
David Kertzer’s book is, as he states in his preface, mainly designed for an American public.

To most Americans [he explains], the strength of the Italian Communist Party is a great mystery. Associated with dark visions of totalitarianism and inevitably linked to Moscow, it is difficult for Americans to understand the appeal the Communist party has in Italy. That almost one third of Italian voters cast their ballots for the P.C.I. in 1979 is, in this perspective, a great enigma, unfathomable in the land of the Holy See.

According to Kertzer, sociological work on the topic of Church-Communist Party relations adds little to our understanding. Italian analyses are polemical and have little social scientific value, while American studies have a politically tinged heritage, though until recently all the partisans have been on one side. Noteworthy in this context is the cold war tradition of Almond and Cantril, in which Communism is treated as a disease and the Communist party is described as 'a special haven for the alienated' (an interesting reversal of Soviet psychiatric practice on which a study of Foucault - via Durkheim - might possibly help us shed some light!).

Kertzer’s study is, then, 'to provide a glimpse into the social fabric of the Euro-communist experience' as well as 'an introduction to Church-Communist relations in Italy, focussing on the way in which the national conflict is played out in one local setting'. The book develops along two mutually relevant but separate lines: one is Kertzer's ethnography of a working-class neighbourhood in Communist-administered Bologna, the other his reconstruction of Church-Communist Party relations from about 1860, when Italy achieved national unity, to the late 1970s - that is, after his fieldwork was completed.

The fascinating history of the Church's relations, first with the Italian state and then with Italy's left-wing forces, is re-told in terms of the notion of a 'Catholic world', and of a lay or, later, 'Communist world'. Indeed as Kertzer explains, a clear-cut distinction between these two opposed and at times dangerously polarized political orientations originated with Italian unity itself, when, having to renounce temporal power, Pope Pius IX urged all Catholics to boycott the new state and initiated a policy of strong spiritual and social control. There
thus developed, in opposition to liberal and 'modernist' Catholic tendencies, a strong 'integralist' movement, the aim of which was to render unnecessary any institutions other than Church-inspired ones. According to integralist doctrine, the whole of an individual's life should be, more or less conspicuously, ruled by the Church, in areas such as education, employment and nursing assistance, as well as in the organization of free time and entertainment; the Church was thus to maintain its political power through its direct and steady influence on the lives of individuals by providing for needs which, in contemporary societies, are usually catered for by lay social and civil servants. (Indeed it was through his observation of the Church's power over people's minds that Gramsci, who was to exercise a very strong intellectual influence on the Italian Communist Party after World War Two, developed his notion of hegemony.)

A rapprochement between the Church and Italy's political and industrial leaders began to take place only in the 1890s, when the Socialist Party, founded in 1892, started to gather a large following, especially in the industrial North, and it was precisely after the first national strike in 1904 that Catholics were finally encouraged to vote and to take an active part in Italy's political life. The Church's control over religious education and its monopoly over individual rites of passage were strongly reinforced during Fascism; and the 1929 Concordat between the Church and the state, in which Catholicism was declared the state religion, initiated a period of co-operation between the state and the Catholic hierarchy which was to last well beyond Mussolini's government.

Antagonism between the Church and the left-wing consequently took on new vehemence after the end of World War Two, when the Communist party, strongly identified with the anti-Fascist Resistance movement, gathered a large number of adherents throughout Italy, particularly in Central Italy's 'Red Belt', while the ruling Christian Democratic Party continued the close co-operation between Church and state initiated with Mussolini's Lateran Agreements. In an effort to maintain its position, the Church threatened with excommunication those Catholics who spread Communist ideas or participated in Communist activities. During the forties and fifties Communist propaganda was, on the other hand, no less violent in its denunciations of the Vatican, while in the sixties - through a number of factors more complex than Kertzer's account implies - the Church's political influence suffered a decline.

Kertzer's historical account is effective and well documented. On some points, however, incisiveness is achieved at the expense of accuracy. For instance, a point which is nowhere sufficiently emphasized is the extent to which the Church's main antagonists during the first thirty years of Italian unity were the liberal bourgeois oligarchy who had led the country to unification and who constituted its social and political elite. The general movement towards secularization and the presence of centre political forces, which still represent the most vigorous oppo-
ponents of Church interference in political matters, are therefore hardly acknowledged throughout Kertzer's book. This may partly be due to the social composition of Albora, where centre forces are indeed conspicuously absent - a fact which throws fully into relief the difficulties of illustrating national (let alone European) social phenomena on the basis of a local study.

David Kertzer's fieldwork in Albora was conducted mostly in 1972-73, a period of relative truce between the Communist Party and the Church which followed John XXIII's papacy and the Vatican Council's withdrawal of its excommunication order against Communists. During this period Communist leaders also sought to modify their unbending anti-clericalism of early revolutionary days. Paradoxically, however, while the Church had, at least in theory, given up its militant 'integralism', the Communists themselves had for some time started to develop integralist ambitions: the Party was now to penetrate society through a 'capillary action', and was to create infra-structures which would eventually grant it a position similar to that held in the past by the Church itself. New Party members were no more to be sought through ideological conversion; on the contrary, individuals or whole families were to be absorbed into the 'Communist world' through their participation in popular feste and in a variety of Communist-sponsored social occasions. There thus began a 'battle for ritual supremacy', with the Communist Party and the Church competing rather like Pueblo Indians or Melanesian Big Men to sponsor village and parish festivities.

Research in Albora, where the Communist Party has 'un-contested dominance', and where the Church is, as Kertzer makes clear, 'un-typically weak', leads him to make some interesting observations on Italian attitudes to ritual. For, while rites of community are now almost exclusively sponsored by the Communists, individual rites of passage (weddings, christenings, communions, confirmations and funerals) are still monopolized by the Church, and despite Albora's long-standing anti-clerical tradition a person who never attended Church would be regarded as unusual.

Unfortunately this fact which possibly represents the book's most interesting conclusion is not treated with any insight. An indication that it may be related to Italian family structure is hinted at but the difficult topic of relations between kinship and politics, which is neatly summed up in Kertzer's translation of a Bolognese satirical poem, 'But, alas, Grandmama', is nowhere analytically explored. Indeed for a number of reasons, some of a theoretical and some of a stylistic nature, Kertzer's ethnography does not entirely live up to its fascinating historical background. Ethnographic description and historical or statistical data are worked in together in the same chapters, so that, while Kertzer's exposition is enlivened by short biographical sketches of Communist Party members or Christian Democratic leaders, and also by such descriptions as of Communist Youth electioneering at Bologna station or morning Mass in one of Albora's churches, nevertheless his book lacks the coherence and unity which alone can engage the reader's attention in ethno-
graphic description. On the contrary, the reader is constantly shifted from foreground to background. The ethnography therefore remains rather fragmentary, while the history is presented as a series of digressions or explanatory flashbacks.

Despite Kertzer's prolonged fieldwork, his informants remain rather one-dimensional beings, since his concern with political activities leads him to isolate certain moments and aspects of their daily existence, such as the meeting, the interview situation or the festa - at the expense of a fuller anthropological account, which would eventually shed more light on politics itself. As a result Albora never comes to life as a nucleus of social as distinct from Party or parish life.

This lack of analytical depth may be due to Kertzer's theoretical bias, which, as he states in his Introduction, leads him to focus on the social rather than on the ideological bases of allegiance. This anti-ideological (or a-ideological) stand is repeatedly stated; the view that a system of beliefs can serve as a basis for social groupings is, in Kertzer's opinion, 'an assertion of dubious merit; it is more accurate to see the groupings and activities as primary and the beliefs as derivative'. The Communist Party's post-Vatican Council behavioural stand and its leaders' confidence that 'once social allegiances change, ideological commitments will eventually follow' perfectly coincides, then, with Kertzer's theoretical approach. But can a political party's recruiting tactics or even a widespread disenchantment with political ideologies really become a useful strategy for anthropological research?

Some implications of Kertzer's theoretical position are discussed in the book's final chapter:

Given a social conception of the nature of religion [he writes], there appears to be no reason why the Church could not be substituted by the Party as the fount of all ritual. If ritual, as Durkheim portrayed it, is essentially the expression of societal sovereignty over the individual, the transcendental character of ritual does not consist of a prior belief in the supernatural; rather the supernatural quality is a product of the social experience ....

The fact that the Party has not succeeded in replacing the Church as the sponsor of rites of passage should be seen as the result of an organizational failure ....

Indeed, in Kertzer's view, attachment to religion in the Soviet Union is not satisfactorily explained through psychological interpretations of the ritual impulse. In defence of the social perspective he therefore concludes that

... the discontent with state sponsored rites of passage in Communist nations could be attributed either to insufficient appreciation by the authorities of the importance of creating a satisfying symbol system for rites of passage or to dissatisfaction of the people with the symbolism of the Party.
The difficulty here seems mainly to hinge on Kertzer's unhappy combination of Marxism with Durkheimian sociology and on his narrowly materialist interpretation of Durkheim's *faits sociaux*. 'Social' in Kertzer's usage seems to be identified with 'material' or 'practical' and clearly excludes the 'symbolic order' which it is simply thought to produce in an act of continuous creation. His account of Italian ritual therefore excludes a priori the mutually shaping interplay of ideology and praxis. Making no allowances for the fact that Durkheim's hypotheses in *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life* have a chronological as well as a sociological dimension, Kertzer draws on Durkheim's explanation of the origins of ritual and religion in a hypothetical, very primitive, and clearly stateless, social setting - and then applies it to today's complex socio-political phenomena. As a result, social symbols and creeds which, in Durkheim's view, would be created at times of great 'collective effervescence', would be turned out - in the Europe of the 1970s - on instruction from the appropriate bureaucrats, like shoes or loaves of bread, on a purely supply and demand basis. Fortunately this is conjecture, as is, I hope, the foreshadowed vision of 'authorities', be they priests or commissars, busily 'creating a satisfying symbol system'.

In the book's final chapter, the 'two-world concept', which clearly provided the basic structure for Kertzer's study, is, after all, found 'inadequate' - on the grounds that it accounts for values and norms, rather than actual behaviour. Similarly the Gramscian notion of hegemony - which, although (Kertzer concedes) is 'a more fertile concept in understanding the Church-Communist struggle', and though it does recognize social factors, it nevertheless 'accentuates the ideological nature of the political process'. Unfortunately for Kertzer's argument, Gramsci's notion of hegemony, which obviously exercised a keen influence on the Italian Communist Party over the last thirty years, concerns precisely those ideological aspects of society to which Kertzer believes 'our Western intellectualistic heritage' has wrongly led us to grant primacy over social forces. The result is that the creative impact of art forms, traditions and ideas on society is not acknowledged, and Gramsci's revision of Leninist Marxism is left with no significance or originality whatsoever.

Despite a number of difficulties and contradictions, which may be partly due to the intrinsic complexity of Kertzer's topic, the book does successfully show how the Communist Party over the last thirty-five years has become an integral element in Italian life. Structural similarities between the Church and the Party may go some way towards an explanation of

What seems a paradox to the outsider [but] is, of course ...

... a way of life to the Italian, who accommodates himself to the conflicting calls on his allegiance made by the Church and the Communist Party.

The paradox, however, remains basically unexplained, if in his last chapter Kertzer can rather lamely reflect on how 'human ability to syncretize diverse symbolic systems is legendary and
people are under no constraint to adopt only non-conflicting symbols'. Kertzer notes Nesti’s *Gesù Socialista: Una Tradizione Popolare Italiana* (1974) as evidence of Italian syncretism. But a more precise understanding of popular religion (for instance in Carlo Ginzburg’s *I Benandanti* (1966) and *Il Formaggio e i Vermi* (1976) and a more detailed knowledge of the peoples’, as well as the Party’s, political ideologies, might have helped Kertzer and his readers gain some insight into a paradox which is at least as old as organized religion, but which, through a complex set of historical circumstances, has particularly beset Italian life over the last hundred years.

LIDIA DINA SCIAMA

RODNEY NEEDHAM, *Reconnaissances*, Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1980. 105 pp., Select Bibliographies, Index. $10.00 (Cloth), $4.00 (Paper).

In the three essays of *Reconnaissances* Needham continues the argument propounded in 'Polythetic Classification' (*Man*, 1975) and *Primordial Characters* (1978). In these essays (presented originally as a series of talks at the University of Toronto), Needham augments the ethnographic evidence which allegedly shows that 'archetypes discoverable in the comparison of collective representations act as primary factors of experience'. The paper on 'Unilateral Figures' ranges worldwide to collect mythical, folkloric and literary presentations of one-sided people and proposes that laterally-divided human figures are manifestations of a universal propensity for seeing in terms of bilaterality. Half-persons derive their power and their strangeness from their violation of this archetypal principle. 'Analogical Classification' sets analogical, or lateral, classifications off against hierarchical, or vertical, forms in order to propose the existence of an alternative classificatory logic and to show that hierarchical classification tends to be applied to pragmatic relations whereas analogical finds its pertinence in the creation of symbolic orders. The final essay, 'Dual Sovereignty', proposes that the dyadic principle of the complementarity of sacred and secular is of more value to anthropological analyses than typological figures such as the divine king. The essay traces manifestation of this 'diarchic principle' through a number of historical and contemporary cultures. The principle does not only subsume instances of divine kingship within its logic but can also be used to explain both the dualism of affectual mystical power and agnic jural power in Kachin, Meru, Ryukyuan Japanese, and Purim
social theories as well as the division between spiritual and physical governance present in conceptions of social power in medieval European, Indo-European, Indian and many other cultures.

Needham essentially argues that certain archetypal relations inhere within the structure of the brain. They are manifested universally but tend to lie unperceived beneath particular historically and culturally-determined configurations of symbols and institutions. Needham's writings force one, whether or not one agrees with his hypothesis, to consider the formal similarities he discerns through a wide range of cultures and periods. Those who embrace the concept of archetypal representation will find reinforcement for their arguments in *Reconnaissances* while those who do not will find a plethora of materials which must be accommodated in alternative explanatory models. As Needham writes, 'the task of reconnaissance [is] to advance from the known to the unknown, and to probe in whatever seems the right direction, but in this terrain it is very hard to find our bearings.' Whether Needham has touched on a continent of the unconscious or has merely mistaken a multitude of islands for a new world, his reconnaissances make obvious the need for cartographers. Bearings must be found.

GLENN BOWMAN


*Lakota Belief and Ritual* is the first of four volumes which Raymond J. de Mallie and Elaine A. Jahner have put together from notes collected in 1896-1914 by James R. Walker among the Oglala Sioux on the Pine Ridge Reservation in South Dakota. Walker was a medical doctor assigned to the reservation at a time when the older men were becoming aware that many aspects of tribal tradition would not survive them. Walker's tactful willingness to work with tribal 'medicine men' to improve sanitation and combat tuberculosis led him to take an interest in how the Oglala doctors brought relief of minor complaints by use of inert medicines and ceremonial practices. In turn, several traditionalist Oglala eventually agreed to reveal secrets to Walker which normally only an initiated holy man would be permitted to know. The anthropologist Clark Wissler, who was searching for ethnographic collectors, contacted Walker and encouraged him to gather
information for the American Museum of Natural History. The museum staff edited notes and texts in Indian languages sent in by field investigators for publication. Some of Walker's own contributions eventually appeared in print, including a compilation on the Oglala sun dance composed as a manual of instruction. Many ethnographers of Plains cultures worked only in English with paid informants. Walker depended on translators, but also on recorded statements written down for him in Lakota by knowledgeable Oglala. Despite Walker's lack of fluency in Lakota, the editors say that no account in the literature on Plains Indian sun dances makes so systematic an attempt at symbolic analysis as does Walker's own.

Evans-Pritchard once remarked that anthropologists seldom give to the ethnographic monographs and other writings they deal with the same kind of critical attention that historians regularly devote to documentary source-material. Considering the impact the early monographs on Plains Indians have had internationally on anthropological theories, we must welcome signs that Americanists are now seriously investigating the circumstances under which these studies were made. The documents in *Lakota Belief and Ritual*, many translated and published for the first time, give in their own words what the Oglala leaders thought were important principles in Lakota religion, at a time, as the editors point out, not long after the Wounded Knee massacre, when the Lakota appeared to be defeated and their conversion to Christianity inevitable. Some passages are poignant; others, such as the various efforts to convey the meaning of *wakan*, are of considerable interest to students of comparative religion. The many photographs and plates, such as Thunder Bear's drawings of war insignia, enhance the appearance and value of the book. Much of the text no doubt will be of use primarily to Siouan specialists. Other readers may be expected to consult the documents selectively, while turning to one of the several general studies of Oglala life or religion for an introduction. In Part I, the editors provide a useful summary of Walker's life based on material collected by Maurice Fink. The remainder of the book consists of ninety-two documents, two appendices, notes, bibliography, index, twenty-nine black and white photographs and sixteen colour plates. The book is reasonably priced and attractively bound and printed with justified margins on good quality paper - features worth mentioning in this era of slovenly books sold at high prices.

R.H. BARNES

*Sacrifice* is the result of a conference held in 1979 involving both theologians and anthropologists. There are nine contributors, two of whom, Rogerson and Bourdillon, have an active and continuing interest in both disciplines. As Bourdillon points out in his Introduction, there is a long tradition of interest in sacrifice - by anthropologists because of the central place it has in so many cultures, and by theologians because it is a central feature of the Judaeo-Christian understanding of man's relationship with God. There is a long tradition of interaction between theologians and anthropologists from which both sides have benefited; the aim of bringing together anthropological and theological approaches is thus not without distinguished historical precedents. There are few hints in this book of the bitterness that has sometimes characterised these encounters; the presentation is positive, aimed at synthesis and co-operation between the two disciplines.

The central idea of the conference was the suggestion that sacrifice is a redundant symbol, no longer needed by modern man. In the Catholic tradition sacrifice and the Mass are often synonymous. There has, however, recently been a growing interest in the connection between the Eucharist and sacrifice as part of the ecumenical dialogue between Protestants and Catholics. The interpretation of what happens at the Mass has sharply divided Protestants from Catholics since the Reformation. For Protestants Calvary was a sufficient, unique sacrifice which made further sacrificial acts useless; for Catholics the Mass is the same sacrifice of Calvary. The theme would thus appear to be of more immediate relevance to Protestant theologians. Nevertheless this book provides both theologians and anthropologists with the opportunity of considering the relevance of their continuing interest in this particular feature of religious action. If the two sides failed to respond fully to the challenge or to establish any real exchange of perspectives, they did establish the problems still to be faced. The theologians make positive suggestions for the re-interpretation of sacrifice both within and without their area of study. The anthropologists, who sometimes appear nervous of being included 'inside' any area of moral judgement, outline progress to date. For the theologians, sacrifice appears to have a changing, dynamic quality even though its origin in the Christian tradition lies in the unique historical enactment at the Crucifixion. For the anthropologists it appears infinitely variable in form yet strangely static with few hints of the provisionality that is part of sacrifice.

Most contributors give some consideration to the differences (and implicit similarities) between anthropologists and theologians. Some rather outdated arguments about the study of religion and objectivity are resurrected in order to establish common ground between the two sides. Fortes says that theologians are
actors within their own religious system and must believe — while anthropologists must necessarily be agnostic in order to achieve objectivity (a view most anthropologists must surely reject as irrelevant to their central concerns). Bourdillon's view is that both theologians and anthropologists look at animal sacrifices in the history of religions and analyse the meaning of these rites in their various cultural contexts; for Bourdillon the difference in their approaches lies not so much in the methods of analysis as in the 'evaluation of the communication'. The social anthropologist, he says, observes sacrifice to tell him more about the nature of man in society, the theologian to gain a concept to be used meaningfully in contemporary society. Rogerson, a theologian, maintains that the anthropologist approaches descriptions of sacrifice in the Old Testament in order to elucidate structure and function: he would treat the story as a means of establishing a coherent system of symbols. The theologian, on the other hand, views sacrifice in terms of the story and the insight into eternal reality which it might contain.

There is in the volume some consensus by both groups of an outside (anthropological)/inside (theological) division. While the anthropologist is presented as an objective observer, the theologian is characterised as unavoidably involved in his observation. Thus his interpretation of sacrifice in the Old and New Testaments forms the basis of his understanding of it in the present. Sacrifice for the theologian is a flexible symbol, stretching and retracting to meet man's changing needs.

The theologians are however anxious to point out that their preoccupation with sacrifice does not give them a monopoly on its interpretation. Sykes, a theologian, says

The Christian is not, therefore, in a position to say that the sacrifice of Christ (or the Eucharistic sacrifice) expresses and fulfils the universally felt need of man to offer sacrifices to his gods. The Christian interest ought to be less in the intellectual theories of sacrifice than in the persons who sacrifice and their worlds of meaning.

On the other hand, the anthropologist is not always considered to be an adequate interpreter of other peoples' worlds of meaning. Fortes criticises Evans-Pritchard's contention that his fellow anthropologists were incapable of understanding the religions of non-Western peoples, because they were themselves irreligious or atheistic. While it is true that anthropologists should beware, as Fortes says, of approaching their studies from the standpoint of their religious values, the evidence of the volume suggests that the theologians' experience of re-interpreting a symbol of which they have a working knowledge often gives them an advantage in understanding what sacrifice means for other people. It might be added that the relationship between the study of religion and theology is essentially dialectical. As Ninian Smart has said elsewhere,
As knowledge of the explorations of religion become widely known so men's perceptions of their traditions and their reasons for their belief or disbelief are altered (The Phenomenon of Religion, 1978).

The anthropologists do not attempt to define sacrifice but rather emphasize certain aspects of it. The general view is that any general theory of sacrifice is bound to fail because what is termed 'sacrifice' covers a wide variety of practices in which it is often difficult to find a common denominator. Bourdillon's useful Introduction summarises the theories of sacrifice which have been most influential in social anthropology (those of Tylor, Frazer, Westermarck and Robertson Smith) and suggests that each theory brings out the prominent theme in a particular type of sacrifice. He includes within the scope of the topic such items as calculated sacrifices, prestigious killings and the execution of criminals. He suggests that sacrifice, because it appears to be a central religious act in most societies, might be regarded as a 'natural symbol' expressing universals - for example that 'death is irrevocable' and 'death involves the destruction of vitality'. Beattie rejects the idea that sacrifice is a natural symbol; instead he claims that 'in the consecration of an animal for sacrifice ... the animal is made into a symbol'. He suggests that sacrifice, by harnessing 'power' or 'powers', is a dramatic, symbolic expression of man's dependence on outside forces. The sacrificial ritual is a form of art, a drama - believed by the performers to work - which, like a language, requires its own specific kind of understanding. Sacrifice provides a technique for making use of a force already in existence. Another social anthropologist, Suzanne Campbell-Jones, provides a bridge between anthropology and theology with her analysis of the ways in which aspects of the Mass change in emphasis and reflect the social life of the participants - in this case working nuns, who are themselves part of a theological tradition. She shows that the nuns are part of the drama of sacrifice. The emphasis in the Mass has changed away from sacrifice (which stresses the propitiatory death of a victim) towards communion (which stresses the community meal). This movement, she says, mirrors the gradual breaking of old boundaries in the secular world, and the increasing participation of the nuns in the outside world. Audrey Hayley by way of contrast provides a competent analysis of sacrifice among devotional sects in Assam. The model of ritual interaction, in this case, is the alimentary system.

Rogerson, a theologian, who has given serious consideration to anthropological approaches to biblical material, discusses the problems involved in dealing with sacrifice in the Old Testament. These include the difficult task of handling material which has been 'worked over' for a considerable period of time, and the existence of the 'official', developed view of sacrifice alongside descriptions of 'popular practices'. He acknowledges that the attempted structuralist interpretations of biblical material by anthropologists such as Douglas and Leach can help to shed some
new light on the meaning of sacrifice, but nevertheless finds points of divergence with Leach's analysis of sacrifice. Sykes, another theologian, comes closest to the topic of central concern - the relevance of sacrifice to modern man - in his rather polemical contribution 'Sacrifice in the New Testament and Christian Theology'. He contrasts the 'familiar Wittgensteinian' approach, which acknowledges that acts of sacrifice have sufficient points of similarity to be called 'sacrifice' but which also finds them too plural and diverse to have any one thing in common, with the Christian temptation to identify the 'essence of sacrifice' and then to interpret the 'preferred example as the complete expression of that essence'. Every sacrifice, he says, must be judged in the context of the total meaning of the particular event; thus the Christian experience of sacrifice is unique. His main argument is that the use of sacrificial language in the Christian context is not metaphorical but real. Both the original act and its repetition at the Mass are real sacrifices. The sacrifice of Christ has a 'bi-focal' character. 'First it has to be seen as the act of God in the desperate context of human sin, of which God is the wrathful judge. Secondly it has to be looked at as the climactic act of a life of self-giving.' This bi-focal character of 'power' and 'humility' gives Christianity the ability to adapt to vastly different circumstances. Sykes' thesis is powerfully argued but his paper provides a good example of Fortes' observation that although anthropologists and theologians use the same vocabulary - symbol, myth, ritual, meaning - they by no means concur in its usage.

A final note of synthesis is provided by Barrington-Ward and Bourdillon. Their conclusion is that people use sacrificial symbolism to express ways in which they understand the world. To the Christian the sacrifice of Christ is a key to his understanding of life, and thus of all sacrifices; it provides him with an 'inclusive symbol', 'transcending other more restricted forms of sacrifice'. With regard to the problem of whether Christian sacrifice is real or metaphorical they say that it should be examined against the historical moment at which Christianity emerged, a period when the Hellenistic and Roman world was involved in a process of 'spiritualisation'. An attempt to draw the two disciplines together is expressed in the final paragraph.

When a Nuer man [to quote a case described by Evans-Pritchard], on seeing his byre struck by lightning and catch fire, first speared an ox in sacrifice to God before rescuing his family and cattle ... he was in effect saying that there was something more important to him than all he stood to lose. When a Christian puts aside half an hour of a busy day for the sacrifice of the Mass, he is asserting to himself as well as to others, that the story of the life, death and resurrection of Christ points to something
more profound in his own life than all the flux of opinions, aspirations and regrets, the enjoyment and the tedium that makes up so much of it.

I found this ending rather unsatisfactory. For the evidence offered in this book by no means establishes a convincing connection between the Christian experience of sacrifice and that of other peoples. Indeed, though providing a useful introduction to the subject - particularly for those not familiar with its now vast literature - the reader is not really left with a cohesive picture. But perhaps, after all, this is no weakness: it is well to be reminded that the divergent approaches of the two disciplines can still bring fresh insights to each other.

PAT HOLDEN

JEREMY MacCLANCY, To Kill a Bird with Two Stones: A Short History of Vanuatu, Port Vila: Vanuatu Cultural Centre [Publications No. 1], 1980.

Imagine a group of eighty isolated islands, each with its own cultural peculiarities, in the midst of a struggle for unity and independence, a land formerly governed as a condominium by the British and French, a place where anthropologists - unwilling to pay for information, unwilling to buy their prestige the way the natives themselves did - were thought to be thieves of kastom. If there were ever a test for the Oxford tradition that fieldwork techniques are best learned in the field - that adaptability and open-mindedness are an anthropologist's first priorities - then author Jeremy MacClancy must surely be one of Oxford's model ethnographers. Since 1978, when he first arrived in Vanuatu (then the New Hebrides), to the present day, MacClancy has endeavoured to come to terms with the lives and traditions of the ni-Vanuatu. In the process he has spent time with several groups and has had the unique experience of seeing kastom (the so-called native way) used as a weapon among local political factions, as a regional defence against national interests, and as a unifying theme of the new nation itself. In the process MacClancy often found himself in the midst of disputes as local 'big men' made their bids for more power in the unstable political atmosphere. However, as a result of his varied and often trying experiences, MacClancy was in a unique position to undertake perhaps the most difficult fieldwork task of all: attempting to write a book that would tell the history of Vanuatu to ni-Vanuatu in a way that would be interesting and informative, yet acceptable to the many factions which peopled the sensitive climate.
If the job of an anthropologist is to render into print an image of the world that is faithful to the native viewpoint, then being their historian is surely the ultimate test of whether one has got things right. *To Kill a Bird with Two Stones* is a model of what a short history should be. It is clear, concise, and entertaining; as a document, moreover, written primarily for the people studied, it holds a special place among books on Melanesian society. Tracing the development of Vanuatu from prehistory to the present day, the author shows an easy familiarity which should have a particular appeal to those who seek the sort of general understanding that, until now, has remained the sole province of a few experts. Unlike most specialists, however, MacClancy avoids the lengthy theoretical digressions which often make ethnographies inaccessible to all but the experts. Most importantly, *To Kill a Bird with Two Stones* confronts the urgent problems now faced by Vanuatu: how to accommodate sensibly the peculiar needs and attitudes toward kastom in a country characterised by small isolated communities; how to come to terms with a past that continually portrays the natives as falling prey to the schemes of both foreigners and one another; how to suggest that this tiny nation, whose population is that of an average English market town, can be transformed nearly overnight from a remote, if not a wholly primitive, place to a nation aware enough of itself and the rest of the world to protect its own better interests; how to present a unified national image when the gap between the lifestyles of resident Europeans and those of ni-Vanuatu was so vast that only in 1972 did the first aboriginal receive a college degree.

That the book was published at all in what must be a most sensitive historical moment is a tribute to the Cultural Centre, to the ni-Vanuatu, and most of all, to the perspicacity of the author himself. As something of a parting gift from the British Government (which helped fund the endeavour), *To Kill a Bird with Two Stones* will surely take an important, constructive place in the futures of the ni-Vanuatu. What better satisfaction might be derived from the anthropological discipline?

DAVID NAPIER

You didn't bring us the spirit. We already knew the spirit existed ... What you've brought us is the body.

Old Boesoou

Do Kamo is an exegesis of the Melanesian ambience, sensitively drawn, by an extremely gifted man. Leenhardt's express purpose in writing the book was to convey the manner in which myth is 'lived' by the Canaque of New Caledonia and the Loyalty Islands.

He regards myth as an 'affective' as opposed to 'rational' mode of knowledge and perception, and as the ground of man's social being in the primitive world. It is not, however, that there is a logical chasm between ourselves and the primitive; the term 'prelogical' is misleading. It is rather that the affects constitute the 'dominant structural element' in the consciousness of the primitive, and so the difference is but one of degree. Though ascribing such universality to emotivity in the universe of the primitive does not, in the final analysis, explain anything, it does raise the significant question of why Leenhardt (like Durkheim and Mauss before him) considered the affects to be some kind of ultimate explanatory given. Both the expression of emotion in social life and this predilection of the French School have yet to be satisfactorily accounted for.

The book contains much by way of ethnographic detail and theoretical insight which is of critical interest to the student of Austronesian languages and social formations. Thus Leenhardt devotes two chapters to the indigenous concept of the 'word', no, conceived as 'the manifestation of what is human in all its aspects'. No is the substance or intention embodied in a medium of communication such as that of speech, but also that of women who express enduring alliances between clans. He represents a system of symmetric alliance as a double helix, thereby reproducing on the social plane one of the most elementary structures to exist in the physical universe. The correspondence may not be fortuitous. Chapter Four is a remarkable exercise in conjectural history. Melanesian civilisation is divided into three strata which accord with the three migrations. In these strata it is possible to discern three primary forms of human experience, developmentally linked.

Leenhardt's evolutionary theory of the self comprises the major portion of the book. He views this process as one which involves the person disengaging himself from a 'mythic envelope' as a result of the transformation in perception which attends his Christianization and concomitant emergence into three-dimensional space. As a consequence of Christian teaching, Leenhardt argues, the Melanesian learns of Christ's Jerusalem.
which he is able to locate geographically, temporally and emotionally as being a point beyond his immediate surroundings. 'Both territories henceforth play a role for him. His lived behaviour proceeds from these two points in space.'

Prior to this, 'space appears as a heterogeneous ensemble of places whose existence is felt by bodily presence; when the sensuous reaction to the resistance of the physical milieu is absent, space does not exist'. Similarly, the person appears as a heterogeneous ensemble of relationships. It is these which are named, not the person as such. Thus, the dual substantive duanara, meaning 'the pair nephew' refers to the 'symmetrical ensemble' of a maternal uncle and his nephew. The pair, 'which our eyes obstinately see as two', is apprehended as a single entity, a 'duality-unity'. It is this diffusion or 'participation' of the person in those around him (which is possible given that 'mythic thought' unfolds in only two dimensions, on a single plane) which constitutes the 'mythic envelope'.

Old Boesoou's remark, quoted above, reverberates throughout the primitive universe, perhaps with the same ring as the Gates of Eden clanging shut in our own tradition. With the discovery of the body in the round as it were, 'the circumscription of the physical being is completed, making possible its objectification'. The native can begin to set up distances between himself and other persons and objects in the world about him. He emerges into history, albeit laden with a Cartesian metaphysics.

Do Kamo cannot be read without a certain dislocation of our customary mental processes. One of the perplexities to arise has been remarked upon by Crapanzano in his preface. It is that what appear to be metaphors or conventions which the Canaque use to describe experience are often taken by Leenhardt as indications of experience. For example, the Canaque depicts the trunk of his body as a long rectangle with two narrow bands on either side to 'indicate the invisible sides of the trunk, the flanks'. He has thus 'unrolled' his body on a two-dimensional plane. It is held, on these grounds, that the Canaque only perceives and has knowledge of his body in two dimensions, and is therefore unable to experience his corporeality or that of other things in the round. Crapanzano holds that such inferences are unwarranted, because 'language and other modes of expression do not reveal what is experience but [only] what is said or can be said about experience'. This could be accepted without hesitation were it not for the nagging sense that it is precisely the boundaries of experience which are at issue in Do Kamo. Perhaps it is our theory of metaphor which is deficient.

Basia Miller Gulati's translation from the French is to be commended, for it is faithful to the often poetic turn of phrase in the original. More than an ethnography, Do Kamo is a treatise on humanity; an exploration of 'the possibilities of awareness' inherent in the human condition as these have been framed within an alien tradition.

DAVID HOWES

This is the first publication of two collections of traditional narratives and formulae of the Karok Indians of northwestern California - one compiled by Kroeber during the first decade of this century, and the other by Gifford some thirty years later. Like Kroeber's Yurok Myths (University of California Press 1976), to which this is a companion volume, the book thus fills an important gap in both Californian and North Pacific Coast mythography. The narratives themselves are preceded by a Foreword written by Kroeber's widow, who provides an interesting review of the work of the two anthropologists in this part of native North America and a useful background sketch of Karok culture and society. This is then followed by Alan Dundes's 'Folkloristic Commentary', in which he indicates the comparative context in which the myths are to be viewed; and by a Preface by the editor, Grace Buzaljko, who briefly considers stylistic and thematic differences between the mythology of the Karok and that of the somewhat better-known Yurok. Buzaljko also provides a useful 'Index of Parallel Plot Elements' as between the myths contained in this book, Kroeber's Yurok Myths, and shorter compilations of Karok texts by Harrington in 1930 and 1932 and by Bright in 1957.

As the Yurok and Karok, while speaking very different languages, are (or rather, were) culturally almost identical, one of the most interesting contrasts between their respective oral traditions concerns the apparently greater role played by women in Karok myths, regarding which Buzaljko cites a possible parallel in the ritual life of the two societies. Yet, as she also notes, this apparent feminine bias may simply be due to the fact that most of the later recorded narratives were taken from female informants; and since both Yurok and Karok culture are to all intents and purposes extinct, it is probably now too late to probe this issue further.

As for the main body of the volume, this consists almost entirely of unelaborated English translations of indigenous myths, the task of analysis being left to the reader himself. Thus, although the narratives evidence certain themes - such as that of the Bird-Nester - which have a wide distribution in the New World, Karok Myths is unlikely to be of much relevance other than to Americanists and folklorists. Nevertheless, whatever one's particular ethnographic interests, it should be an occasion for gratitude that such a substantial collection of oral literature from an aboriginal North American society has been preserved and has at last appeared in print.

GREGORY L. FORTH
OTHER NOTES AND NOTICES

A NOTE ON LORRY NAMES IN GHANA

Nearly all commercial vehicles in Ghana carry an inscription of some kind. This may be a sentence, clause, phrase, or sometimes a single word printed boldly on the sides, the front or the back of the vehicles. These labels are mostly in one of the dialects of Akan, i.e. Ashanti, Fante or Akwapem (each of which has a distinct orthography), English, Ewe and Hausa as well as an occasional inscription in Dagbane. There are also a few labels that mix English and Akan.

1. Nkrabea (Destiny) Akan.
2. Future.
3. Akwei Allah (There is God) Hausa.
4. Nyameadom (By the Grace of God) Akan.
5. Onyame muri (God is not dead) Akan.
6. Onyame nnaee (God is not asleep) Akan.
7. Aboa a onne dua, nyame na oprane ho (The animal without a tail is looked after by God) Akan.
8. Allah bamu lafla (Give us peace, O God) Hausa.
9. Blood is thicker than water.
10. Mogya bi ye dan (Blood is not thicker than water) Hausa.
12. Poor no friend.
13. Onipa ye 'bad' (Mankind is treacherous) Akan-English.
14. Fear Woman.
15. Suro nipa (Fear mankind) Akan.
16. Dugria se Sanu (Beware the world) Hausa.
17. Boato ye na (A friend in need is a friend indeed) Akan.
19. Sika mpe 'rough' (Wealth does not endure rough treatment) Akan-English.
20. Yebisa ne fie na enye ne sika (Seek his home not his money) Akan.
21. I shall return.
The commercial vehicles in question are privately owned and are licensed to carry passengers and cargo. The owner of the vehicle may not be the driver of it, although some drivers of commercial vehicles save up enough money to buy their own vehicle, which is thus driven by themselves or else by an employee. Prosperity will determine whether a person continues in the profession or retires.

The vehicles fall into two categories: those that operate within the big towns and cities such as in Accra-Tema, Kumasi, Sekondi-Takoradi, Cape Coast etc. These are called trotro i.e. 'penny transport'. What are called 'mammy trucks' usually undertake longer journeys between towns or between towns and the rural areas.

The transport business used to be characterised by intense competition and it is possible that the label on a vehicle served to attract passengers. The labels, if they were popular, soon became the name of both the vehicle and its driver, thereby giving some personality to the enterprise.

Some of the inscriptions on vehicles may appear frivolous and meaningless to one not acquainted with the context or situational background; this is particularly so when they are translated from the source-language into English. However, to the proprietors, their drivers and 'driver mates', kin, friends or neighbours few labels are so regarded. Names in Ghanaian societies, apart from 'day names' and a few other categories of names, are proverbs. This is true for most inscriptions on lorries too. Some of the inscriptions are taken from the traditional genre or are wise sayings in English. Most of the utterances allude to personal tragedy, or unfair treatment meted out to the proprietor by kinsmen, affines, friends - or society at large. There are, however, also those inscriptions which are in fact slogans or catch-phrases circulating in the country and disseminated by films, radio, pop songs etc. There are of course more categories than have been mentioned here.

A.K. AWEDOBA
KINGDOM OF GOLD: AN ASANTE EXHIBITION

The Asante Exhibition *The Kingdom of Gold* was opened at the Museum of Mankind in London on 18 February 1981 by the Asantehene, Otumfoor Nana Opuku Ware II, the present occupant of the Golden Stool. The opening was an exciting and memorable occasion. For those Asante present, it must have been reminiscent of the *durbar* (for which the Asante have been famous since Bowdich in 1817) and of the great and important days in the Asante Calendar such as the *Adae Kesee*. The Asantehene and his entourage resplendent in the *Kente*, the traditional dress of the Asante (a kind of Roman toga, ornate with ornamental gold), moved through a room, reconstructed to resemble his palace at Kumase, but here crowded with anthropologists, reporters, T.V. cameras *et cetera*. The pouring of the libation, the invocation to the ancestors and ancestral gods asking them to bless and bring success to the occasion, the talking drums and the hot, glaring T.V. lamps together produced an illusion of tropicality. The Duke of Gloucester and the Under-Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs were present to observe the necessary protocol. In the opening speeches hopes were expressed for the furtherance of good relations between the two countries. The slightly embarrassed references to the past were glossed over with humour. It all faintly recalled those handing-over ceremonies in newly-independent Africa. All this in the Museum of Mankind!

The aim of the Exhibition is to present Asante at the height of its power in the 19th century. The collection consists mainly of material brought from Asante in the 19th century by British travellers, explorers and soldiers involved in the Asante wars which led to the subjugation and colonisation of the Kingdom by the British. Most of the gold came from the 1874 British expedition to Kumase under Sir Garnet Wolseley which ended in the sacking, looting and burning of the Asante capital and of the palace of the Asantehene. The 'Sagrenti' War (the Asante still remember the conflict) is a dark episode in Asante history, and an even darker one in British colonial history.

Gold is the main theme of the exhibition and there is plenty of it to be seen. The richness of the kingdom is expressed in gold weights (always a delight because of their intricate designs and the stories and proverbs they depict), the gold replica of the *fotoo* (the Asante Exchequer chest), the gold chest *akyeampoma* and the staff which confers authority to the linguist, the chief spokesman of the king or any Asante chief. Gold-dust was the principal currency of the kingdom, and the Asantehene had much of it at his disposal to enable him to conduct the economic, social and foreign affairs of the state. Until very recently a newly installed and consecrated Asantehene could not become de facto leader until the *fotoo* (the chest which at one time was reputed to contain gold worth £1,500,000) was placed at his disposal. Contending factions for the Golden Stool always made sure the *fotoo* was in their keep before they made a strong bid for their protégé, and, like the Golden Stool itself, it was tampered with on pain of
Other Notes and Notices

death. Gold also produced the extensive trade links which re­sulted in the European and Islamic influence evident in many of the objects on display.

Warfare is also a prominent theme in the exhibition. In its heyday the kingdom extended over the whole of the middle of pre­sent-day Ghana to Bondoukou in the Ivory Coast and down to the coastal areas of Ghana. The Asante war-song is Asante Kotoko; wokum apem a apem beba ('The Asante porcupine, when you kill a thousand a thousand will come') and among the exhibits a gold cast porcupine serves as a reminder of the invincibility of the kingdom: like the porcupine, the Asante could never be provoked with impunity. Other items of war (from the British booty of 1874) include firearms, ornate swords, hats, tunics and talismans. One interesting exhibit is the tunic of the Asantehene which he wore in battle. Its gold-covered pockets were believed to have the magical power to render the wearer bullet-proof.

The exhibition is well worth a visit. The exhibits include reconstructions of a house, a courtroom and funerary groves. The exhibition is enhanced by uncluttered walls and interesting old photographs and clear texts accompany the exhibits.

Malcolm McCleod's The Asante (British Museum Publications 1981), a book intended to accompany the exhibition is extremely well-written and beautifully illustrated. It is written for the general reader but its fine presentation of Asante history, values and social life, perceived through its material culture make it a necessary and valuable souvenir for all those concerned with Africa past and present.

CHARLOTTE BOAITEY KWARTENG
PAT HOLDEN


Another of the expected doppelgangers of the Don Juan tetralogy, but lacking the excitement of the Castanedan authorial savoir faire, Jane Beck, an American folklorist, met Alexander Charles, a West Indian smuggler and medicine man, in the early 70s, and her book presents his autobiography and philosophy in a series of conversational chapters. Beck is so pleased with her success at getting the Santo Domingan to 'open up' that she almost totally neglects the necessity of doing anything more than transcribing his rambling discourses. There may be some practices and beliefs related in the conversations of interest to a student of this
particular region, but there is nothing anthropological, neither insights nor methodological innovations, which could serve the interests of the generalized student of culture. The few attempts at analysis are commonsensical and cliché, and the study has an unfortunate tendency to present platitudes such as 'an indication of the quixotic and volatile West Indian nature'. Not to be recommended; if you hunger for this sort of thing - a fascination with the mystical framed by an anthropological discourse - read the originals. They are no more useful than Windward of the Land as anthropology, but they provide a much more interesting read.

G.B.

KASTHURI SREENIVASAN, Climbing the Coconut Tree: A Partial Autobiography, Delhi etc.: Oxford University Press 1980. xiii, 157 pp., Glossary, Index, Photographs. Rs 60.00.

In Climbing the Coconut Tree the author, an Anglicized Indian, tells us his life-story - a story which at times bears an uncanny resemblance to that of Horatio Alger: bare-foot boy from Tamil Nadu makes good, following a path from village school, to school in the regional city (Coimbatore), to college in Madras and finally to university in Manchester - ultimately to become respected both as Chairman of the Indian National Textile Corporation and as an author (not only of this autobiography but also of 4 novels, a translation of the Tamil classic Tirukkural and numerous short stories and poems which have appeared both in India and in Britain).

The bulk of the book focusses on the author's early years in his natal village of Karadibavi and in Coimbatore. The last 40-plus years of the author's life - from the time of his entering the Presidency College in Madras, to his encounters as a student in Manchester, the war years, his marriage to an Englishwoman and return to India, to his becoming a captain of industry - are compressed into the last 40 pages of text.

In the telling of his autobiography, Sreenivasan displays both perception and wit. The story is by no means complete however - at times it resembles nothing so much as a series of unrelated anecdotes. Some of Sreenivasan's observations are nevertheless priceless - as exemplified by his recollection of a caste panchayat (council) held in Karadibavi when he was a boy. Sreenivasan's family hosted a caste conference that drew representatives of the Kamma caste from a wide area. For several days the Kamma delegates camped on the author's grandfather's land and discussed important issues. We learn little of the actual content of this
conference, or of intra-caste dynamics involved. The conference seems to have had little effect on the Kamma community. But we are told that at least one person was delighted with the outcome. Sreenivasan tells us of his grandfather's comment at the conclusion of the conference: 'Our small farm ought to yield a good crop next year. A thousand people have used it for their morning ablutions for three days.'

*Climbing the Coconut Tree,* while not an anthropology text in any proper sense, will nevertheless be of some interest to the student of India. This first-person recollection of growing up in rural India provides a unique insider's view of Indian society, one which complements existing ethnographic literature. Although it lacks the detail of other first-hand accounts of village life in India (e.g. Mohanti's *My Village, My Life*), *Climbing the Coconut Tree* really cannot be faulted for that. Although, like Allen's *Plain Tales From The Raj* there is no attempt at profundity, *Climbing the Coconut Tree* is a gentle, human, humane book, one which makes a good read. What it lacks in ethnographic detail it makes up in anecdote and wry humour.

S.S.
Publication Received

Abstracts in German Anthropology, No. 1, 1980 [Göttingen].


BINNEY, Judith, Gillian CHAPLIN and Craig WALLACE, Mihaiia: The Prophet Rua Kenana and His Community at Maungapohatu, Wellington: Oxford University Press 1979. 208 pp., Illustrations. £9.50.

BUTTERWORTH, Douglas and John K. CHANCE, Latin American Urbanization, Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press 1981. 215 pp., Index. £15.00.


International Family Planning Perspectives Vol. VI, No. 4, 1980.


NEEDHAM, Rodney, Reconnaissances, Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1980. 105 pp., Select Bibliographies, Index. $10.00, $4.00 (Paper).


SREENIVASAN, Kasthuri, Climbing the Coconut Tree: A Partial Autobiography, Delhi etc.: Oxford University Press 1980. 157 pp., Glossary, Index. £5.50.


---

**N.E.A.**

The first issue of N.E.A.-Journal of Research on North East Africa will be published in the Summer 1981.

The Journal aims to become a forum for the exchange of notes and research on the history, culture, social institutions and other issues pertinent to the peoples and lands of the region, viz. the areas within the present boundaries of Sudan, Ethiopia, Djibouti and Somalia. The editors would, therefore, welcome contributions from researchers in and outside North East Africa.

Articles in the first issue include:

'Ethnic Terms and Ambiguities on the Sudan-Ethiopian Border' by W. James,

'Hamasen and the Gondarine Monarchy: A Reappraisal of Oral Tradition' by R. Pankhurst,

"Man's World", "Woman's Position": The Case of the Darasa Widow' by T.B. Selassie

'The Survival of National Culture in Somalia...' by G. Andrzejewski, and-

'The Shilluk-Funj Connection in Sudanese Historiography' by W. Kunijuwok.

All correspondence regarding contributions and subscriptions to the Editors, N.E.A., c/o T.B. Selassie, 51 Banbury Rd., Oxford

---

*Journal of Research on North East Africa*

The Editors

51 Banbury Road

Oxford