Grayzone/ Consortium News* vol. 27 no. 67, 4th March, at https://consortiumnews.com/2022/03/04/how-zelensky-made-peace-with-neo-nazis/
- Ruppert, Michael C. 2004. *Crossing the Rubicon: the decline of the American empire at the end of the age of oil.* Gabriola Island BC (Canada): New Society Publishers.
- Sampson, Anthony 1993. *The essential anatomy of Britain*. London and New York: Harvest. [1st edition of *Anatomy of Britain* 1962]
- _____ 2004. Who runs this place? The anatomy of Britain in the 21st century. London: John Murray.
- Scahill, Jeremy 2007. *Blackwater: the rise of the world's most powerful mercenary army*. London and New York: Serpent's Tail/Perseus Books.
- _____ 2013. *Dirty wars*. New York: Perseus/Nation Books.
- _____ 2016. The assassination complex: inside the US Government's secret drone warfare programme. New York and London: Simon & Schuster/Serpent's Tail.

- Schlesinger, Stephen and Stephen Kinzer 2005. *Bitter fruit: the story of the American coup in Guatemala*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press and David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies. [1st edition 1990]
- Sengupta, Kim 2017. 'Priti Patel visited a hospital that treats jihadis this is in Israel's interests but not the UK's', *The Independent*, 9 November.
- Shaw, Mark 2020. Denial of justice: Dorothy Kilgallen, abuse of power, and the most compelling JFK assassination investigation in history. New York: Post Hill Press.
- Smith, Matthew 2013. *Who killed Kennedy? The definitive account of 50 years of conspiracy*. Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing.
- Smith, Michael. 2010. *The anatomy of a spy: a history of espionage & betrayal*. Cheltenham: History Press.
- Snowden, Edward 2019. Permanent record. London: Macmillan.
- Solon, Olivia 2017. 'How Syria's White Helmets became victims of an online propaganda machine', *The Guardian*, 18 December.
- Spartacus Educational [no date]. 'Operation Mockingbird', at https://spartacus-educational.com/JFKmockingbird.htm
- Stockholm Center for Peace 2018. 'Turkey's captured MİT officials says killings of 3 Kurdish women in Paris approved by President Erdoğan', 10 January, at https://stockholmcf.org/turkeys-mit-officers-captured-by-outlawed-pkk-make-revelations-on-paris-killings/
- Summers, Anthony 1980/2013. *Not in your lifetime: the assassination of JFK* (originally *Conspiracy*). UK: Headline Publishing Group.
- Sweeney, Steve 2021. 'Turkey accused of using "chemical warfare agents" again in its ongoing war on Kurds', *Morning Star* 31 May 2021, https://morningstaronline.co.uk/article/w/turkey-accused-using-chemical-warfare-agents-again-its-ongoing-war-kurds
- Sykes, Ed 2019. 'Corbyn says sanctions on Turkey could be needed if "appalling" attacks on Kurdish areas of Syria continue', *The Canary*, 11 October, at https://www.thecanary.co/global/world-news/2019/10/11/corbyn-says-sanctions-on-turkey-could-be-needed-if-appalling-attacks-on-kurdish-areas-of-syria-continue/
- Tagliabue, John 1994. 'How Don Calo (and Patton) won the war in Sicily', New York Times, 24 May, at https://www.nytimes.com/1994/05/24/world/villalba-journal-how-don-calo-and-patton-won-the-war-in-sicily.html

- Talbot, David 2015. *The Devil's Chessboard: Allen Dulles, the CIA, and the rise of America's secret government.* New York/London: HarperCollins.
- Thomas, Mark 2007. 'Martin and me', The Guardian
- https://www.theguardian.com/world/2007/dec/04/bae.armstrade
 [on Martin Hogbin, spy who infiltrated Campaign Against the Arms Trade]
- Timeline 2021. 'When the CIA recruited Nazis to fight the Cold War', 25 November, at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MxIj8M36wkk
- Todd, Paul, Jonathon Bloch and Patrick Fitzgerald 2009. *Spies, lies and the war on terror*. London: Zed Books.
- Tuhiwai Smith Linda. 1999/2012. *Decolonizing methodologies: research and Indigenous People*. London: Zed Books.
- Turkish Minute 2021. 'Former intel chief strengthens suspicions of MIT role in killing of 3 Kurdish women in Paris', 19 February, at https://www.turkishminute.com/2021/02/19/intel-chief-strengthen-suspicions-of-mit-role-in-killing-of-3-kurdish-women-in-paris/
- UK Home Office Report of Fact-Finding Mission: *Turkey: Kurds, the HDP and the PKK*, June-October 2019, at https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/850840/turkey-ffm-report-2019.pdf
- War history online 2016. 'Polish codebreakers cracked Enigma in 1932, before Alan Turing', May, at https://www.warhistoryonline.com/featured/polish-mathematicians-role-in-cracking-germans-wwii-codesystem.html
- Washington Post 2014. 'A US-designated terrorist group is saving Yazidis and battling the Islamic State', 11 August, at https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2014/08/11/a-u-s-designated-terrorist-group-is-saving-yazidis-and-battling-the-islamic-state/
- Webb, Whitney 2022. 'Ukraine and the new Al Qaeda', MR online 10 March, at https://mronline.org/2022/03/10/ukraine-and-the-new-al-qaeda/
- Weir, Alison 2014. Against our better judgement: the hidden history of how the U.S. was used to create Israel. ISBN-13: 978-1495910920.
- Wilford, Hugh 2008. *The Mighty Wurlitzer: how the CIA played America*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.
- Williams, Paul L. 2018. *Operation Gladio: the unholy alliance between the Vatican, the CIA and the Mafia.* New York: Prometheus Books.

- Williams, Susan 2021. White malice: the CIA and the covert recolonization of Africa. London: Hurst.
- Woodman, Connor 2018. Spycops in context: a brief history of political policing in Britain, Centre for Crime and Justice Studies, December, at https://www.crimeandjustice.org.uk/sites/crimeandjustice.org.uk/files/Spycops%20in%20 context%20%E2%80%93%20a%20brief%20history%20of%20political%20policing%20in%20Britain_0.pdf
- Woods, Randall B. 2013. *Shadow Warrior: William Egan Colby and the CIA*. New York: Basic Books.
- Woodward, Bob 2010. Obama's wars: the inside story. London: Simon & Schuster.
- Wright, Peter 1987. Spycatcher: the candid autobiography of a senior intelligence officer. New York: Bantam Doubleday Dell Publishing Group.
- Zuboff, Soshana 2019. The age of surveillance capitalism: the fight for a human future at the new frontier of power. London: Profile Books.
- Zuesse, Eric 2014. 'Meet Ukraine's master mass murderer, Mitriy Yarosh', 19 November 2014, at https://rinf.com/alt-news/breaking-news/meet-ukraines-master-mass-murderer-dmitriy-yarosh/
- 2018. 'How and why the U.S. Government perpetrated the 2014 coup in Ukraine', Modern Diplomacy, 4 June, at https://vladtepesblog.com/2022/03/10/oliver-stone-ukraine-on-fire-from-2016/
- 2022. 'Britain's *New Statesman* magazine lies about both Ukraine & Russia. Why?' *Oriental Review* 14 March, at https://orientalreview.org/2022/03/14/britains-new-statesman-magazine-lies-about-both-ukraine-russia-why/