BOOK REVIEWS


One of the things which ethnographers are always on the lookout for (it may safely be presumed) are new methods which will help them to make sense, or more sense, of the data which they have. Anthropology of Space is candid about it being, in one guise, an aid to fieldwork, a kind of field manual. It is based on ten months' fieldwork in 1976-77, and consists of six chapters, an Introduction, and a Foreword by Oswald Werner, of Northwestern University, whose student Pinxten once was.

According to Professor Werner, 'this book is bound to be controversial'. Perhaps one gets blasé at Oxford, but it is hard, frankly, to understand why Werner should think this to be so. To start with, the book attempts to bridge the gap between what is called 'armchair' anthropology and fieldwork. It is true that nowadays fieldwork is generally considered to be a sine qua non of anyone aspiring to be a professional social anthropologist. But fieldwork does not guarantee a job, and it often seems to be the case that fieldwork and the data collected by fieldworkers are not considered to be the most important criteria by which to judge the quality of a person's work. In the days when fieldwork was the exception rather than the rule for most social anthropologists, moreover, the relationship between those who stayed at home and those who went to the field (or, rather, found themselves in exotic surroundings because of their other activities) was very close indeed. And even today, the work of theoreticians and synthesizers and of fieldworkers
is practically inseparable.

Pinxten is refreshingly and directly committed to social facts. He writes that 'it is taken as a point of departure that no semantic element whatsoever is known, prior to thorough empirical analysis and actual painstaking field procedures having been carried out'. And later he expresses the view, with which one can only concur, that 'certain percepts and the linguistic expression of these percepts might be universal or they might be limited to a particular cultural or linguistic community; but only detailed and painstaking empirical analysis can decide this question in each case.'

_Anhropology of Space_ contains a deal of ethnography about Navajo conceptions of space. Chapter 1, 'The Natural Philosophy of Navajo Language and World View', is 32 pages long and contains fairly detailed information about this area of Navajo ideology. The information presented is a composite of statements of a number of 'consultants', listed in Appendix A, who are acknowledged in the text. (The main consultant, Frank Harvey, is one of the authors of the book.) Later chapters, especially the semantic analyses which Pinxten carries out, rest on this data, which were collected by 'the methodologically rather vague...classical ethnographic methods'.

A major finding of this chapter is that everything in the Navajo world moves, that is to say, the Navajo cosmos is composed of processes and events. The concept of 'movement' is difficult: it cannot be understood as actual movement or displacement. Rather, movement (dynamic) is much less specific and more general - 'persisting through eventual change'. The Navajo view of 'being', 'becoming', and 'growing', is also dynamic, so that existing is more a series of events than states or 'situational persistences through time'. This idea is (for the non-specialist) an interesting suggestion. It seems to this reviewer, though, to be based on rather thin evidence - 'probably incomplete', in Pinxten's words - in spite of their impeccable derivation. The idea, further, does not take account of the only exception to the general rule of change: 'the dead body of a person is the one and only thing that is still.'

Chapter 3, 'Linguistic Material on Navajo Spatial Meaning', is the longest in the book. It runs to 72 pages. The way data are analysed is as follows: a Navajo term is translated into an English expression. A description is then given in English of the meaning, the use, the 'nonverbal correlates', etc., of the term. Examples are supplied in Navajo sentences with English translations.

So far, one takes it, there is nothing very remarkable about this procedure. _The Northern States of Fiji_, for instance, is replete with such exercises, and so is _Do Kamo_. _And Kéáng_ relies heavily upon a similar, though less explicit, technique. Such approaches to linguistic material are often very illuminating. The final step in the analysis is what is original: the 'components' of each term are detailed. 'Components' refers to the list of relevant entries of the UFOR, making up a character-
The UFOR is the Universal Frame of Reference, the analytical tool used throughout Anthropology of Space.

This reviewer's impression is that the UFOR, which derives from work which Pinxten did for his doctorate, is meant in many ways to be the most important contribution which this book aims to make to social anthropology. The UFOR, it is contended, transcends individual or cultural bias, and it aims to set out, in Werner's words, the 'maximum complete set of spatial discriminations that human beings are capable of making'. 'The sophisticated, highly refined methods and techniques of semantic analysis' inherent in The Device (i.e. the UFOR) are set out in a long Appendix B. The kind of semantics which Pinxten embraces he characterises as 'post-Quine and anti-Katz'.

'Space' is divided into three different spaces which are represented in semantic representations: physical space, sociogeographical space, and cosmological space. The list of entries under the three categories totals 67. The entries under sociogeographical space and cosmological space are amended (i.e. truncated) lists of the 45 entries under physical space.

The entries represent a 'spatial phenomenon' in 'the most neutral and culture-free (or "pre-culturalized") way possible .... The UFOR maps out all spatial differentiations with which man-the-knower has to deal and which are subject to cognition because of their physical prominence and/or because of the biological constitution of people induces these spatial characteristics (e.g. the structure of the body induces the distinction between three spatial dimensions). So it would appear that the entries are only neutral and culture-free to the extent that what is physically prominent and what 'the biological constitution of people' consists of can be argued to be definable in ways which have these characteristics. This reviewer's feeling is that this problem of defining the assumptions upon which the UFOR is based probably (and expectably) vitiates its claims to be neutral.

Not that this fact is particularly important for the prosecution of fieldwork. Pinxten lists a number of things to do with spatial conceptions which might usefully be raised in discussions in the field. However, 'a genuinely universalist pretension is typical.' This pretension is indeed most noticeable in the formal language and in the notations which are adopted in most of the book. Not that there is anything necessarily wrong with formalism, of course, although an assessment of the usefulness of a specific technique must depend upon the results which it procures.

One example is entry 122, 'Cardinal Points, Cardinal Directions', which is applicable with certain provisos to entries 222 and 322 ('Cardinal Points/Cardinal Directions in Sociogeographical and Cosmological Space') also: 'Cardinal directions (and cardinal points) are recognized, provided human beings organize their actions, their ways of moving, their constructions, or anything in the actional world in such a way that
they are located in space as analogous to the different positions of the sun in the sky, from rising to zenith to setting places. The fourth direction is analogous to the one "where the sun never comes." This analysis is based upon the view that 'the different positions of the sun during a diurnal period can be used to construct a neutral framework concerning the cardinal directions: at least these directions are natural in the sense that they are not manmade and are perceived and acknowledged by human beings in all different cultures.'

One such culture is that of the Balinese. On Lombok, the three positions of the sun are perceived and acknowledged by the people. Associations are indeed made between the positions of the rising sun and of the setting sun. The cardinal points are also constantly referred to, directly and indirectly, by analogy, but unfortunately the 'fourth position' is approximately north (kaja/kaler) in Balinese ideology. There is also no position where the sun never comes in Balinese ideology, apart from 'hell', the realm of aburya. Aburya and Pinxten's fourth position are quite different, I think. But in any case one does not need the UFOR to help one to ascertain these crucial points in Balinese thought.

Let us take 'Left/Right', entry 119: 'phenomena (with spatial relevance) x and y are recognized to be on the left or right side of one another (x is to the left of y, and then y is to the right of x), provided they are perceived or acted upon as distinct from each other, and provided they are handled as being in a spatial relationship to one another that is analogous to that of the dominant or preferred hand (or the other way around, depending on the cultural information available).' Pinxten then notes that 'the universal fact of the neurological difference of one hemisphere over the other...may suffice for the UFOR, but one should allow for culturally different interpretations of this fact.'

And so on. This reviewer must be candid and admit that he will stick with the classical ethnographical methods, although they are methodologically rather vague, in preference to this kind of formulation which, like so much theory, tends to make matters worse rather than better in trying to get to grips with one's data.

This preference is, of course, a matter of taste. It is his taste, also, which allows the reviewer to report to readers of JASO that Anthropology of Space is a serious book, whose leading author is both serious and concerned. Chapter 5, 'Applications in the Teaching of Mathematics and the Sciences', takes the view that the results of teaching young Navajo in a way which presupposes the 'pre-school knowledge' which Western children, according to such writers as Piaget and Bruner, possess, are ineffectual and totally inappropriate. That is, the ineffectualness and inappropriateness derive from 'the fundamental and poorly understood lack of commensurability of Western and Navajo knowledge systems'. This situation can be remedied, Pinxten thinks, by exploring and utilising in teaching...
the differences and the similarities between Navajo and Western concepts. This approach would be to the benefit of the Navajo: 'nobody deserves this second-rate treatment in a democratic society', i.e. living in a divided world, partly Navajo and partly Western. It would be epistemologically useful: 'it is fascinating and theoretically rewarding to try to work out alternatives to the historically and culturally specific outlook that predominates nowadays.' Finally, there is the evolutionary reason: 'as long as science cannot pretend to have valid answers to all basic questions (as is the case in our contemporary situation...), it is foolish to exterminate all other, so-called primitive, pre-scientific, or otherwise foreign approaches to world questions', even if one does not go quite so far as Joseph Needham went in 1956.

To a non-specialist, this book seems to be one which would appeal to anyone interested in such peoples as the Navajo; it presents a methodological approach which is interesting and challenging, even for those who decide not to adopt it; it raises questions which might be useful in field research; and it contains an element which will reassure anyone who thinks that questions which have a political content are not necessarily to be eschewed in the work of social anthropologists merely because it aims to be scholarly. *Anthropology of Space* is a work of serious scholarship which raises questions which are interesting, which might be useful, and which are morally significant.

ANDREW DUFF-COOPER


Since the publication of *Argonauts of the Western Pacific* in 1922, Malinowski's description of the *kula* has become part of the culture that social anthropologists share. This volume of twenty-two essays grew out of a 1978 conference organized for the purpose of reassessing Malinowski's study and constructing a comprehensive description of the contemporary *kula* exchange system. Fifteen of the twenty contributors have conducted recent fieldwork in the Massim - the cultural region encompassing islands east of Mainland Papua New Guinea - and it is primarily their presentation of new ethnographic material that updates Malinowski's *Argonauts*. Accordingly, the papers are
grouped by geographical location, beginning with the Trobriand kula area and proceeding, like the famous shell necklaces, clockwise around the ring. Two ethnographic sections deal with island communities bordering this area. In addition, several papers that consider kula exchange from a theoretical perspective supplement the new ethnography. The volume concludes with a stimulating essay in which Edmund Leach questions whether 'a synthetic totality THE KULA can be pieced together from components derived from reports from different islands, even when ...the islands are immediately adjacent.'

In an introduction that critically reviews the received interpretations of kula exchange, Jerry Leach, the principal editor, notes one of the persistent questions of kula analysis: how does the kula work? The greatest strength of this volume lies in supplying information fundamental to understanding this question. Campbell's two papers on kula in Vakuta, southernmost of the Trobriands, offer important details of kula transactions. Campbell explicates the shell classification system - that is, the criteria by which Vakutans place armshells and necklaces into ranked categories. The discussion, moreover, outlines a number of topics elaborated in other papers: the initiation and maintenance of keda, the 'paths' which link partners in the exchange of shell valuables and furnish participants with a conceptual model of the exchange system; the strategies men may exercise in diverting shells from one keda to another; and the political processes entailed in building a kula career. Munn, for example, concentrates on modes of persuasion and strategy in her analysis of Gawan kula as an ongoing process of influence-building in which control over the movement of shells generates 'a symbolic value attribute of actor identity' - butu or 'fame'. Munn, Campbell and Damon illustrate their papers with actual case histories of transactions, developing an overall picture quite different from Malinowski's portrayal of partners fixed in a lifelong relationship. Men dissolve partnerships, establish new keda or reinstate old relationships in response to diverse opportunities for enhancing their 'names'. Indeed, keeping a kula relationship 'alive' is problematic, not given, as every repayment of a debt potentially ends the keda partnership. The strategies that actors employ in 'playing' kula imply that, contrary to Malinowski, valuables do stop in their circulation around the ring; transactions, like keda, begin and end with someone. Kitoms, shells over which individuals exercise absolute proprietary rights, enable men to create breaks in the cycle of indebtedness. Malinowski, who never spoke of kitoms, offered kula as an example of a 'new type of ownership', shells being held in trust and only temporarily. The majority of the authors in this volume, however, demonstrate how individually-owned kitoms variously work in Massim societies. Damon, for example, in interpreting the claim of his Muyuwan informants that every shell is someone's kitom, proposes that: 'At a certain level of abstraction the kula ring consists of individual owners of kitoms exchanging these articles back and
forth.' *Kitoms* account not only for how one begins a cycle in the *kula* unencumbered by past debt, but also, according to Damon, for the principle of equivalence that ideally guides all exchanges. Damon furthermore discusses the convertibility of *kitoms* in paying debts for canoes and pigs as well as for the 'work' a woman provides her husband during her lifetime.

Similarly, Thune and Macintyre, in papers dealing with the southern *kula* area, emphasize the importance of *kitoms* in a wide range of contexts. Thune describes the paramount significance of *kitoms* in inter-matrilinage exchanges in the Duau area of the Normanby Islands, while Macintyre reports five major exchanges involving *kitoms* on Tubetube, including mortuary, compensation and land payments. The arrangement of papers thus makes it clear that as one moves into the southern Massim, *kula* becomes less differentiated conceptually and practically from other exchanges. Indeed, Thune notes that no word in the Loboda language refers to *kula* alone. Tubetube people likewise regard *kune* (*kula*) as only one way of gaining wealth and prestige to use within the community. *Kitom* convertibility, then, provides a key to understanding both how other exchanges function as sources for new *kula* shells and what motivates individuals to place shells in and remove them from circulation. More generally, the new ethnography corrects the view of *kula* from Kiriwina where (as Weiner observes in a paper that examines *kula* in relation to intra-community exchange) it constitutes an almost autonomous realm of activity.

While the papers that treat *kula* and related exchanges as specific forms of transaction comprise the heart of the volume, several contributions investigate the symbolism and meaning of *kula*. Tambiah analyzes *kula* mythology in order to reveal a Trobriand code for male and female values. Young's exegesis of the Kasabwaybwayreta myth touches upon similar themes, including the opposition between stasis and mobility that characterizes male/female relations and Massim ideology in general. Munn's analysis of the symbolism of influence relates this opposition directly to the movement of shells. Nevertheless, the volume on the whole is less satisfying with regard to symbolism, offering preliminary suggestions (such as Scoditti's claim that 'Kula expeditions are at one level symbolic representations of the life cycle and behaviour of a butterfly'), rather than systematic interpretations. Likewise, though with some exceptions (Irwin, Berde), the papers are generally weak both in locating *kula* exchange in a precise historical context and in assessing the impact on *kula* of political and technological changes in the colonial and post-colonial periods. (However, papers by four of the contributors in a recent issue of the *Journal of Pacific History* partially remedy this shortcoming.)

The sections dealing with Massim communities not directly involved in *kula* exchange are quite valuable. Young and Chowning present materials from D'Entrecasteaux societies on exchange institutions analogous to *kula* in political and economic functions. Four papers discuss systems of exchange found in the
Louisiade Archipelago societies of the southeastern Massim. Liep takes up the question of 'Rossel Island money' in light of his field experience with Rossel (Yela) exchanges. Berde, Battaglia and Lepowsky all discuss the overall patterning of exchange in the archipelago, stressing the critical role of mortuary feasts in organizing virtually all production and exchange. The political aspects of sponsoring mortuary ceremonies blur the distinction between 'internal' (intra-community) and 'external' (inter-community) exchange that characterizes to various degrees kula areas to the north and west. In fact, both Battaglia and Berde suggest that this merging of internal and external realms is the definitive feature of Louisiade exchanges. The inclusion of D'Entrecasteaux and Louisiade material - some being made available for the first time - thus provides a comparative context for the new ethnography. In this context, the distinctive features of kula exchange are highlighted while at the same time the features kula shares with other forms of exchange are identified.

Taken together, the papers in this volume define the Massim culture area through the analysis of recurrent ideological themes and cognate political and economic processes. Excellent maps, an index of place names and a separately published bibliography (Martha MacIntyre, ed.) with over 600 entries on kula support the effort. The volume thus provides a basis for fine-grained comparative analyses of kula exchange within the Massim, rather than replacing Malinowski's model with a new alternative. Indeed, the new ethnography reveals significant differences around the ring over the use of shells in non-kula contexts, the gender identifications attributed to armshells and necklaces, the right to participate in kula exchange (J. Leach) and informants' statements about the criteria of shell classification. E. Leach rightly argues in his conclusion that 'a synthetic THE KULA' cannot be constructed out of these variations. Nonetheless, as Leach recognizes, analytical comparisons of the principles underlying different forms of exchange are both possible and needed. A. Strathern presents such a comparison of kula with other exchange systems operating in Papua New Guinea societies (Tolai, Siassi, Enga, Melpa). On a different scale, Firth attempts to view kula as 'a set of macro-economic relations involving price-making mechanisms'. Gregory, in contrast, maintains a strict dichotomy in his comparison of the respective principles governing kula exchange and capitalist commodity exchange. Finally, E. Leach calls for a comparative approach to kula exchange in line with Lévi-Strauss' categories of 'restricted' and 'generalised' exchange. Ultimately, the comparative exercises made possible by and tentatively offered in this volume will diminish much of the novelty that Malinowski ascribed to kula. The result, however, should be a sharpened appreciation for the historical and cultural specificity of kula exchange.

ROBERT J. FOSTER

This collection of papers, based on a series of seminars organized by the Oxford University Women's Studies Committee, addresses the question of 'how women perceive themselves and their roles within varying religious systems'. It is thus not so much about religious experience in the Jamesian sense as about female experiences of male-dominated religious or symbolic systems. Quoting from the last paper of the volume, the editor states that a common theme is that 'women do not challenge the dominant model but rather elaborate on an element of it.... Religion may appear to repress women and to justify their subservience to men. The papers show that women do not generally challenge this; neither, however, do they necessarily share the view.' The papers are arranged in pairs; two are on Victorian England (Spiritualism and Theosophy), two on the Mediterranean (village Greece and Turkish towns), two on India (ancient texts and contemporary village life), two on Judaism, and two on Africa (West Africa and the Nyole of Uganda).

Vieda Skultans tells the amusing but sad story of the relationship between Spiritualist mediums (typically younger women in precarious financial circumstances) and psychical researchers (typically well-to-do, middle-aged men). What intrigued me in the account of Spiritualism (which Skultans is reluctant to see as a 'racket') was that because of its quasi-scientific and quasi-religious character it could be used by the men as a device for acting out their erotic fantasies rather openly without doing damage to their reputation, or to that of the medium, unless someone showed the poor taste of exposing the materializations as frauds. If Spiritualism 'may appear to repress women and to justify their subservience to men', the paper shows that the mediums did not generally challenge this, and that Skultans does not necessarily share the view; on the contrary, one of her conclusions is that Spiritualism 'provided ideal career opportunities for women', even though she goes on to show that in the long run the prospects for a medium were about as promising as those of an ordinary prostitute.

Diana Burfield uses a biographical approach in her well-written and informative account of the role of a few women in the Theosophical Society, and she places that movement in the historical context of other similar movements of 'advanced thought' in the 1880s. In passing she makes the observation that '1888 was as exciting and tumultuous a year as 1968, and considerably closer to being a genuinely revolutionary situation', and one is struck by the resemblance between the two periods in terms of the political and ideological ecumenism of the 'New' social and philosophical thinking, which allowed for all sorts of blends of socialism, anarchism, oriental mysticism and the occult.
Lucy Rushton's paper is a series of ethnographic observations on the daily life of women in a Macedonian village and on the way they perceive their position with respect to official theology. Concepts like 'honour' and 'shame' are not invoked (and indeed these women appear refreshingly 'shameless'), but some concerted analytic effort would not necessarily have detracted from the value of the author's observations.

Analytic competence is demonstrated in Nancy Tapper's paper. By looking at the structure and content of two kinds of women's gatherings, one secular and one religious, and by placing them in their total context of the social and religious life of the Turkish provincial town, Tapper shows why the contradiction between male dominance and the highly valued status of motherhood cannot be consciously confronted, let alone symbolically resolved or mediated, for the gatherings serve, among other things, both to cement and to obscure the contradiction.

In her paper on ancient Indian religious texts, Julia Leslie is concerned to find out what religious opportunities were open to women at various periods, and whether the difference in sex made a difference in respect to access to religious or philosophical knowledge. Leslie has looked for women in the texts and has found some. We are not told whether the character and varying frequency of female appearances in the texts are related to what went on in the society of the different periods.

Given that, in contemporary Hinduism, religious worship is determined by the degree of purity of the individual, and given that women are considered relatively impure in relation to men, why is it the case in a village in central India that women worship the gods on a greater number of occasions than do men? This is the question which Catherine Thompson confronts, and indeed answers, in her paper. She argues for a more nuanced view of purity and impurity, one which is bound up with ideas of power and powers. Aspects of female sexuality are certainly polluting (menstruation, childbirth), but 'a woman's mature sexuality is...made auspicious once she becomes a wife. As a wife she is under the control of a man.' So part of the answer lies in the 'Turkish' contradiction of valued motherhood and male domination. But unlike their Turkish sisters, the Indian women are not symbolically paralyzed by the contradiction; they may actually mediate it themselves, Thompson argues, precisely because of the nature of the ideas of purity and impurity.

The two Jewish papers, by Julia Neuberger and Jonathan Webber, are both apologetic for official Judaism with respect to the position of women. Rabbi Neuberger points out that women are not excluded but only exempted from taking part in public religious life, so if they do not participate, it is largely their own fault. Webber argues that it is perfectly feasible for a woman to be both orthodox and a public figure, for the traditional Jewish ideology, codified in the law, offers women 'both the cultural security and, at the same time, the
cultural freedom not to feel it necessary to rise up against it in their voluntary participation in communal life'. Such is the power of ideology.

Elisabeth Tonkin deals with masking in West Africa. She points out that a mask is not just the physical object; it also includes the carrier of the mask and the action that he performs. Masks are connected with power, and a mask event 'frequently defines, creates or enacts "maleness" as the most socially marked state'. "Masks then are a focus for pondering on sexual divisions and also for bounding or neutralising the powers of women which, simultaneously, they present." The female element which Tonkin elaborates on is that if women are excluded by mask events, they should consequently be ideologically free to reject the male message of the mask.

In her paper on explanations of misfortune among the Nyole, Susan Whyte deals with a 'classical' African system of representing physical disorders in the idiom of social relationships. But in some cases women suffer misfortunes which are caused by totally unrelated, 'little' or 'foreign' spirits. This Whyte takes to be an indication of the existence of a 'counterpart' female model which represents women as individual persons, not defined primarily by their dependence on men, as wives and daughters. But the point is that this 'counterpart' model is in itself determined by the dominant male model, and this leads to an important discussion of the nature of the relationship between male and female models, a discussion which, as the editor pointed out in the Introduction, is actually centrally relevant to the other papers as well.

The papers are of uneven quality. The best - those by Tapper, Thompson, Tonkin and Whyte - are fine anthropological analyses which focus on rather restricted phenomena in order to make general points about female reactions to male-dominated symbolic systems. They may thus be seen as falling within the tradition of 'women's studies' in social anthropology which was inaugurated in the mid 70s by Shirley Ardener's volume Perceiving Women. But unlike that volume, the editor of the present one has not sought to provide a more or less unifying theoretical framework for the different contributions. Even the problematic character of the term 'religious experience', though it is briefly acknowledged, is glossed over by reference to the diversity of the material. Pat Holden feels that the papers contain 'distinct indications of new approaches to the study of women and religion which should provide important pointers to future studies', but she leaves it to the reader to find out what they are and ends her Introduction with the ascertainment that 'there is an immense and rich variety of female religious experience'.

On the technical production of the book, the less said the better.

JAN OVESEN
This study makes a valuable contribution to the growing social science literature during the last two decades concerning the complex linguistic problems faced by the newly-independent nation-states of Asia and Africa. The issues involve determining the choices and functions of language(s) toward national integration both from the ideological and practical viewpoints. Formation of appropriate policies and their implementation as part of language planning becomes a major task and requires the collaboration of linguists, educationists, administrators, and other experts. The task is even more formidable and the solutions more difficult to come by if the new nation-states are multilingual.

Since attitudes towards language(s) play a major role in the formulation and implementation of national language policies and in their acceptance by the population at large, a systematic study of language attitudes in any specific nation-state is a prerequisite for adequately developing its language policies and planning for the fruitful and consensual use of language(s) in all domains. This study fulfils such a task for Morocco.

The linguistic situation in Morocco is complex because of the existence of four languages: Berber with its several widely differing and not always mutually comprehensible varieties; Moroccan Arabic learned by all Arabic speakers as their first language; Classical Arabic which is no-one's first language; and French, the language of the colonial rulers. Berber has no written form, and Berber speakers adopt Berber-Arabic bilingualism routinely to facilitate everyday exchange and communication. Classical Arabic was, and continues to be, the language of the traditional education system, while French has been the main language of instruction in the three types of school established by the French. Bentahila has chosen to study only one aspect of this complex linguistic situation, but one that is very significant. He explores the attitudes of Arabic-French bilinguals concerning a variety of language-related issues. These bilinguals were selected because they represent 'the majority of the educated younger generation' and thus are in a position to influence the future of national integration and progress in Morocco. Bentahila's methodology involves using various types of questionnaires and tests administered to many randomly selected samples of Arabic-French bilinguals.

After an introduction which outlines the language situation in Morocco, chapter two briefly presents the various theoretical and analytical approaches used by linguists and other social scientists to study bilingualism. Chapters three to six constitute the core of the book and explore several aspects of the Arabic-French bilingual community and its language attitudes.
They all have a similar organization. In each, the introductory section discusses some key issues based on a brief survey of the relevant literature, and is followed by a section describing the various tests administered by the author and their purpose. The results of the tests are analyzed and discussed, and conclusions are drawn. The final chapter summarizes the major findings of the research.

Chapter three is devoted to testing the bilingual individual's attitudes towards his language, his code-switching abilities between Arabic and French, and the relationship between his language use and his world-view. The analysis of the results reveals some interesting trends. While Moroccan Arabic is seen as the easiest to learn and the most practical in everyday life, French is seen as the most modern and practical in such domains as education and administration. Classical Arabic is seen as beautiful and rich. Most respondents seem to value each language for its own sake, despite the overall bias towards French. Although the bilingual speakers frequently code-switch between Arabic and French, many view such a practice negatively and few admit to doing it themselves. As for the bilingual’s world-view, his 'attitude to the world varies, depending on which language he is using'. Bentahila believes that his tests constitute evidence to support the view that 'language, as one part of the society's culture, will as such naturally be linked with other aspects of that culture'. Thus, 'French language is closely linked to other things French, and in turning to the language [the bilingual] also turns to the culture.'

Chapter four is primarily concerned with discovering the types of factors which may affect the choice of Arabic or French by the bilinguals, and with discussing them in the context of attitudes examined in the previous chapter. It appears that the bilingual’s choice of language in any particular situation is not arbitrary, but is influenced by many factors, the most crucial of which are interlocutor, setting, topic discussed, and speaker's intent and mood. Overall, Arabic seems to be the language of the home while in the public domain French is preferred in communicating with educated individuals in prestige professions, and Arabic is used with strangers and low-level professionals. Informal situations generally seem conducive to a mixture of Arabic and French, in contrast to formal ones. Topics such as philosophy and religion evoke the use of Arabic, which is also used for such activities as telling jokes, insulting, greeting - or when speakers are tired or angry. This last fact demonstrates the speakers' emotional attachment to their native language. French is used to discuss science, technology, industry, social sciences, etc. It is also used for courting, and for maintaining social distance and impersonal relations. Books, newspapers, radio broadcasts and films in French are more popular and are preferred to those in Arabic though in practice both languages seem to be even in this respect. In the domain of education, there is an overall preference for French. In general, this preference is based on practical considerations.
However, Bentahila notes that each language is associated with different domains, has its own role in the bilingual's speech behaviour, and cannot be excluded in social interaction. He cautions language planners to be aware of this reality.

Chapter five is aimed at discovering the Moroccan bilinguals' attitudes towards those who speak French or Arabic, and those who code-switch between them. The results of the match-guised tests reveal attitudes similar to those overtly expressed by the bilingual respondents. For instance, those who mix two languages are perceived as inferior in status, personality, and manner of speaking. It appears that the Moroccan bilinguals' judgments of a person are quite radically influenced by what he speaks, and that they may gain significantly different impressions of a person's character, status and level of education according to whether he is using French, Arabic, or a mixture of the two. While a French speaker is perceived more favourably than an Arabic speaker, test results also show a bias against those who speak accented French.

Chapter six starts with a general discussion of the problems involved in language planning in Morocco. It is argued that since Classical Arabic is no-one's mother tongue, ideas of replacing French by Classical Arabic amount to 'replacing one non-native language with another'. This is indeed a significant observation. The drawbacks commonly associated with Arabic, such as its unwieldy writing system, its lack of punctuation, problems of printing, its inadequacy as a mode of scientific writing, and its inability in fulfilling the needs of contemporary Morocco, are viewed by Bentahila as not so much due to the nature of the language itself, but rather as emanating from the Arabic speakers' attitudes towards their language. According to him, part of the blame also lies in the ways in which Arabic has traditionally been taught, making it a static language not to be polluted by borrowing from other languages. Bentahila believes that with proper planning Arabic can indeed become a national language.

As in other chapters, the results of various tests designed to discover Moroccan bilinguals' attitudes towards the present and future language situations are analysed and discussed. Bentahila admits that although the bilinguals' views on the issues pertaining to language planning are important, they certainly are not representative of the Moroccan population as a whole.

Moroccan bilinguals recognise that the advantages of bilingualism outweigh the disadvantages. Most of them feel that French should be used as a medium of instruction at primary, secondary, or higher education. This appears in conflict with the existing ideals of the policy-makers. Most also prefer French for such subjects as mathematics and science and do not favour the use of Arabic in its place.

The emotional conflict Moroccan bilinguals face between ideology and practicality is quite obvious from these results. While they think that ideally Arabic should be the language used...
for all purposes including education in science, they realize the immense practical advantages of French. Bentahila forcefully argues that language planners in Morocco should not sacrifice practical values for the sake of ideals. He feels that the task of 'running the country and leading it into the next century' is likely to fall on the educated bilinguals, and 'their feelings about the present and possible future language situation must not be ignored'. At the same time Bentahila makes several practical suggestions for persuading Moroccan bilinguals that Arabic is an adequate replacement for French. He feels however, that the question of Arabization is tied to the co-existence of two divergent varieties of Arabic - Classical and Moroccan - and also to the very negative attitudes towards the latter which is viewed as a language of the ignorant and illiterate people. Both these problems need to be resolved before Arabization can be successful.

This study should go a long way in convincing language planners and policy-makers, especially those in Morocco, that attitudes towards various languages involved in policy decisions play a key role in the success or failure of any language planning. Bentahila is not only familiar with the existing literature on language planning, but has also given considerable thought to the specific problems of language planning in Morocco. The study is methodologically sound and the results are significant. Thus not only should its conclusions prove useful to language planners in Morocco, but it could be used as a model by language planners in other Asian and African nations to discover the nature of language attitudes in their respective countries in guiding their policy decisions.

MAHADEV L. APTE

SCOTT WHITEFORD, Workers from the North: Plantations, Bolivian Labor and the City in Northeast Argentina, Austin: University of Texas Press 1981 [Latin American Monographs no. 54]. xi, 155pp., Bibliography, Index, Maps, Tables. £16.25.

Whiteford's book sets out to describe and analyse the employment structure of Bolivian migrants in N.W. Argentina and its implications for the personal and social lives of the migrants themselves. In this it represents a useful contribution to the growing literature linking the macro-level of Third-World capitalist development to the micro-level of individual lives, of daily decision-making and the unrelenting struggle simply to 'make ends meet'. One senses throughout the author's recognition
of the essentially political nature of his ostensibly socio­logical field. Capital dictates terms to labour and it is the task of the researcher to put flesh onto the bare bones of that axiom by discovering the social relations that allow the process to continue.

The book's best section is undoubtedly chapters 2 to 5. Here, Whiteford takes us through three descending levels of his complex subject using direct and clear prose. Chapter 2 places the 'sucking-in' of Bolivian labour to Argentina's northwestern provinces within the general framework of colonial and post­colonial economic development. The involvement of Argentina's indigenous Andean and Chaco populations in this story reminds the reader that migration in this area is not solely a trans­national affair.

In chapter 3 the focus is narrowed to the sugar zone itself and the complex labour requirements of an area in which varying ecological conditions mean that different crops in different places need intense labour inputs at different times of the year. The traditional image of golondrina labour gradually moving south with the southern summer is replaced with a much less simple picture of an almost frenetic scramble for work as different crops ripen and employers enter the labour market in intense but limited bursts. Much of the book, indeed, is devoted to the flow of employment information as a vital economic resource among migrants. Relationships through which advanced knowledge of employment opportunities is communicated are salient parts of migrant social structure.

Chapters 4 and 5 deal with the methods of recruitment to the sugar harvest itself and the allocation of work and payments within the plantations. The relationship between the contratista (agent), mayordomo (foreman), and safrero (harvest worker) and the nuances of clientism are clearly explained. The cuarta system of subcontracting work within kin or friendship networks, however, does not seem to be given sufficient attention. As Bromley and Gerry (1979) are cited in both text and bibliography, it seems odd that the mechanisms by which the sugar companies obtain workers rather than employees (cf. Birkbeck in that volume) are not further pursued.

The remainder of the book is largely devoted to the strategies developed by migrant workers for maximising the opportunity to earn wages so as to introduce an element of security into their lives. The exposition of the role of different migration patterns and the central importance of the city in the lives of migrants shows the results of extensive data collection and careful analysis. The influence of Ortiz's work on peasant decision-making is clearly present in the elaboration of the concept of the 'strategy of least vulnera­bility' and in the general tone of the analysis.

However, two conceptual areas - kinship and ethnicity - are not given the detailed treatment they deserve as instrumental factors in economic life. Throughout the book Whiteford refers to 'the family' or 'the extended family'. Unfortunately no
serious attempt is made to examine the nature of the kinship bonds that are evidently of great importance to migrant life. The norms of marriage, child rearing, siblinghood and kindred association are never fully explored, yet 'family' links are mentioned time and again with reference to economic activity. Similarly the role of money within kin groups is clearly central to 'family' co-operation in a context where husbands, wives and children are all potential or actual members of the labour force.

Ethnicity is dealt with in a similarly unproblematic fashion. While the antagonism between unionised Argentine labour and non-unionised (and even illegal) Bolivian labour is mentioned, the stigma attached to Bolivian identity in modern Argentina is skated over. The 'fiesta' complex with its bringing together of solidary functions on the one hand and instrumental contacts on the other suggests a more complex role for ethnicity than Whiteford allows. The combination of ethnic stigma, scarce employment and the fact that many present-day 'Bolivian' migrants are Argentine-born would point to the existence of a crucial ethnic boundary. The maintenance and function of regional identity and general 'Bolivian-ness' could have been the subject of an illuminating chapter.

Scott Whiteford's book will be of interest not only to social scientists working in the field of migration but also to anyone with an interest in the mechanism of surplus labour exploitation. Not least, it is a contribution to the knowledge of modern Argentina, whose European immigrants have tended to attract the bulk of the historical and sociological attention paid to that country.

CHARLES DAVISON


ERNEST CASHMORE and BARRY TROYNA (eds.), *Black Youth in Crisis*, London etc.: George Allen and Unwin 1982. 176pp., Bibliography, Index. £4.95.

Black teenagers squaring up to lines of riot police; gangs of black youths lurking in the shadows waiting to rob the unsuspecting passer-by; the dreadlocked mystic verbally abusing others in the street: such are the images of black youth which have developed in Britain over the last decade. Very few positive images of black youth exist despite the attention lavished upon this section of the population by the media and others during recent years. Indeed Cashmore and Troyna state
in their Introduction to Black Youth in Crisis that the term 'black youth' has 'become synonymous with young black males of West Indian descent'.

Social scientists are not altogether free from blame for the creation of this image, Cashmore included. There has been a tendency for scholars to concentrate upon the more extreme manifestations of black youth culture. In these two books, however, the author and contributors go some way to redressing the balance. In Black Sportsmen, the ever-increasing contribution of black youth to the sporting world in British society is recorded. The contributors to Black Youth in Crisis attempt to provide a more sensible approach in looking at black youth than that which concentrates on extremes of behaviour, an approach that does not generalise at the expense of accuracy. Neither work entirely gets away from the view of black youth as male and of West Indian origin, but a start is made.

Cashmore addresses himself to the historical, social and psychological reasons for large numbers of blacks entering sport and the high quality of their achievement in Britain today. The book comprises twelve chapters which include nine profiles, including full-page pictures, of leading black British sportsmen. These profiles are the result of personal interviews with the author and provide the framework around which Cashmore weaves his argument. The profiles offer an interesting insight into the development, not only of sporting careers but also about perceptions of being 'black'. The profiles are of successful black sportsmen, and Cashmore's observations about the obstacles facing black youth in the educational and occupational world, as well as their family backgrounds, are based on the experiences of the successful. However, Cashmore recognises that these sportsmen are but a small proportion of the blacks that are taking up sport, and he takes care to outline the costs as well as the benefits for black males entering sport.

Cashmore rejects the notion that black males are born sportsmen or have natural ability. He sees sporting endeavour as offering black males an avenue of social advancement where other avenues are blocked. Black children are seen to fail at school as a result of lack of parental interest and the negative expectations of teachers who channel black children into sporting activities at the expense of their academic education. Despite the potential benefits of sporting activity Cashmore concludes that,

Sport conceals deep, structured inequalities and for all the positive benefits it yields, it remains a source of hope for blacks only as long as these inequalities remain.

While Cashmore's message is clear, his methodology is suspect. He relies heavily on the statements of his informants without presenting any other substantial empirical data to support his claims. He does not present the parents' or the teachers' view
of things, for example.

In *Black Sportsmen* Cashmore does not tackle the question of why certain sports, and even certain events and particular activities within the same sporting area, attract black youth more than other sports. This is not necessary to his argument. He does not attempt to define what he means by the term 'black'. He leaves this to our common-sense notions, and to a certain extent this works in the context of the book. The contributors to *Black Youth in Crisis* cannot afford this luxury. Rex points out that black youths come from different cultural environments into different cultural environments, and that responses can vary widely as a result. Responses should be linked to conditions 'on the ground'. In this way Asian youth can be brought into the picture, although Rex points out the difficulties in incorporating black females into any analysis.

Rex is joined by Fisher and Joshua in calling for more empirical research in this area. The latter contributors challenge the popular assumption, present within Cashmore's work, that there is a generation gap resulting in conflict between the black teenager and black parent. They point to the scarcity of empirical evidence to support this view of the immigrant generation as conformist in contrast to their children.

In all, *Black Youth in Crisis* contains nine chapters from a variety of contributors covering topics from Rastafarianism to the way in which social policy has exacerbated the crisis in which many black youths find themselves. However the most interesting contribution for me is that provided by Fuller. She describes the responses of a group of black school-girls in a London comprehensive school to the experience of both racial and sexual subordination. She gives the reader some insight into the way the category 'black' is being used sociologically. Quoting Miles and Panacklee she says that 'it is the unique experience of racial exclusion that is the essence of black ethnicity.' She claims that the black experience in a white-dominated society is similar to the female experience in a male-dominated society. The black girls at Torville School are conscious of both forms of domination, but surprisingly this double exclusion and domination gives rise to a positive sense of their worth. Not surprisingly they found difficulty in having this sense of worth acknowledged by others outside the group.

The recognition of the type of research needed in the future by the contributors to *Black Youth in Crisis* and epitomised by Fuller's work bodes well for ethnography. The detailed case study is unanimously recognised as the way forward. While holding reservations about Cashmore's work, I would recommend both books in that they open up new lines of inquiry, and in doing so expose many assumptions about black youth which have little empirical basis.

P.L. HARDING

Holm has produced a book more on the times than on the life of Willie Seaweed and more an effective catalogue of his works than a monograph on the artist, his society, and the ritual objects he made. The accompanying text gives a personalistic and impressionistic account of the environment, which with the aid of excellent illustrations attempts to weave the reader into the world of Willie Seaweed.

Hitamas or Kwaxitola (Smoky-Top; anglicised name, Willie Seaweed) was, until his death in 1967, one of the most influential traditionalists who helped preserve and uphold the indigenous cultural traditions of the Canadian North-west peoples during the difficult years from the 1880s into the sixth decade of the present century. By the year of his birth, 1873, the densely populated Pacific cultures had already experienced substantial transformations as a result of contact with European merchants. However, as a result of the tortuous prolongations of the inlets jutting deep into the forest-clad mainlands, contact was largely limited to the outer coast of Vancouver Island and the smaller islands to the north-west. Nevertheless, by 1843 there was a string of seven forts pertaining to the Hudson Bay Company, each engaged in a bilateral trade, receiving furs from the local populations in exchange for woollen cloth, blankets, steel tools, muskets, and various forms of adornments. Some indigenous groups were attracted to the forts and consolidated extra-tribal groupings, better to obtain the advantages of their presence.

The introduction of new materials and better tools with which to fashion them resulted primarily in an extremely creative efflorescence of ritual objects with a concomitant exploration of style and form, which complemented fundamental indigenous values. The 19th century was also a time, however, when disease decimated large parts of the population, the smallpox epidemic of 1862 alone being responsible for the loss of perhaps one-third of the coastal population. The ravages caused by the epidemic were further augmented by the introduction of the ethnocidal laws of 1876 prohibiting the celebration of potlatch ceremonies and any form of dance. These laws held force for seventy-five years and were not repealed until the submission of a decree in 1951. One can surmise that whereas changes in territorial situation and material culture, with a complementary effect on artistic tradition, were proceeding well before the 1870s, it was only later that any concerted effort was mounted to diminish the importance of the core elements of the Pacific North-Western cultural area.

Hitamas, descended from high birth and through the traditional life passages of Kwakiutl society, was from the beginning placed in an ambiguous situation. His position as a chief,
which rested on the fulfilment of ceremonial obligations, clustered around the potlatch, and his inheritance of certain dance forms and accompanying masks from his successive marriages to the daughters of other chiefly lines, together placed him in an ambiguous situation in relation to the 1876 ordinance prohibiting the exercise of the manifestation of such standings. The consequent life of Hitamas is an exemplar of an Indian people's dignity in the face of provocation by the metropolitan society, and was in this case a life lived largely outside the boundaries of the law.

Holm provides a brief historical context in which he places the evolution of the artist's work, a work fastidiously inscribed within the traditional values of the Kwakiutl society in which he participated, and in which he fulfilled the obligations implied by his status, guiding his community to observe and uphold their complement of the same. Other than his achievements in formal oratory and dance, Hitamas was an extremely accomplished sculptor who exercised his prerogatives not only in reproducing the expression of ideological form, but in providing the apparatus on which the means of recreating the deeds of the ancestors and the stories of the spirit world depended, and therefore the gloss on which the hierarchical organisation of the society relied.

Hitamas was prolific as a sculptor and it must be said that it is to this aspect of his life that the book is dedicated. Holm has identified over 120 examples of his work which include masks, totem-poles, and wall-panels, but the contribution of the author to anthropology is that he is able to demonstrate effectively the nature of individual creativity within the constraints of plastic expression recognized by his society, and in consequence plot the boundary between individuality and its concomitant compromise with traditional form derived from the collectivity. With Hitamas, personal style is expressed in the form of strong geometrical designs and excessive formalism. This is particularly brought out in the carvings of rattles and head-dresses where his style contrasts with the generally flowing styles of his accomplices.

That Holm's book is more a catalogue of the artistic achievements of Hitamas than a biography is, moreover, confirmed by its entry as such under the Library of Congress classification number at the front, perhaps a little travesty on the part of the publishers. Ethnographic intent is minimal, though there is an ambitious if not always successful attempt to identify the person and function of the masks he has assembled. The monograph would have gained much if it had discussed the use of the ritual objects in their ceremonial integration in rites of transition connected with the dry-season and wet-season ceremonies, and their transmission through inheritance and the resulting prestige they confer on their receivers. Despite these reservations, Holm has presented a fortuitous monograph of the work of one artist which stands as a recognition and a tribute to the value of indigenous culture. Such a work implies
a growing consciousness of the indigenous cultural achievement
and as such a stimulus to that tradition.

ANTHONY A. SHELTON

PARMANAND LAL and BIMAN KUMAR DAS GUPTA, Lower Siang People: A
Study in Ecology and Society, Calcutta: Anthropological Survey
of India 1979. 156pp., Bibliography, 8 Plates.

Anthropology is a well recognised activity in India, and there
are several hundred professionals who are primarily social
rather than biological anthropologists. However, it is the
Indian sociologists who receive most of the international
recognition, while the work of their tribalist colleagues is
often ignored by academic journals. Part of the reason is no
doubt the disappointing quality of so many of the publications,
even from major organisations such as the A.S.I.

Siang is the name given to the Brahmaputra river as it
pierces the Himalayas, so the tribes described here (mainly
Gallon and Minyong) live about 100 miles N.W. of the Kachin.
Field-work was conducted over some three months in 1968-9. Such
a short period does not automatically condemn one to super­
ficiality - Geoffrey Gorer's 1938 book on the Lepchas of Sikkim
showed how much can be achieved in three months by a determined
ethnographer armed with a theoretical orientation and two months'
work on the language, and staying in a single village. But the
present authors attempted to survey four villages (or five, or
six - their statements vary), give no evidence of acquaintance
with the published materials on the language, and have no clear
aim apart from providing 'data'.

The reader is antagonised at once on finding that pp. 9-12
are borrowed without acknowledgement from Sachin Roy's incom­
parably better Aspects of Padam - Minyong Culture (1960: 12-16);
the copying is largely verbatim, though careless. Pages 38-9
and a shorter passage on p. 82 come from the same authority.
The plagiarism is probably the work of the first co-author, a
geographer. Perhaps the practice is less poorly regarded in
India than here - I have remarked on another example in the
literature on the Byansi (adjacent to N.W. Nepal).

In so far as any attempt is made to relate the study to the
previous literature it is half-hearted. The scanty biblio­
graphy omits, for instance, B.S. Guha's relevant booklet (n.d.,
probably 1956) on the youth dormitories of the area. The priest
Mogum Loya of Kaba village (p.116) is surely the Mogum Loya, one
of whose chants was published in text and translation in an
admirable little book by the anthropologically untrained Tumpak Ete in 1974. No attempt is made to compare the Minyong kinship terminology with Roy's, though as the data is so lacunary (omitting *inter alia* MP, MBC, D, ZC) perhaps it would be unprofitable.

Even in the present economic climate some Indian publishers still set high standards (cf. for instance J.S. Lall (ed.), *The Himalaya: Aspects of Change*, from C.U.P. Delhi 1981). It may be unfair for native speakers to criticise the quality of non-natives' use of English, but the book's utility is much reduced by the lack of maps, glossary and index, and by the abysmal copy-editing and proof-reading. Within eight lines (p. 144) *dorum Nisam* changes to *dorum nicam* and *sllitaug* to *silitaung*. No doubt some snippets of information are both new and reliable, but they are hard to identify in such a setting.

N. J. ALLEN


Laurence K. L. Siaw describes his book as a simplified version of a Ph. D. thesis, revised for the ordinary reader. What it offers is a chronologically arranged history of a Chinese immigrant settlement in the interior of Negri Sembilan over the period 1870-1960. Although derived from a thesis in a department of anthropology and sociology, in its published form the book might easily have been prepared as a thesis in history or political science. The only analytic idea mentioned comes from Max Weber and makes an incidental contribution to the argument. The book's particular interest is that it is an account in academically level and dispassionate tones of Chinese relationships in British Malaysia by a Chinese scholar. The activities of the Japanese occupying force during 1942-1945 are described with forthright attention to their effects on Chinese life and attitudes, particularly in relation to the cold-blooded Japanese massacre of the entire hamlet of Jelundong in March 1942. The Communists in their various transformations - from a largely Chinese political movement, to British-trained anti-Japanese guerrillas, to would-be post-war governors, to anti-British guerrillas under the suppression of the Emergency - are depicted with understanding, but without idealization. The British receive the same detached scrutiny, although Laurence Siaw's politeness combined with his determination to describe things as
he sees them produces some odd results, as in the following rather tortured sentence: 'Granted the noble motives of early British administrators in extending the Pax Britannica to troubled corners of the earth when invited to do so by warring native chiefs, the early history of Titi shows quite clearly that the imposition of British rule over Jelebu was of great economic benefit to the British themselves.' In Chinese eyes the British always played with a stacked deck, until they could play no more. The book however is marked by a large silence on one crucial topic, namely the place of the Chinese in Malay society and the Malay state. The index entry for Malays lists 'relations between the British and', 'attitudes towards life', and 'relations between the Japanese and', but does not mention Malay ties to the Chinese. The author is so discreet that if the reader had to rely on this book alone he would have no idea who replaced the British in the post-Independence government and might even get the impression that the Malays were a group of secondary importance in colonial Malaya. The book is thus incomplete. It is useful to those interested in both overseas Chinese life and in Malaysia, but it requires previous knowledge of both subjects.

R. H. BARNES


This is an introductory text for history students clearly intended as a supplementary text. The subjects of this work are various Indian groups who, in the last three centuries, occupied various parts of North America. These groups spread from James Bay in the north to the Gulf of Mexico in the south, the Mississippi River in the west to the Atlantic coast in the east.

Axtell focuses on the sex roles and life cycle of aboriginal North Americans. The text is divided into seven sections representing the life cycle. Each section consists of an introduction then a series of separately introduced excerpts from primary historical sources which deal with sex roles and the life cycle.

The primary historical sources used are from among the most widely cited and oft relied upon of historical sources which deal with North American Indians. The selected excerpts are generally short, clear and to the point. Axtell makes no claims of being authoritative, exhaustive, or analytical but openly admits that anthropologists may well find this work lacking.
In the author's own terms he has managed to produce an admirable supplementary text.

I don't, however, accept all of Axtell's assumptions and I do think that serious flaws mar this work. Rather than provide his audience with a wide range of primary historical sources, ten sources are repeatedly used to provide the bulk of sixty-seven excerpts. This over-emphasis on a small number of primary sources masks the wealth of published information available and distorts the authoritativeness of those sources selected. Sagard may be an excellent early 17th-century source for dealing with the Huron but so is Samuel de Champlain. I find it disconcerting that the former is repeatedly cited while the latter is ignored when both authors contributed equally valuable information to Axtell's choice of topics. When Axtell does stray from his main sources I am left with the unpleasant impression that much of what remains can be best described as filler.

The most serious problem with primary sources in this text is in its omissions. There are neither excerpts from archival sources nor references to the vast volumes of primary source material to be found in the archives of North America or Europe. The treatment of historical problems of interpretation is given light coverage. The cultural bias of early recorders is well presented but the cultural bias of the native population and its effect on the experiences of the early recorders is left unconsidered. Nor has the possibility been considered that many primary historical sources are but poor plagiarisms of earlier works on fiction concocted for the fame and fortune of the author. Any work that introduces primary historical sources to the student should clearly present the range of materials available and the labyrinth of errors to be encountered if primary sources are not treated with the utmost caution.

One final criticism worth making is, quite simply, that it is grossly misleading to suggest that historical works dealing with social and cultural questions should be exempt from anthropological criticism simply because they are historical. This neither promotes good scholarship nor an adequate understanding of either discipline's contributions to the resolution of mutual concerns.

In spite of these criticisms Axtell's book fills a gap in the student literature available on Native North Americans and this in itself reflects well on his efforts.

C.J. WHEELER
Introduction

The Group for Anthropology in Policy and Practice (GAPP) is a non-official body, based in the United Kingdom, which was formed in April 1981 in response to the job famine for trained research anthropologists. According to its second newsletter:

GAPP has two main aims: to promote the active involve­ment of social anthropology in the making and imple­mentation of policies, increasing the quality and quantity of that involvement; [and] to encourage the anthropological profession to take account of the experiences of this involvement in teaching and research, and [in] its main theoretical activities.1

Thus GAPP is not a job-finder or placement agency, but a forum promoting the idea of anthropologists working in non-academic situations, both among anthropologists themselves, and among their potential employers.

One of GAPP's activities towards this end - planned especially for the future - is a series of one-day workshops, held in various parts of the country. On Saturday 29 October 1983 I represented the Institute of Social Anthropology (University of Oxford) at one of these workshops, which was held at the London School of Economics, as a follow-up to a similar one of an experimental nature conducted previously at Sussex University. The registration fee was £2, though current SSRC students were able to recoup this cost, as well as travel and subsistence costs, from the SSRC.

The aim of these workshops is to simulate certain non-academic situations in which an anthropologist might work. In the one I attended, six fictional contexts were provided initially:

Education. The Birchester Education Authority is planning to close down a number of secondary schools. Such is the uproar when they decide to close the Sir Ezra Simon School which serves a largely Asian immigrant community that the Authority decides to conduct an investigation.

---

Health. A consultant in gastro-enterology is concerned about the numbers of alcoholics occupying beds in establishments provided by the Bloomsberry Inner City Health District since there is nowhere to refer the patients. A study of alcoholism treatment services in the area is required.

Industry. Chipo Ltd is trying to rationalise its operations in order to increase profitability but has run into problems of strikes. Because the labour force is largely immigrant the directors feel that their shop floor managers and the Union representatives are not communicating and a study by someone who knows about immigrants is required.

Overseas Development. The Atlantis Development Bank has put out for tender a study of energy utilisation in Zingali in order to construct an energy plan for the country. Of the six large firms which are tendering, two feel that the social aspects are crucial and are putting their proposals accordingly.

Social Services. In a rapidly urbanising part of rural Turnshire there have been a number of problems with adolescents. Turnshire Social Services would like to undertake some preventative work with these children and the first step is considered to be a social study of the community.

Urban Planning. The Ditchback Deprivation Project has been commissioned to find out the needs of the Ditchback area and how these might be met by voluntary initiatives fostered by the Community Council. Other commitments of the Council have to be borne in mind.2

It should be emphasized that, except perhaps in the development option, these were regarded not as jobs for an anthropologist specifically, but as jobs for social scientists that an anthropologist could do.

The workshop was attended by over fifty students and departmental representatives - in the ratio of perhaps five to one - who were divided into groups of about five to seven, according to choice of subject. However, presumably because of their popularity, the development and social services sections were divided into two groups, while for lack of support the industry section was dropped altogether. Otherwise, each option had just one group, under the guidance of a GAPP anthropologist experienced in that particular field. Departmental representatives were given the opportunity to circulate and observe all the groups at will, or to take part in just one group; most,

---

2 Extract from 'Outline of the Workshop' (workshop information sheet), GAPP, unpublished. Quoted by kind permission.
including myself, seem to have opted for the latter, in the belief that this would be more instructive as to the methods used by the workshop, and accordingly I participated in one of the overseas development groups.

**Plan of the Workshop**

Each group collectively played the part of 'the anthropologist' working either alone, or as part of a team of specialists in various technical, economic, etc., fields, on the social aspects of a particular problem/case study. Apart from the introduction, the day was divided into five sessions. The first was devoted to establishing the anthropological content of the project, and the problems the anthropologist was expected to research, in the context of the employer's terms of reference for the particular project. The second was devoted to methods (fieldwork, library research, use of informants, etc.), establishing a timetable and budget, recruitment of local staff, etc. The third session was concerned to draw up concrete proposals for research to present to the customer, whose 'representative' then considered the report in the fourth session. In the fifth session all the different groups came together to report on their case studies, and common problems and feelings were discussed. Evaluation forms were completed (anonymously) by all participants (including GAPP staff) before dispersal at six p.m.

**The Development Workshop - Formulating the Proposals**

Since in the development case there were two groups, an added element of authenticity came from the feeling that both were competing for the tender being offered by the Development Bank that was funding the project. Here, the anthropologist was the lowest-paid member of a consultancy team that included two foresters, two engineers, an economist, a co-ordinator, and a director responsible on a part-time basis for the project; the consultancy firm was one that regarded the social aspects of its development work as important, and stressed this fact to staff and customers alike.

The subject of the case study was a fictitious Third World country divided ecologically into three zones (a desert coastal strip, heavily urbanized and developed, and with most of the population; a hill area, with pastoralism and small-scale agriculture; and an inland tropical forest, little penetrated, save by a few hunting and gathering groups, and with a little subsistence agriculture); only a bare minimum of information was available, however, leaving the team with a wide range of possibilities to take into account. The project as a whole was a study of rural energy utilization and future requirements, and
the anthropologist - chosen in part as one of the few people who had studied the language - was expected to comment on the existing social constraints that might inhibit popular acceptance of changes in rural energy provision, and the future social implications of such changes.

Throughout these sessions the emphasis was very much on the customer's requirements, and on tailoring the tender proposals to meet them. This had two particular results for the anthropologist. First, there was a tendency, at least initially, for one's attention to wander into consideration of technical and economic problems - essentially the briefs of other experts - rather than concentrating on social implications. For example, rather a lot of time was devoted to the technicalities of fuel alternatives rather than simply establishing them as options. Secondly, any moral or ethical misgivings that the anthropologist might have had concerning his part in the project - which would inevitably disturb traditional ways of life - was lost in the rush to present an acceptable, competitive tender to the customer. For instance, the concern expressed for the fate of the hunting and gathering groups, faced with the possible loss of their forests through commercial exploitation for fuel and timber, was brushed aside by the CAPP expert, who frequently guillotined discussion of such irrelevancies in order to keep to the timetable. By the third session, we were discussing the prospect of over-turning existing relationships with perfect equanimity, to give but one example. (In fairness, however, it should be pointed out that the other study groups tended to discuss questions of principle rather more extensively.)

The Development Workshop - Presenting the Proposals

Equally instructive were the reactions of the 'representative' of the Development Bank to the tenders of the two groups. In real life this 'representative' was an anthropologically-trained employee of the Overseas Development Corporation. As the 'customer', he questioned the concept of the anthropologist being an important part of the team, and rejected the proposed amount of time devoted to anthropological research on the project (allowing just one month at the start, instead of the full six-month life of the project). He stressed the need for the customer's requirements to be very well-known to the consultants (who should demonstrate their awareness of this fact), and that tenders should strive to meet them. The tender report should certainly deal with potential problems that have escaped the customer's attention, but only insofar as this is of benefit to the customer and does not criticize his overall aims. Such insights might impress the customer sufficiently for him to award that particular tender, but unsympathetic comments will clearly alienate him. In short, the use of an anthropologist on such projects could only be justified by the usefulness of its results to the customer.
As an anthropologist, the 'representative' pointed out two potential conflicts: between the anthropologist's ethical position and the client's needs; and over the speed with which data has to be collected and analyzed under such conditions, when compared with pure research. Nonetheless, he emphasised the need for anthropologists to think and act positively, proving to potential customers that they have valuable special skills just as much as economic or technical experts. This he mentioned as one of the cardinal aims of the workshop. To quote again from the newsletter:

'Anthropologists must learn to sell themselves; and they must also set out to convince potential users of their capacities.'

Conclusion

On the whole the workshop was well and economically organised, and the time-table worked reasonably efficiently. It would have been useful to have had more time to correlate the findings of the various groups, but as this obviously had to be the last part of the time-table, it was perhaps inevitable that it should come under pressure. However, in the final session it emerged that not every group had felt that the anthropologist had to be treated as a dispensable, nominal figure on the research team. The social services group, for example, were able to suggest the social workers themselves as one potential difficulty in their case study, in that they might be more inclined to identify the existence of a 'problem' in relation to the adolescent girls in their care than were the girls themselves. One inference to be drawn from this may be that the most suitable practical role for the anthropologist, with his or her ideals of objectivity, open-mindedness and non-interference, is not as part of a team of researchers, but as an observer independent of both the team and the object of their research, with the task of assessing their interaction and identifying possible difficulties arising from it. In this way the anthropologist would be employing his or her unique training and attitudes without compromising the above-mentioned ideals. Persuading potential employers of this fact would be another matter, however.

Overall, the workshop provided one with a clear and dramatic demonstration of the differences between the luxuries of pure research and the pressures and compromises of applied anthropology. It can definitely be recommended to anyone thinking of following up a research degree with a non-academic, but relevant post, since it will certainly convey an idea of what such a post might entail. Every effort was made to provide a faithful

3 'Aims, Plans, Policies', p.l.
simulation, and no effort was made to convert participants to a particular point of view; the emphasis was on letting the situation speak for itself. Nonetheless, the actual commitment of the group leaders to applied anthropology was evident, as was the amoral ethos of 'getting the job done'. It is to be hoped that these workshops will continue, not as training for applied anthropology - which in any case is not the intention - but in helping the individual to form an attitude to its merits and ethics.

R. J. PARKIN

RECENT RESEARCH IN THE SUDAN

In mid-November of last year (1983) a two-day seminar was held at the Institute of Social Anthropology, Oxford, on 'Recent Research in the Sudan'. It was organised by Dr Wendy James and attended by students of the social anthropology of the Sudan from Oxford and elsewhere. Dr James had recently returned from an extended stay in the Sudan where she had met a number of researchers from Europe, and had conceived the seminar as an opportunity for as many as possible of those researching into this subject to meet and discuss their work and the problems of carrying out research. This latter topic, though much discussed informally, did not, however, emerge particularly strongly in the seminar itself.

The contributions of Oxford scholars to the study of the Sudan is well known, with major studies by E.E. Evans-Pritchard, Godfrey Lienhardt, Jean Buxton and Wendy James, among others. There is still much interest in the area at the Institute, where there are a number of students with an interest in and experience of the Sudan working towards postgraduate degrees.

As well as students and scholars from Oxford, participants were also invited from Cambridge, Berlin and Rome. Though this provided an international flavour, it was a great disappointment that there were no Sudanese students present. Gabriel Jal (SOAS), the only Sudanese studying social anthropology in Britain at the time of the seminar as far as the participants were aware, was unable to attend. There was, however, an impressive representation from Berlin, which could become a centre for the social
anthropological study of the Sudan. At present five members of the Berlin Institute - two of whom were at the seminar - are working on a Sudan project called 'World and External World - Social, economic and ideological ways with present-day change by tribal groups', which is being supervised by Dr Kramer and Dr Streck.

There is always a temptation in social anthropology - though perhaps less strongly than formerly - to classify and identify researchers by referring to the people they have studied. Refreshingly there were a number of contributions to the seminar which could not be so classified. Enrico Castelló (Rome), who has been working towards an inventory of ethnological objects in European museums and collections collected by the early travellers of the nineteenth century, reported on his progress so far and on some of his discoveries. Douglas Johnson (UCLA) (who has until recently been working as the Assistant Director for Archives, Ministry of Information and Culture, Southern Regional Government of the Sudan) spoke on the existence, provenance, and usefulness of documentary sources for the fieldworker. He pointed out that though documentary sources have been used mostly for political and administrative history they do contain a variety of information of varying quality and detail on social structure, inter-ethnic relations, health, local economy, relations between indigenous peoples and government, and other topics of interest to social anthropological fieldworkers.

Jeremy Coote (Oxford), who has carried out some fieldwork among the Agar Dinka, 'Jur' of Wrolo, and Mandari, gave a discussion paper on the future directions which the social anthropology of the Sudan (and in particular the Southern Sudan) should take. He maintained that research should become both more general (not taking any form of boundedness of 'peoples' for granted) and more specific, concentrating on individual villages (as with village studies in India) or on particular topics (such as the úak at War Nyang [see below]). Barbara Harrell-Bond (Oxford) reported on research she had recently carried out in YeI River District of Southern Sudan, a region suffering an emergency influx of refugees. Her research aimed to fill the need for intensive field data to inform policy-makers and aid-donors concerning the present status of refugee assistance. The study of refugees is a growing field - they are a new 'people' with a built-in comparative framework provided by their position, the interest of aid agencies, governments, etc.

The other speakers in the seminar concentrated more on 'peoples', though even with these contributions a number of new concerns emerged. John Ryle (Oxford), Andrew Mawson (Cambridge), and Irene Leverenz (Berlin) spoke on the Agar Dinka, amongst whom they had all done research. Ryle's talk attempted to answer the

---

1 Preliminary Reports of the Sudan Research Project, in English or with English summaries, are available in booklet form from: Institut für Ethnologie, Freie Universität, Berlin, Brümmerstrasse 52, 1000 Berlin 32.
question, 'Why are the Agar different from the other Dinka?' The Agar occupy a central position in the geography of Dinkaland - they are the people of the horizon for both western and southern Dinka, though they represent something different to each. Educated non-Agar Dinka, as well as the Agar themselves, maintain that the Agar speak a purer form of the Dinka language and they sometimes ascribe this to their comparative proximity to the mythic source of the Dinka people by the Nile. Non-Agar however tend to regard Agar tribal culture as having been adversely affected by contact with, and absorption of, non-Nilotic peoples to the south. It was Ryle's conclusion that the distinctive features of the Agar and neighbouring groups such as the Apak Atuot can be explained only by much more systematic investigation of key lineages and perhaps a comparison of the luak at War Nyang with other Nilotic shrines.

Mawson and Leverenz presented a joint paper on the major Agar ceremony of the rebuilding of the luak (cattle-byre) of God at War Nyang. Both researchers had gone separately to Agar country to make studies of more mundane matters, only to find that this yearly ceremony was about to take place. After a wait of some months they were privileged to witness it and to be able to record the events leading up to and surrounding the destruction of the old luak and the rebuilding of the new. They did not have the time to assimilate and organise their material before the seminar and consequently presented a preliminary report. At the time of writing (February 1984) both are back in the Sudan and hoping to return to the field.

Joachim Theis (Berlin), also now back in the field, presented the most formal paper of the seminar on 'Hunting, beer and kinship - sketches of inter-ethnic relations in the Yabus Valley (Southern Funj Region)'. Theis carried out some six months' fieldwork among the Koma of the Yabus valley. His first example of inter-ethnic relations was the multi-ethnic hunting party (mata), in which Koma, Ganza, Uduk, Berta and Gwama cooperate. The mata, Theis concluded, symbolizes the unification of different ethnic groups irrespective of boundaries and distinctions. But several aspects of the mata, such as the distribution of the meat on an intra-ethnic scale, also express division of ethnic and territorial groups. By contrasting Berta and Oromo ways of consuming and distributing beer (the centre of social life), on the one hand, and Koma ways of doing so on the other, Theis in his second example pointed to divergent concepts of the ethics of labour and social relationships. Finally, by discussing some aspects of marriage and kinship among the Koma, Theis showed, as had other participants in the seminar, that it is problematic to consider the peoples of the Sudan as clear-cut ethnic groups.

Burkhard Schneipel, another anthropologist from Berlin (though not a member of the project mentioned above) is at present writing a thesis in Oxford about the Shilluk of the Southern Sudan. Schneipel discussed the mystery (both to anthropologists and to the Shilluk themselves) of ritual regicide in the context of other Shilluk patterns of thought, feeling and behaviour. He also made clear that in dealing with a classical anthropological theme such as
'divine kingship', one has to take into account the Western perspectives in which former interpretations (and distortions) of the ethnographic material have taken place.

Ruth Buckley (SOAS) carried out her research in 1981 and 1982 in Payawa, a Kakwa village area with a population of about 2,000. She spoke informally about her research and particularly on what she described as the negotiation of meanings and identities specifically associated with gender, but had widened her concerns to show that not only gender but also kinship, age, education, religious and political affiliations, and even association with development projects, are used by the Kakwa to enhance their positions within Payawa. Indeed, all of these 'resources' are used at different times and in different circumstances depending upon the advantage that can be obtained.

Guro Huby (Trondheim) has also carried out research among Bari-speaking people, concentrating on Bari women in Juba. Huby summarized her thesis, which is based on fieldwork carried out in 1975-76 and 1978-79. The main argument is that Bari society has retained essential features of the old Bari pastoral gerontocracy in spite of radical changes over more than a century in the political and economic situation, and in their social and natural habitats. She argued that the Bari people as a social entity is being kept intact by the process of exchange of women and bridewealth between lineages, and that the old men are retaining control over this process.

Gerd Baumann (Belfast and Oxford) briefly described his research interests in the Nuba Mountains, based on fieldwork in 1976 and 1978-79. His fieldwork had focused on economic development, cultural change, and ethnomusicological interests. Much of Nuba Mountain ethnography shows a tendency to treat Nuba groups as isolated from their surroundings. Baumann's present work is concerned to show the interaction of the Nuba of Miri with other groups of the region. Miri villagers have experience of rural development and local government, and have accepted Arabic as a second language and Islam as their religion. A book presently being prepared by Baumann will give attention to their economic and cultural participation in provincial and national life and the internal changes that such participation has brought with it.

Wendy James gave an outline of the fresh research she had begun in Juba during part of the sabbatical year (1982-83) she had spent in the Sudan. This included research into 'Juba Arabic', the language of the streets. Increasingly widely used, and now a mother-tongue for some Juba families, the language has been officially scorned and academically neglected. The second aspect of James's research was the ambivalent ethnic category 'Nubi', particularly in connection with the growth of towns in the Southern Sudan. Work also included the collection and study of a body of transcripts from the cycle of radio plays put out by the Sudan Council of Churches' studio at Juba. A remarkably rich picture of the current dilemmas and conflicts of Juba life is reflected in these plays. Dr James hopes eventually to continue this research, and to bring together the various aspects of this study of changing Southern Sudanese society.
The seminar was wide-ranging, but with so many speakers in just one and a half days there was little time for formal discussion, and no firm conclusions were reached. A recent article by a leading Sudanese anthropologist has criticised non-Sudanese scholars by painting a vivid picture of two kinds of anthropologist: 'those students who come to do "exotic" fieldwork' and 'professional anthropologists who come as "experts" even if they have never been in the Sudan before.' Neither category, it is argued, has sufficient commitment to the country, being merely concerned 'to get their degree' or, presumably, 'to earn a fast buck'. Such a view of expatriate researchers must be taken seriously. The advantages we can sometimes have over indigenous scholars are enormous. Too often the research results to which so many Sudanese themselves have contributed never find their way back to the Sudan, and are consumed - if at all - only by the academic community in the West.

The participants in the seminar were, however, united by their concern for the Sudanese peoples they have lived with and learned from. As the country enters another difficult period in its history, it becomes even more important that students and scholars can meet in places like Oxford, London, Cambridge and Berlin to discuss the Sudan, its history, and its peoples.

JEREMY COOTE
BURKHARD SCHNEFEL

OXFORD UNIVERSITY ANTHROPOLOGICAL SOCIETY

The O.U.A.S., which was founded on January 28th, 1909, recently celebrated its 75th anniversary. A gathering for members and guests was held at the Museum of Modern Art in Oxford, where fittingly the RAI exhibition of early anthropological photographs - 'Observers of Man' - was currently on show.

The Society, which exists to promote the study of anthropology in all its aspects, still meets regularly during term for evening talks by invited speakers from Oxford and elsewhere.

Anyone wishing to obtain further information about the Society should contact the Hon. Sec., c/o Institute of Social Anthropology, 51 Banbury Road, Oxford.


BOGSCH, Lise Marie, The Reconstruction of Labor: Women and Economic Choice in Four Guatemalan Communities, Alabama; State University of New York Press 1984. xi, 370pp., References, Index, Plates. £20.00 (cloth), £12.40 (paper).


MOSCH, Jooyeon, Women as Heads of Households in the Caribbean: Family Structure and Feminine Status, Paris: UNESCO 1983. 61pp., Appendix, References. £3.75. (Obtainable through RMS in the United Kingdom.)
