I. Introduction

It has been maintained in a number of studies, some of which have already appeared in print, some of which are still in press or forthcoming,\(^1\) that the form of Balinese life in Pagutan, western Lombok, is a totality. It is now opportune (January 1986) to draw together the findings of these studies of various aspects of this form of life, studies which have come to demonstrate this contention conclusively.

Aspect in the present and earlier studies refers to what are more usually called 'elements' or 'areas' of social life. However, the data upon which this essay is based were collected during the course of about twenty-one months' field research in Pagutan, western Lombok. This work was funded by the Social Science Research Council of Great Britain and the Esmelie Horniman Anthropological Scholarship Fund, to which bodies I am indebted for their support. Parts of this paper were read to Professor Telgo Yoshida's graduate class at Keio University; I am most grateful to Professor Yoshida for the opportunity thus given to me and for the helpful comments and advice which he has offered me, and for the lively response of his students. Unless otherwise specified, 'Balinese' in this study refers to the Balinese resident in Pagutan.

\(^1\) So as not to burden the text with references to studies which are in press or forthcoming, only published work is cited generally. Other essays are listed in the References, though all as forthcoming.
here these elements or areas are indigenously defined and derive from and are replications of Ida Sang Hyang Vidhi, the high god of the Balinese, as sunlight is to the sun, the goi (Bhatara) Surya.  

We shall also refer to contexts. Aspects and contexts are not all the same. The latter have come in for much discussion of late, especially in the volume Contexts and Levels (Barnes et al. [eds.] 1985), but most of what has been said has not clarified the notion very much. Hobart (1985), indeed, demonstrates the impossibility of saying anything very definitive about the notion.

Dumont, according to Barnes (1985: 10), suggests that "where empiricists are satisfied with identifying contexts, structuralists ought further to recognize levels": Dumont writes (1982: 225) that "it is not enough...to speak of different "contexts" as distinguished by us, for they are foreseen, inscribed or implied in the ideology itself. We must speak of different "levels" hierarchized together with the corresponding entities" (emphasis added).

There is an unfortunate dogmatism here; and an idiosyncracy in the use of these terms, the meanings of which are anyway hard to pin down (cf., e.g., Allen 1985: 21), which makes their application in the analysis of social facts at least problematical.

If, further, "Dumont's idea of hierarchical levels is an analytic construct" (Barnes 1985: 10) while levels are not "abstract theoretical constructs invented by anthropologists" but "social facts as Durkheim defines them and they assert themselves out of the ethnographic observation of specific societies" (Iteanu 1985: 91), it is a little hard to know how to proceed.

Notwithstanding Dumont's assertion, therefore, we shall have recourse to context in what follows. If that makes this study empiricist, so be it: the task is to try to make sense of a form of life, not to bother about what other people might term the attempt. In any case, what follows is "structuralist".

Contexts refer to the following kinds of situation: two (or more) parties coming together to exchange goods and/or services for goods and/or services and/or cash; a temple festival (piodalan); the joining of a male and a female in the rites of marriage (nganten); two senior priests meeting; ideological relations that obtain between the four estates (varna);  and such like.

---

2 This usage of 'aspect' is discussed at some length in Duff-Cooper forthcoming (e).

3 The four estates are Brahmana, Ksatrya, Vésia and Sudra. The first three are the trivangsa, or Dalem, 'insiders'; the Sudra are Jaba, 'outsiders'. Guermonprez suggests (1985: 62) that the Brahmana 'constituent dans l'ensemble des trivangsa la classe la plus "intérieure", homologue à l'espace le plus sacrifié (jeroan) d'un sanctuaire, tandis que les Sudra sont rejetés dans l'extériorité homologue à l'espace profane entourant le mur d'enceinte d'un temple'. This suggestion is a limited version of the explana-
These contexts, and many others, are not simply distinguished by the anthropologist; they are isolated as such by Balinese people. These contexts naturally take place within the totality of villagers' way of life, and they are abstractions: some matters are not considered relevant to their constitution, although they are premised on the other contexts which constitute the various aspects of the Balinese forms of life.

The ways in which contexts and levels are comparable (if any) remain to be decided (cf. Barnes 1985: 10). Such decision will, of course, depend in the first place on what levels (and contexts) are taken to be.

So levels form no part of the enquiry which follows. Nor does 'hierarchy': if this term is defined fashionably as encompassment of the contrary or opposite (Dumont 1980: 239; cf. p. 242), then the Balinese form of life is not hierarchical (Duff-Cooper 1985c: 138). The notion of encompassing is anyway a metaphor based on a number of questionable assumptions, artfully sketched by Mark Hobart (1985: 49), which make it at least suspect as an analytical term.

Terms such as 'equal', 'unequal', '(social) inequality', do not appear as analytical terms either. These terms have meaning only by being defined by the social facts they are meant to elucidate, but it is these facts which such elucidation is supposed to move away from. Further, as MacClancy remarks (1985: 147), such terms may not (in my view, most probably do not) tell us more than is already apparent from the social facts under scrutiny.

The instruments we shall rely on to find a way through this form of life are: duality; juxtaposition and contingency; symmetry and asymmetry; alternation; reversal/inversion.

These basic concepts have proved useful both in the analysis of the Balinese form of life and of others. It should be emphasised that in the main they correspond with indigenous Balinese notions more or less directly and that they have been deduced from social facts considered in earlier studies, not imposed on them.

Duality is the Balinese god Rwa-Bhinéa. Duality is the division of a unity into two entities (e.g. Needham 1985: 138) which are juxtaposed or contingent. Juxtaposed means that these constituent parts, which may number more than two (see below), are close together or side by side in particular contexts; contingent means that such entities are in contact or tangential in such contexts. This unity in duality, represented archetypally by Ardhanáñáśvara, the bisexual icon, and a representation of Vidhi, may be expanded by division into three, four, five, and numerically more complex forms up to eleven. Only Balinese notions of duration (see Howe 1981) and Balinese ideas of descent (see n.12) (e.g. Duff-Cooper 1984a; 1985f: 77-80) evince division into numbers greater than eleven.

When two or more entities are juxtaposed or contingent, the
relations that obtain between them may be either symmetrical or asymmetrical. By symmetrical is meant that the related entities are interchangeable or substitutable one for another (cf., e.g., Weyl 1952: 16-17).

Total or complete interchangeability is represented in Balinese collective representations by Ida Sang Hyang Sunya, the Void, where 'Void' means that none of the characteristics of the phenomenal world are present. Symmetry of less completeness, however, exists in other forms as social facts in everyday Balinese life. Such symmetry exists only when the ideological distance of the entities so related, relative to a centre of reference - such as a group of gods, temples, an origin-point (kawitan), or what have you - are almost identical according to certain indigenous criteria. Which centre of reference is taken as the bearing against which the relative standing of two or more entities is gauged depends upon the context.

In cases where ideologically and, generally, physically speaking one entity is significantly further from a centre of reference than another, it accords better with indigenous criteria of assessment to describe the relations that obtain between the entities in terms of asymmetry. Thus, whereas the relations that obtain between a Pedanda Siva and a Pedanda Boddha, both of the finest (Brahmana) estate, who are related as male is to female (Duff-Cooper 1984b: 18-19), symmetrical, the relations that obtain between a Pedanda and a king (Anak Agung in Pagutan), related as elder to younger, an analogue of the male/female dyad, are more appropriately described in terms of asymmetry. This fact derives from the king being of the Ksatrya estate, which is ideologically more distant from the high gods and other mystical centres than the Brahmana estate.

In the Balinese form of life, such asymmetrical relations are discernible to what have been termed four degrees. (In the example just given, the relations are to the first degree of asymmetry.) These forms of asymmetry are what might be called expansions of complete or perfect symmetry (cf. Weyl 1952: 13), represented, it will be recalled, by the Void. These relations are represented either horizontally or vertically. In such representations, when an even number of entities are related, the centre of reference is

---

4 This social fact translates into: Pedanda Siva is to Pedanda Boddha as male is to female (in some contexts). Tcherkezoff suggests that this analogy, and others of similar form, is 'meaningless' (1985: 62). This assertion is incorrect. The social fact means that the relations that obtain between a Pedanda Siva and a Pedanda Boddha are 'perfectly' similar to the relations that obtain between male and female in certain contexts. Of course, the full meaning of this statement (which was made to me, though in a less formal idiom, by my first host in Pagutan, Pedanda Gde Made Karang) is given by a holistic study of the form of life in question. For such studies of the Balinese form of life, see Howe 1980 for Bali and Duff-Cooper 1983a for Lombok.
putative; when an odd number of such entities are related, the relevant centre of reference is implicated explicitly as forming a constituent part of the unity in question.5

When an entity is divided into two, the constituent entities may alternate; in Balinese 'there are words which are to some degree equivalent to "alternation"... and which ... convey in common a complex of senses that includes most prominently the notions of change, substitution, series' (Needham 1983: 126), 'all of which are implicated by "alternation"' (Duff-Cooper forthcoming, a). More complex modes of periodicity, numerically speaking, such as three, four, five, and nine, represent dynamically their concomitant forms of partition. These modes of periodicity may be considered as expansions of alternation, as partition into three, four, etc., are expansions of duality.

Different forms of division may be reversed or inverted. Since 'the notion of reversal and inversion does not denote a simple relation with a strict formal definition' (Needham 1983: 117), it must be said here that such reversals and inversions are generally enantiomorphic, that is, of the form \([a, b, c \leftrightarrow c, b, a]\). In this formula, \(a\), \(b\), and \(c\) are entities which are related, either horizontally or vertically in particular contexts. These contexts are represented by the brackets.

The sign\(\leftrightarrow\) stands for transformation: it signifies that transformation may occur in either direction, as it were, depending on the viewpoint adopted. For instance, in the middle world, male (lanang/maani6)-female (istri/luh) is the correct order; when speaking of the metaphysical world, female-male (pradhana purusa) is correct. Similarly, where \([a, b, c]\) signifies the three syllables (tri aksara \(\text{AN}, \text{UN}, \text{MAN}\)) of Brahma, Visnu and Siva respectively, which constitute the mantra \(M\), this order signifies, for example, the order of the syllables as said by Brahmana and Ksatrya Pedanda; the reverse order is that of mantra used by a witch (\(\text{leak}\)). But which is the reverse of which depends on which is adopted as the correct order. Generally, this order is taken to be the former, but not of course if one is a Balinese witch. The notation should reflect such social facts.7

The commas between the letters on each side of the formula (which may of course number more or less than three, according to the empirical case being represented) stand for relations which may be symmetrical or of one of the four degrees of asymmetry. In

---

5 I cannot say whether this finding is correlated with the odd series of numbers being to the even series as, for instance, life is to death.

6 See, for example, Duff-Cooper 1985b, n.4.

7 Only one example of reversal has been discerned in Balinese life which is not enantiomorphic. This reversal, though, appears to be simply a version of Needham's formula V (1983: 116).
general, where three entities are represented, the first comma represents asymmetrical relations to the first degree, the second comma such relations to the second degree, the first obtaining between \( a \) or \( c \) and \( b + c \) or \( a \), the second between \( a \) or \( c + b \) and \( c \) or \( a \) (Duff-Cooper in preparation, Table 6).

All or part of this set of basic concepts, and expansions of them, frame the aspects of Balinese life considered below. Before we proceed to this consideration, one question remains to be dealt with: how are these aspects concatenated? The relations which frame these aspects are social facts which, following Durkheim, we should treat as though they were things (cf., e.g., Needham 1983: 20). Now, of any two things it can be said that they are in some respects alike and in some respects dissimilar (cf. Hampshire 1959: 31). But only if the relations obtaining within two or more dyads are perfectly similar can it be said of the dyads in question that they are analogues of one another. It could, of course, be established that in some regard the relations we will be dealing with are similar, though whether they are 'perfectly' so depends on what this word is taken to mean. Even given that this meaning could be established beyond question, however, and the relations determined as perfectly similar, this would only be the case from one point of view. From a different point of view, it could be established also that they are not perfectly similar.

It is more profitable to adopt this latter course, so that it transpires that we are dealing not simply with a set of analogous relations, but with a set constituted of sets of analogues, the relations within the dyads constituting which are either symmetrical or of one of four degrees of asymmetry (see Duff-Cooper, op. cit.). The question then becomes (below, Section V) how these sets of analogous relations are systematized.

The aspects which are examined below, and the examination of them, are not of course exhaustive: both are logically impossible (Hampshire, op. cit.); and in any case, the circumstances of the field research during which the data examined in this study were collected were such, in common presumably with that of all field workers, as to make it impossible to deal with everything.

The aspects addressed move from the most extensive to the most particular and are divided, for convenience, into three parts: Section II, the Balinese nation, the realm, the desa (agglomeration of villages),\(^8\) the village (kekliangan), and local descent groups; Section III, matters concerning an empirical individual's conception, gestation, birth, childhood, adulthood and old age, death (burial and cremation) and rebirth, including 'economic' relations and subsistence activities; Section IV, aspects of an individual's 'private' life, such as sex, dreams, daydreams and fantasies, visions and entertainments; and finally Section V, which assesses previous sections and suggests some of their implications.

---

\(^8\) Pagutan is a lurah, on a par with desa, which it was before, but part of a different set of Indonesian governmental institutions (see, for example, Duff-Cooper 1983a: 52-68).
II. Nation, Realm, Village, Compound

a) The Balinese Nation (Bangsa)

Guermonprez suggests (1985: 60) that apart from the Bali Aga, generally taken to be the original inhabitants of Bali (see, for example, Covarrubias 1972: 17-26), all the Balinese have come to consider themselves as Wong Majapahit, 'People of Majapahit', although Belo suggested (1936: 12) that this appellation was appropriate only to the three senior estates (triwanga). In Guermonprez's view, therefore, this fact distinguishes the Balinese from all other people: only the Balinese are descended from a centre (noyau) given divinity under the name of Bhatar Maospahit.

Unfortunately, this view does not accord with two facts: that villagers in Pagutan never refer to themselves or to other Balinese of whatever estate as Wong Majapahit; and that villagers equate Hindu Indians - who, of course, do not derive from Majapahit - with the Balinese.

The Balinese people and Hindu Indians are distinguished from all other peoples by their closeness to the gods at the centre of Bali, Gunung Agung. This centre also includes Mount Rinjani on Lombok and Mount Semeru on Java (Duff-Cooper 1985a: 159 n.5). 'Closeness' here includes physical and ideological proximity.

The entire Balinese world is composed of aspects of the gods at the centre of the island (as just defined); all aspects of the world, including food, clothing, agricultural and other techniques, were also given to the Balinese by the gods (e.g. Soekawati 1926). The Balinese, that is, are distinguished from all others by their entire way of life (Duff-Cooper 1983b: 370). This way of life corresponds with one meaning of the Balinese notion dharma. Dharma, in this sense, is different in different places (desa), at different times (kala), and for different classes of people (patm). The Balinese hold that one should live in accord with local, current conventions as they are applicable to one's standing.

9 Cederroth describes this phrase as 'a beautifully precise and limited analytical concept' (1985: 136). This weak attempt at sarcasm cannot disguise the fact that he could hardly be more wrong: the phrase is meant to be imprecise and open-ended to allow its full exploitation in coming to terms with other aspects of Balinese ideology and social practice. And, of course, we positively eschew the method which Cederroth trumpets, which (to paraphrase him) carefully selects components of different versions of "indigenous ideology" (why the inverted commas?) and then confronts them with 'relevant analytical concepts' (ibid.). This sausage-machine approach to social facts which are wrested from their contexts distorts the social facts being scrutinised and, like the methods of Tylor and Frazer, necessarily leads to failure.

10 For an important account of this notion, see Hobart (1984).
The relationship between the Balinese (and Hindu Indians) and all others is by this criterion of an infinite (the fourth) degree of asymmetry. Yet the class of other people (anak lén) is divided into a number of classes. Indonesians (anak Java) are closest to the Balinese; combined, the Balinese and Indonesians are set against the Chinese and Japanese, classed together because, among other things, both, in villagers' view, are in their own ways brutal, and because their writing is taken to be the same; these classes, finally, are distinguished from Caucasians (turis or belanda) and 'black' people (anak selem or anak alas, people of the forests). These latter are as different from the Balinese as they consider possible. When this class of other peoples is divided in this way, the relations between the Balinese and the other classes are respectively of the first, the second, the third, and the fourth degrees of asymmetry.

The mystical head of the Balinese is the most senior Pedanda Siva. The jural head of the Balinese, once the Déva Agung of Klungkung, is now the Governor of the island-province. The relations that obtain between these two officials are asymmetrical to the first degree, and this when, as now, the Governor is Brahmana.

b) Realms (Kerajaan)
The Balinese world was traditionally divided into realms: eight on Bali and six on Lombok. A realm was also headed by a Brahmana Pedanda, whose duty (dharma) included dealing with the mystical, and a Ksatrya (or Vesia) king, whose duty was to deal with the jural: administration of the realm, war, and supporting Brahmana.11 Generally, the Brahmana was pre-eminent and was always ultimately so; in matters connected with the jural, however, the king was pre-eminent, as the Camat is today (see Duff-Cooper 1985d: 243-7). The relations that obtained between these officials were again, in either form, asymmetrical to the first degree.

A Balinese realm did not comprise a clearly defined territory nor a specific people over which the Pedanda and a king exercised authority. Rather, through 'highly unstable pyramids of authority' (Geertz and Geertz 1975: 24), lines or sub-lines of descent traced through the male line (but cf. Guermonprez 1985: 49 n.22) from particular origin points (see, for example, Duff-Cooper 1984a) were allied with a particular king. However, that there were those who exercised authority and those over whom authority was exercised is not in doubt. In this regard, also, a Balinese realm was dualistic.

c) Agglomeration of Villages (Désa or Lurah)
Realms were divided into sets of villages called désa. Pagutan is a lurah (see n.7). All désa and lurah contain three temples (kayangan tiga), which have been discussed at length elsewhere (Duff-Cooper 1985b). The relations which can be discerned as

11 Guermonprez writes (1985: 64) that the title Gusi (a Vesia appellation) was that of most of the nineteenth-century Balinese kings. This assertion contradicts Crawfurd's account (1820: 143), villagers' views, and the logic of the Balinese form of life.
obtaining among the three temples, which constitute a unity, are
dualistic and asymmetrical to the first degree [a>b]. A desa
(lurah) is headed by the priest or priests (Pemangku) of one or
more of the three temples and by the village head. These institu-
tions were thus dualistic in this regard, and the relations which
obtain between these officials are, again, asymmetrical to the
first degree.

d) A Village (Kekliangan)
A variable number of localized descent groups (seturunan or
keturunan)\(^{12}\) comprise all the members of a Balinese village. In
Baturujung, there are five. The members of these groups consti-
tute the people of (Batur) Ujung (Duff-Cooper 1985b, n.6). The
other part consists of these people's cremated forbears located
in the village temple (pamaksan).

The powers to which the farmer are subject within the village
(see Duff-Cooper 1983a, Maps 3-6) are divided between the Pemangku
of the village temple and the village council (banjar) to which,
all things being correct, all married men belong. The council is
headed by the Kliang, theoretically first among equals, but in
Baturujung very much the Head in practice. The former deals with
those aspects of village life connected with the mystical, the
latter with matters concerned with the jural. The relations that
obtain between the two are asymmetrical to the first degree.

The relations that obtain between the cremated (niskala) and
the living (sakala)\(^{13}\) members of the village, between the village
and the banjar, and between the village temple with the
banjar and the residential areas of the village are all asymmetri-
cal to the first degree (though the last is very tentative).

e) Compounds (Gría, Puri, Jero, Pakarangan)\(^{14}\)
A compound contains houses and a local descent group temple among
other physical structures (see Duff-Cooper 1985e, Figures). In the

\(^{12}\) Seturunan refers to descent through males only; keturunan re-
fers to descent through males and/or females or both. Both words
derive from *turun, to descend, fall. People to whom a Balinese
considers himself or herself to be related he or she generally
terms semetan. Hobart suggests (1983: 7) that this word derives
from 'se-metu-an, roughly "one exit" or "from one source" (here
presumably the mother, as metu is a synonym in High Balinese
for being born).'

\(^{13}\) In fact, a Balinese never dies (Duff-Cooper 1985f: 80-1).
Niskala refers to living human beings who are essential, generally
invisible, and out of time, sakala to such beings who are
material, generally visible, and in time.

\(^{14}\) The names of Brahmana, Ksatrya, Vésia and Sudra compounds re-
spectively. Villagers' compounds are addressed at some length in
Duff-Cooper 1985e.
farmer reside the material and generally visible members of the
descent group; the latter is the place (palinggihan) of the cre­
mated members of the descent group, who are generally essential
and invisible. The temple is contingent with the houses (and
other physical structures) in the compound, as the occupants of
the former are distinguished from the latter, to the first degree
of asymmetry.

This dualism may be expanded to include nine points of the
Balinese compass (nawa sanga) (see, for example, Covarrubias 1972:
296-7; Hobart 1978a, passim). In this case, the compound temple,
and not the central courtyard (natah) of the compound, is the cen­
tre of the compound (Duff-Cooper 1985e: 48). The relations that
obtain between these two areas - the compound temple and the rest
of the compound - are asymmetrical to the first degree.

A house is composed of three elements which are analogues of
the elements of which seats of Surya (padmasana), a split oandi
(temple gateway), funeral biers, the courts of a temple, the three
areas compound-gardens-ricefields, and an individual's physical
body (sthula sarira) are composed.

These elements are related dualistically one to another as in
the examples given above, where a stands for a person's head, the
compound temple, the inside court of a temple such as the
pamaksan, the compound, the roof and rafters area of a house; and
where b and c stand for the next elements from a either horizon­
tally or vertically.

These elements are inverted by demons (bhuta-kala), to give
another example (see above), who go about upside-down and who in
their guise as aspects of the demonic aspect of Siva or Kala, are
inverted in the mantra used by witches (see, for example, Duff­
Cooper 1984c: 10-14).

The inheritance (warisan) of real and other property is
through the male line. These rules are complicated, but they are
basically as follows: a deceased man's property is left to his
wife and to his unmarried male and female children in equal shares,
with the proviso that illegitimate (astra) children, i.e. children
born to the parents outside the rites of marriage (nganten), in­
herit in the ratio 1:4 with their legitimate siblings. On the
wife's death or the marriage of previously unmarried female chil­
dren of the deceased, the property is inherited in equal shares
by the other inheritors. If the deceased has no male children,
the wife and unmarried daughters inherit; this property then
passes to the deceased's closest male relative (if younger than
him) or relatives (if elder) and then to their children as these
relatives die. There are complications to these basic rules,
which may be manipulated, of course, to disinherit those who in
normal circumstances might expect to have inherited.

Yet these rules evince duality in two main ways: in the dis­
tinction between legitimate and illegitimate heirs; and between
male and female. It is noteworthy that among male heirs at least
- and distinguished as legitimate and as illegitimate - the rela­
tions which obtain between them relative to the deceased (as
aspect of their closest origin point or centre of reference) are
symmetrical, as they are in other aspects of their everyday lives.
III. Empirical Individuals (Jadma/Anak)

The material occupants of a compound may be either male, female or (male) transvestite (bancih or bantong). A transvestite is finer than males of his own or of a lower estate, from this point of view, to the first degree of asymmetry, than females, to the second degree of asymmetry. Other matters, such as the transvestite being Brahmana and a related male Sudra, or a related female menstruating, even though of the same estate as the transvestite, may expand these relations to greater degrees of asymmetry. (This example demonstrates well the 'over-riding' importance which context plays in the Balinese form of life.)

Also, transvestites and males are set against females of the same estate in many contexts to the first asymmetrical degree, although this degree may also be expanded in such circumstances as those just mentioned.

The conception of an individual is dualistic and involves the semen of a male and the blood of a female. The union of these aspects of the female and male principles (pradhana and purusa respectively) creates life. In conception, the roles of female and male are symmetrical. When males are born, however, the male principle is seen to have been pre-eminent in conception; when females are born, the female was similarly pre-eminent. When a transvestite is born, as it were, the relations between the two were symmetrical. Such is also the case when twins of the opposite sex are born. Both transvestites and opposite-sex twins who marry are replications in the material world of Ardhanarishvara, the bisexual representation of Vidhi, of the finest kind.

During gestation and birth, both parents are implicated: both are the objects of rites; the behaviour of each influences the character of the child; and the names which the child bears reflect each parent's social standing (see, for example, Duff-Cooper 1985f: 71-4). Of male and female, however, the former is ultimately pre-eminent, although the female may be pre-eminent in contexts to do with the domestic. The form of the relations obtaining between the two, however, depends on the estates and the relative ages of the two.

A person's character, although influenced by his or her parents' behaviour to one another and to others as just mentioned, is mostly determined by the configuration of the three qualities (tri guna) inside the person. These three qualities are correlated with the three bodies (tri sarira) of which any empirical individual is composed. Both these qualities and bodies are analogues of the tri sakti (dharma, karna and artha). These qualities, bodies and sakti are correlated with the four estates, as shown below:

15 Bantong is an Islamic Sasak word used by the Balinese to refer to what on Bali are generally called bancih.
Andrew Duff-Cooper

The four Balinese estates are related one to another dualistically (Duff-Cooper 1985a: 163). The constituents of an empirical individual, physically, sensationally, functionally, emotionally and intellectually, are thus all framed by dualism.

Further, the cycle from conception, gestation and birth to death and rebirth (see, for example, Hobart 1978a: 17, Figure 3), that is, from the material world to the essential world and back again, and so on, is in all but exceptional cases an alternating sequence. From another point of view (that of the substantive phases, childhood, youth, adulthood, old age, death), the sequence evinces periodicity of five; under the aspect youth, adulthood, old age - when, the Balinese say, a person walks on four legs, two legs and three legs respectively - the sequence evinces periodicity of three. Both three and five are highly significant numbers in Balinese ideology (see n.19).

The alternating sequence just mentioned is reflected in the terminology of relationship (see, for example, Duff-Cooper 1984a: 406). It is also enantiomorphic in two ways: about the five central generations (+2, +1, 0, -1, -2), and when an empirical individual is most associated with the material and visible, i.e. in the eighth and fourth ascending and descending generations and in ego's own generation (0).

The terminology can be used to deduce what Balinese notions of the family, for which there is no Balinese word, consist of. It appears to consist ideally of at least two parents and five children (Duff-Cooper 1985d: 233-5). Women are incorporated into their husbands' local descent groups after being taken in marriage. Relations of incorporation and alliance relations between a woman's husband's local descent group and the woman's natal descent group are related as male is to female. The less similar the female taken in marriage to the male by whom she is taken by reference to the male's origin points (parents, forbears in the compound temple, for instance), the greater the asymmetry in the rights and duties of the two descent groups in the context of the marriage.

The family that this couple and their children constitute consists, of course, of two generations. (The children of the couple may, of course, number more or fewer than the ideal five.) Both the relations that obtain between these two generations and between the empirical individuals of the two generations are
dualistic, either symmetrically or asymmetrically to the first
degree.

An empirical individual's social functions depend in the
main on three things: the person's estate, sex, and relative age.
Each of these ideas is dualistic. No matter to which estate an
individual belongs, the descent group of which he or she is an
aspect is related with other groups of peoples of greater or lesser
extension.

These relations often take the form of exchanges of goods
and/or services for goods and/or services and/or cash. Parsons
remarks (1975: 142) that 'exchange means, first, duality' and the
exchanges just referred to are indeed dualistic. The relations
that obtain within the dyads constituted by the parties to the
exchanges may be symmetrical or asymmetrical to one of the four
degrees of asymmetry. Whichever is the case, the relations that
obtain are correlated with the standing of the parties to the ex­
change in question relative to the centre of reference relevant
to the context. This centre is either a seller's local descent
group temple, in the case of an exchange of cash for goods and/or
services, or the descent group of the pre-eminent party in an ex-
change of goods and/or services for goods and/or services. 'Pre­
eminent' here is assessed by reference to the estates and/or re­
late ages of the parties.

Parsons also remarks (ibid.) that 'there is alternation in
exchange first one actor gives and the other receives, then the
other gives and the first receives.' This assertion holds in the
Balinese case, however, only for such traditional relations as
obtain between a Surya and his or her sisía (e.g. Duff-Cooper
1984a: 497). These relations are in principle unending, although
for contingent reasons either party may decide to sever the rela­
tions. In exchanges for goods and/or services for cash, alterna­
tion is evinced only in the trivial way described.

Part of the duty of the fourth estate (Sudra) includes agri-
culture and animal husbandry. Rice-growing and other subsistence
activities are dualistic in various ways.16 Many of the aspects
of rice-growing, further, implicate symmetry and asymmetry as
principles of order, while techniques such as hoeing and fertil­
zizing evince alternation; and the rite nuasen (see, for example,
Hobart 1978b: 69), in which the rice which is harvested first to
make an effigy of Sri, the goddess of rice, is planted (see, for
example, Hatt 1951), depends to a great extent upon the alternation
of numbers of the odd and even series, which are contrasted as
life is to death and in numerous other ways, for its significance.

The season which brings the rain which in large measure sus­
tains the seedlings planted in the fields alternates with the dry
season as sunrise alternates with the sunset. Further, the

16 For a fuller account of these activities, see Duff-Cooper
rotation of rice and secondary crops as practised by Balinese agriculturalists may be viewed, in line perhaps with indigenous ideas, either as an alternating sequence and/or as a series which repeats every five Balinese years of 210 days, i.e. as a periodicity of five.

Relations that obtain between the male and female employees of a holder of rights in ricefields are symmetrical, as are the relations that obtain between the holder of such rights and his (or very unusually her) male and female employees, although these latter relations may also be considered as asymmetrical (to the first degree), depending upon the viewpoint adopted (cf. Duff-Cooper 1983b), but only when payment is made in, say, unhusked rice (gabah) to teams (kelompok) of workers. When payment is made in cash for a person's labour, the closer the employee and the employer relative to the employer's descent group temple, the higher the employee's wages (see, for example, Hobart 1980: 145). Payment of wages is the reverse of what a buyer is expected to pay for goods and/or services by a seller.

No matter of which estate, a person and his or her local descent group have a duty to perform five kinds of rite (yadnya): for demons (bhuta), or more generally mystical beings associated with what is low, coarse, ugly, and such like; for material human beings (manusa); for 'priests' (reit); for dead material human beings (pitra); and for the gods (deva). All these rites include offerings constituted of, among other things, flowers, palm-leaf cut-outs (jahitan), sweets and cakes (jajan), fruits, cloth, money (pipis bolong), and sometimes music and dance. These constituents by their colours, their arrangement one to another, their shapes, or their forms, are wimarsa, reflectors, of Ida Sang Hyang Vidhi as a dualistic unity and as divided into three, four, five, nine, and sometimes eleven constituent parts. They

17 Rice (a), usually the new variety IR36, is grown in rotation with secondary crops (b) in a series: a, a, b, a, b, a, b, a, ....

18 A buyer who is of the same local descent group as a seller can expect to be given goods and/or services in exchange for his request for them, the gift of an opportunity to the 'seller' to give with an open hand and a ready smile (darma alus dana goya). A non-Balinese, non-Hindu Indian buyer is expected to pay the highest price for the shoddiest goods of all buyers. By contrast, an employer pays an employee of his own descent group, say, 3x; one from another village, 2x; and a non-Balinese, non-Hindu Indian employee x minus as much as possible, i.e. as little as possible.

19 They also implicate expansions of Vidhi as a dualistic unity: e.g. the trimurti and other triadic unities; the eatur (four) désa; the panaa (five) déva; the nava (nine) sanga; and the Eka dasa (eleven) Rudra, the nine gods of the nawa sanga with nadir (ketebenan) and zenith (keluanan) (see text, supra). The colours red, black and white of the trimurti, at least, are expressed dy-
therefore draw into the rites the following dyads, which are fundamental to Balinese ideology: high/low, right/left, inside/outside, upstream/downstream, north/south, east/west, male/female, older/younger, and far more besides (see, for example, Duff-Cooper 1985d, tables).

In so far as these dyads and others with which they are associated are concerned, it is not claimed that they are all transitive, i.e. that upstream is male and downstream is female, for instance; nor is it claimed that the term on each side of each dyad is homologous with the other terms on each of the same sides of the dyads. The matter of transitivity is here an empirical question, though I find it hard to imagine how the question could be resolved beyond doubt; while the question of the homology of the terms depends on the relations that obtain within the dyads being 'perfectly similar' to one another. In the Balinese case, therefore, in some contexts the terms on each side of each dyad are homologous, in other contexts, they are not all homologous.

These dyads are also implicated in such social facts as the ringing of a Pedanda's prayer bell (genta) and the beads (ganitri) made from the seeds of the wild Canna (Canna Orientalis) which he or she sometimes wears, both of which evince alternation. When a Pedanda meditates during a rite being held by some of his sisita, these people probably wear their finest clothes; at other times they generally wear clothes which are older (see, for example, Duff-Cooper 1984c: 4-6). But the form of these clothes does not differ, whatever the occasion. The pattern of the sarongs which villagers wear, such as the perang rusak (see Geirnaert-Martin n.d.: 177, 194, Figure 3), evince alternation in two ways; and the checks of the white and black poleng, used to clothe statues and other objects such as the wooden bell (kulkul) during rites, also evince alternation. Of course, they are also dualistic.

The food (gihungan) which is served during rites and which people eat communally evinces duality in men and women eating at the same time but separately in contingent locations and through the eight people (seluar) who sit together round one table to eat being equated with eight points of the Balinese compass which are basically dualistic. Alternation is evinced in various ways, both in the arrangement of what is eaten and in the courses served (cf. Duff-Cooper 1985g: passim).

Eating and defecation are contrasted as right is to left and, by analogy, therefore, as male is to female in certain contexts.20

namically through being plaited. This operation suggests that the three, like other entities created by division of a unity, were always a unity, and that the unity also was always three (or whatever).

20 Barnes appears to suggest (1985: 15) that this deduction (i.e. as eating is to defecation as right is to left, and as right is to left as male is to female, therefore eating is to defecation as male is to female) is unjustified. Barnes, however, confuses
It is a question whether these two operations constitute an exhaustive universe of discourse. If they do, then presumably urination (ngarisin) corresponds with right, defecation with left, and eating with the centre or middle (always set lightly higher than right and left in Balinese versions of partition into three) when combined with eating and defecation. 21

IV. An Empirical Individual's 'Private' Life

Balinese sexual life (see Duff-Cooper 1985h) is dualistic, implicating an enjoyed (the penetrated party) and an enjoyer (the penetrator). In sexual intercourse, and in other sexual activities, right is to left as high is to low. Moreover, the sequence of activities in intercourse alternates between one party doing something from the repertoire of activities generally practised by villagers to the other, and then vice versa. This series of actions should, in the best circumstances, begin when a male takes a female in marriage and come to an end only with the old age or with the death of one or both of the parties. When both are male, sexual exchanges may cease with the marriage of one or both of the parties, but the other exchanges which constitute the relationship braya (e.g. Duff-Cooper 1985h: 418) generally continue after the marriage of one or both of the parties.

Sexual relations are constrained by, at least, what is associated with what is higher and more to the right not being set lower than what is to the left. A person's dreams, equally, are not wholly untramelled by the social, being limited, it seems from a consideration of twelve dreams, to the dreamer's waking experience. However, dreams evince the transpositions, transi-

formal argumentation (like this syllogism) with empirical enquiry: formally speaking, this conclusion (eating is to defecation as male is to female) follows from the premises. Formally speaking, it follows that, in some contexts, at least, eating, right and male, and defecation, left and female are homologues. As before, however, whether the terms on each side of the dyads are transitive (is eating male, for example?) is an empirical question. The question whether the terms on each side of the dyads are homologues empirically speaking depends on the relations that obtain within the dyads. If these are not all symmetrical or of the same degree of asymmetry, then the sets of terms cannot be homologous. However, since these relations vary with context, there can be no one answer to this (empirical) question.

21 Needham writes that the principles of the classification under his scrutiny - opposition, proportional analogy and homology - 'permit prediction' (1985: 141). The suggestion at this point in the present study is such a prediction, which of course requires confirmation or otherwise by empirical enquiry.
tions, and 'in general all manner of inconstancy and recalcitrance to constraint' which are characteristic of such activities (Nee-
ham 1978: 64; cf. 1985: 144). However, the factors which are dis-
cernible and meaningful in dreams (according to Balinese views),
such as flight, fire, jewels, cloth and other garments, animals,
shapes, plants, colours, and 'authority figures', such as police
and army officers, are also so in the waking lives of the Bali-
nese. These factors generally depend on their relations, which are
usually dualistic, with other aspects of the Balinese world.

The daydreams and sexual fantasies to which the Balinese ad-
mit 'manipulate the asymmetries which are inherent in the rela-
tions which generally obtain between men and women' (Duff-Cooper
forthcoming, h). Furthermore, inasmuch as these daydreams and
fantasies depend on a number of dyads, such as knowledge/ignorance,
country/town, communal/individual, constant/inconstant, diligent/
lazy, cool/hot, male/female, they are (to this extent, at least)
dualistic.

The visions (ipian) which a Balinese person may have are
premised on the distinction good/evil (cf. Duff-Cooper forthcom-
ing, a: n.8) and demonstrate again the various kinds of asymmetry
that exist between the members of the four estates.

The main entertainments enjoyed by villagers - drama, shadow-
theatre (wayang) to a far lesser extent, and cock-fighting - all
include music of various kinds. They are also all forms of offer-
ing, the first two to the gods, the last to beings associated with
what is low. It is not possible to go into the details of these
activities here. Suffice it to note that Ramseyer remarks, what
is clearly right, that Balinese 'folk-art and music as a part of
it [including, of course, drama and shadow-theatre, though I dis-
like such terms as 'folk-' anything] is blended to a very high
degree with all the forms of expression of existence; with magical
practices and beliefs, religious, social, economic, or political
art. It reflects life as an entirety....' He also remarks at the
same place (1970: 12) that 'primitive art is so to say through and
through conventional', these conventions, of course, depending on
the collective representations of which it is a part.

As for cock-fighting, this activity is now illegal under In-
donesian national law, but the Balinese may request permission to
such fights as part of a temple festival, for instance. The cock-
fight, and whether one wins or loses, is bound up with the perfor-
man of the festival: for example, my friend told me that when
many young people win, they tend not to feel it necessary to dance
during the festival at night, but if many lose, then the general
feeling is that young men should dance. This is because winning is a
gift (pica) from the gods: if many people win, then people are all
right with the gods; if not, then they should make an effort to
get into the gods' better books.

Over and above this, the cock-fighting area is termed ring
jéro, 'inside', as opposed to the outside spectators' area. Only
males attend such fights, female vendors of drinks, etc., keeping
well behind the spectators. Choosing birds to fight one another
and the direction from which they will fight involve cosmological
considerations, even though many of the people involved do not know them (nor should do so). These cosmological notions, like the conventions which guide the production of folk-art, including masks, are basically dualistic. As for Ramseyer's allusion to 'life as an entirety', in the Balinese case this is Vidhi. In this sense, these activities include all the basic concepts mentioned in Section I. Empirically, dualism and expansions of it, reversal and inversion, and alternation are also discernible in these activities.22

Finally, villagers' political affiliation (Duff-Cooper 1985d: 242) in rational politics is based on the distinction, which many villagers think runs through every aspect of life as they discriminate them, between the Balinese and Muslims, in particular, the Islamic Sasak of Lombok. In some regards this distinction, which is 'flesh and blood' (getih be) to villagers, is as asymmetrical as possible, although, as noted above, other peoples' forms of life, when compared with that of the Balinese and the Sasak qua Indonesians, are even more distinct and the relations that obtain between the Balinese and these others therefore at least as asymmetrical as those which, in other contexts, obtain between the Balinese and Sasak.

V. Conclusion

Sections I-IV should, of course, be expanded into a monograph, a project which I hope to take up in the future. However, it should be reaffirmed (and this is open to confirmation by interested or sceptical readers consulting other essays about the Balinese listed in the References and by the test of logical coherence) that I have tried my utmost to make no assertion of fact or interpretation without it being based on prior ethnographical description and/or analysis of social facts. So far as I can be completely certain, only the comments about some of the points raised by other contributors to *Contexts and Levels* (Barnes et al. [eds.] 1985) are new.

The present study has not, of course, covered every aspect of the Balinese form of life (*supra*, Section I), but it has addressed most of the aspects which are of greatest importance to villagers.23 These aspects are all framed by principles of order from the set of concepts listed in Section I: duality as such or in one of its expanded forms and symmetry or a form of asymmetry

---

22 I cannot say whether symmetry or one or more of the forms of asymmetry are evinced by these activities.

23 Two aspects not discussed are illness and curing and disease and healing. On the basis of the literature, however (e.g. Goris 1937), I very much think that these aspects of Balinese life would not be recalcitrant to the approach adopted to other aspects of it.
(but see n.22) are almost always discernible. Alternation or another mode of periodicity, however, is evinced only by a number of aspects, as is reversal or inversion. Thus the claim that the Balinese form of life is a totality, the various indigenously defined aspects of which are framed by common principles of order, is borne out. And clearly, the claim of Balinese metaphysics (sarama-sūrya) that Ida Sang Hyang Vidhi, a dualistic unity, pervades the world in various forms (as lamps take many forms, but are still all lamps) is not untenable.

Whether a basic concept is or is not discernible does not depend on the representations considered collective or individual, so to say; nor does it depend on the aspect considered being what might be thought practical or symbolical, for this distinction has no place in Balinese ideology.24

After some consideration, it appears that the aspects which do not evince certain of the basic concepts have nothing insignificant in common, but are more profitably considered as constituting a polythetic class. We do not now ask what it is about these aspects which does not allow this or that form of a basic concept to be discerned, or alternatively why these aspects do not evince this or that (form of a) concept; instead, the problem becomes a retrospective attempt to work out the cognitive and imaginative operations (Needham 1980: 61) by which the classification framed more or less sporadically by these basic concepts was constructed.

A starting point for this attempt is provided by an assessment of Witherspoon's intriguing hypothesis (1977: 5) that 'all cultures are constructed from and based on a metaphysical principle which is axiomatic, unexplainable, and unprovable'; and although Witherspoon does not assume that 'this metaphysical principle is the same for all cultures...', he does think 'that it may be the same for many cultures which appear on the surface to be quite different from each other'. Witherspoon suggests (ibid.) a scheme of development: a 'conceptual scheme' develops by the positing of an opposition to the starting premise - in the Balinese case, Vidhi - from which the conceptual scheme is then expanded 'into a more complex structure utilizing analogy, opposition, and synthesis as its tools of construction'. These are elusive and complex matters, of course, and cannot be considered further here; but their consideration would not obviously be unproductive for comparativism.

As regards the Balinese form of life in particular, much remains to be done. I have in mind two major tasks. The first is to construct a model of the Balinese form of life which would be at once faithful to indigenous ideas and comparable with the models constructed by chemists and physicists. If such authorities as Needham (1983: 161) and Barnes (1984: 201) think that such models could have advantages over more conventional ones,

---

24 More cautiously, perhaps, Hobart suggests (1979: 5) that 'exchanges in Bali...tend to have both technical and symbolic aspects'.
such an undertaking might also procure advances in understanding
the Balinese form of life.25

Now, the form such a model would take seems to be conical and
of three elements. If the cone were stood on its base, the ele­
ments would be one on top of the other, as in the house, seats of
Surya, the person's physical body, the Balinese Mahameru, and many
other triadic entities. This conical shape also represents the
puspe, literally 'flower', but in this case a conically shaped of­
fering made of white card or stiff paper with a yellow or gold
eight-pointed star fixed to the top. This star represents Vidhi as
Surya, the sun god. If the cone were (somehow) hinged about this
eight-pointed star, the cone, when turned to point outwards from
the hinge, either to right or left, would represent lateral triads
such as the three areas, compound-gardens-ricefields, or a
reclining human body.

In such a model, the star represents Vidhi as a dualistic
unity; the bottom of the element first from this star, partition
into three; the bottom of the second element, partition into five;
and the bottom of the cone, partition into nine. The centre of
these nine divisions would be the nadir, the centres of the par­
titions into five and three, 'collapsed' into one another, the
centre, and Vidhi as a dualistic unity at the star would be the
zenith, hence creating partition into eleven (Eka Dasa Rudra).
These three points (nadir, centre and zenith) would thus represent
the three aspects of Siva: Siva, Sada-Siva and Parama-Siva. In
this way, the teaching of Balinese metaphysics that Vidhi pervades
the world would be followed. A projection from the centre of the
star (the zenith or Parama-Siva) through the other centres men­
tioned divides the cone into two, representing the diarchy of
Balinese institutions as demonstrated in this and other studies.
The question then is, how to plot the sets of analogous relations
-symmetrical and of the four degrees of asymmetry - on this frame.
It may be that connections could be established between the top of
the cone and its bottom and the two intermediate divisions along
the lines suggested by James's drawings of axes he plotted around
'the holy precinct of Tjandidasa' (1973).

The second major task is to integrate Balinese notions of
duration, which are circular and linear (see Howe 1981), with the
relations which constitute this form of life. A starting point
for considering how to carry out such an operation may be provided
by the concept of change in the Great Treatise (Ta-ch'ien) which
from Han times has been appended to the Book of Changes (I Ching).

25 At the places cited, Needham writes that 'there is a categori­
cal closure in systems of this kind [i.e. asymmetric prescriptive
alliance] such that Bateson was led to propose a technique of cir­
cular diagrams; the terms and their connectives were to be "rolled
so as to form a cylinder around something hard..."'; Barnes writes
that 'a moving model of some kind, perhaps produced on a television
screen by a computer, could well have advantages in showing how an
Omaha descent group has found partners over a period of generations.'
In the Treatise, 'time [which is cyclical] is a receptacle, a container, or a room in which events happen or relations occur. As a principle of organization it gives coherence to all that occurs within it...' (Swanson, in Rosemont [ed.] 1984: 79).

These are complex matters, of course, but that it is possible to consider them at all derives from a holistic approach to the Balinese form of life. To conclude, though, it must be admitted that the approach which has been adopted has a number of drawbacks, which are spelt out in detail elsewhere (Duff-Cooper in preparation). These problems involve such matters as the method of registration used in describing the relations formally; that the method cannot at present accommodate a number of oppositions such as front/back; and perhaps most seriously that the method requires methodological and other kinds of decision at places - though it is pointed out that so does any method, including pure description (if there is such a thing).

Yet the method renders social facts coherent and intelligible and generates questions which require answering. I am not sure what more one can ask of a study.

ANDREW DUFF-COOPER

REFERENCES


... 1985. 'Hierarchy Without Caste', in Barnes et al. (eds.) 1985.


---

26 This is because Chinese ideas connected with magic squares (e.g. Cammann 1961) in the form of the Writings from the Lo River (Lo shu) and the River Chart (Ho t'u) have proved useful in elucidating the meaning of the Balinese rite nuasén. A further point of interest is that Swanson also remarks upon 'the prephilosophical use of bipolar opposition and analogy that went back as far as the Shang dynasty oracle bones' (op. cit.: 70).


... 1984a. 'Principles in the Classification, the Marriages, and some Other Relations of a Community of Balinese on Lombok', Antropos, Vol. LXXIX, pp. 485-503.


... 1985a. 'Hierarchy, Purity, and Equality among a Community of Balinese on Lombok', in Barnes et al. (eds.) 1985.

... 1985b. 'Duality in Aspects of a Balinese Form of Life on Lombok', Cosmos, Vol. I.


... 1985e. 'Analytical Notes about some Balinese Residences and Related Physical Structures in Western Lombok', Sociologus, Vol. XXXV, pp. 21-52.


... 1985g. 'Ethnographic Notes on Two Operations of the Body among a Community of Balinese on Lombok', JASO, Vol. XVI, no.2, pp. 121-42.

... 1985h. 'Notes about Some Balinese Ideas and Practices Connected with Sex from Western Lombok', Anthropos, Vol. LXXX, pp. 403-19.

... Forthcoming (a). 'Alternation and Other Modes of Periodicity from a Balinese Form of Life in Western Lombok', Southeast Asian Studies.

... Forthcoming (b). 'Balinese Kingship in Pagutan', Cosmos, Vol. II.
DUFF-COOPER, Andrew forthcoming (c). 'Twins and Transvestites: Two Aspects of the Totality of a Balinese Form of Life on Lombok', Zeitschrift für Ethnologie.
... forthcoming (d). 'Incorporation and Alliance among a Community of Balinese on Lombok', Zeitschrift für Ethnologie.
... forthcoming (e). 'Aspects of the Aesthetics of Rice-growing in a Balinese Form of Life on Lombok', in J. Coote and A. Shelton (eds.), Anthropology: Art and Aesthetics.
... forthcoming (f). 'Aspects of the Symbolic Classification of a Balinese Form of Life on Lombok', Sociologus.
... forthcoming (g). 'A Balinese Magic Square of Three from Pagutan', Cosmos, Vol. III.
... in preparation. 'Contingence in a Balinese Form of Life on Lombok'.


HATT, G. 1951. 'The Corn Mother in America and in Indonesia', Anthropos, Vol. XLVI, pp. 853-914.

... 1978b. 'Padi, Puns and the Attribution of Responsibility', in ibid.
... 1983. 'The Art of Measuring Mirages, or Is There Kinship in Bali?', Paper no. 11 given to the seminar on Cognatic Forms of Social Organisation in Southeast Asia, University of Amsterdam, January 1983.
... 1985. 'Texte est un con', in Barnes et al. (eds.) 1985.

... 1981. 'The Social Determination of Knowledge: Maurice Bloch and Balinese Time', Man (n.s.), Vol. XVI, pp. 220-34.


... 1980. Reconnaissances, Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

... 1983. Against the Tranquility of Axioms, Berkeley etc.: University of California Press.

... 1985. Exemplars, Berkeley etc.: University of California Press.


